The Kyries of J. S. Bach's B-minor Mass and Gottlob Harrer's D-major Mass (Harwv 32): Between Late Baroque and the "Style Galant"

Author(s): Jordi Rifé i Santaló


Published by: Riemenschneider Bach Institute

Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/43489899

Accessed: 05-03-2018 15:56 UTC
THE KYRIES
OF J. S. BACH’S B-MINOR MASS AND
GOTTLOB HARRER’S D-MAJOR MASS
(HARWV 32): BETWEEN LATE BAROQUE
AND THE STYLE GALANT

Jordi Rifé i Santaló

Johann Sebastian Bach’s Mass in B minor (BWV 232) represents one of the zeniths in the history of music as well as perhaps in the composer’s own work. Its conception is dated 1733, the year in which he composed the Kyrie and the Gloria for the Court of Dresden, under the rule of Frederick Augustus II, Elector of Saxony (and King of Poland as August III). While the Sanctus had already been composed in 1724, the rest of the Mass—Credo, Sanctus, Benedictus, and Agnus Dei—was completed between 1748 and 1749.

---

1Christoph Wolff, Johann Sebastian Bach: El Músico sabio, vol. 2 (Barcelona: Robinbook, 2003), 146. See also Christoph Wolff, Johann Sebastian Bach. Messe in h-Moll (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 2009), 10–15. I would also like to thank Prof. Dr. Christoph Wolff for the kindness, generosity, and advice he has given me in my research, and thank as well the whole group of researchers and librarians of the Bach Archive in Leipzig.


Gottlob Harrer’s Mass in D major (HarWV 32) was composed in December 1735 and was also created for the court in Dresden. Harrer wrote several works, but so far only two of his masses are known to have survived: the Mass in D major and the Mass in F major (HarWV 33). The two masses contrast in style and construction: the instrumental and vocal resources of the Mass in D major are clearly used in the style of a concert mass, whereas instruments play a lesser role in the Mass in F major, being absent in the Credo and Agnus Dei and appearing colla parte in the Kyrie, Gloria, and Sanctus. These aspects make the Mass in F closer in musical style to the masses of the early Baroque. Its Kyrie has therefore been discarded for the purposes of the present study.

The reason for comparing the two Kyries (that of Bach’s Mass in B minor and Harrer’s Mass in D major) is based on seven common characteristics: 1) both works were intended for performance at a Catholic religious service, 2) both were written for the court in Dresden, 3) both were conceived as a Missa solemnis, 4) the gap between the composition of the two Kyries is two years—1733 and 1735—close enough in time to make their distinctive features noteworthy; 5) Harrer was Bach’s successor as Cantor at the Leipzig Thomaskirche (which in itself brings added interest that helps discern analogies and differences between the two works and, in the process, corroborates the aesthetic and stylistic changes already indicated by other scholars), 6) they are similar in their timbral and textural treatment, and 7) samples from the two Masses indicate that the Kyries present the generative material from which the other parts of the Masses are later developed (in a more or less recurrent manner).

4 All references to Harrer’s music should be cross-referenced with Ulrike Kollmar, Gottlob Harrer (1703–1755), Kapellmeister des Grafen Heinrich von Brühl am sächsisch-polnischen Hof und Thomaskantor in Leipzig (Beeskow and Berlin: Ortus Musikverlag, 2006).
The objective of this research is therefore to compare the two compositions, with a focus on the Kyries. This is intended to clarify both the style and the subsequent aesthetics and so to validate the hypothesis that there is a change of style from Bach's to Harrer's music, which fluctuates between late Baroque and Style Galant.

My basic sources for the comparison of the Kyries have been the editions of Johann Sebastian Bach’s Mass in B minor—NBA (BWV 232)—and the Lateinische Kirchenmusik, Denkmäler Mitteldeutscher Barockmusik.7

Finally, the methodology used seeks to encompass the parameters of any musical analysis with regard to its timbral or formal aspects, as well as those concerning the relationship between music and text. I believe that these parameters can give us indicators suitable for developing these objectives and this hypothesis.

Comparative Analysis of the Kyries

Table 1 below offers a detailed comparison between the Kyries of Bach’s Mass in B minor and Harrer’s Mass in D major, using various parameters that reveal the analogies and differences between the two composers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>SECTION</th>
<th>COMPOSER</th>
<th>TEMPO</th>
<th>METER</th>
<th>MEASURE</th>
<th>KEY</th>
<th>INSTRUMENTATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Kyrie I</td>
<td>Bach</td>
<td>Adagio</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1–4</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td>Tromba I/II, Timp, Ob I/II, VI I/II, Vla, SATB, Bc (Organ)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Largo</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>5–126</td>
<td>B minor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harrer</td>
<td>Andante</td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1–10</td>
<td>D major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christe</td>
<td>Bach</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1–85</td>
<td>D major</td>
<td>VII/II (unison), S I/II and Bc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harrer</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1–149</td>
<td>A major</td>
<td>VI I/II, Vla, A and Bc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kyrie II</td>
<td>Bach</td>
<td>Alla breve</td>
<td>φ</td>
<td>1–59</td>
<td>F♯ minor</td>
<td>SI/II (unison) ATB, Orchestra (without trombe, <em>coda parte</em>)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Harrer</td>
<td></td>
<td>C</td>
<td>1–60</td>
<td>D major</td>
<td>Tromba I/II, Timp, Ob I/II, VI I/II, Vla, SATB, Bc (Organ)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><em>coda parte</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Harrer’s Kyrie I is constructed with very few measures—in all, only ten. The orchestral palette appears in all its fullness. Homophonic textures predominate in the vocal writing (Example 1), which, along with the reinforcing orchestral tutti and the dotted rhythms of the violins and the basso continuo, gives it a majestic and emphatic character. This is also underlined by the declamation of the voices, which emphasize the word “Kyrie” with a prosodic rhythmic articulation (dotted quarter / eighth / quarter—a dactylic rhythm) that reinforces the proparoxytone treatment of the word. In measure five, the soprano and the alto—in measure two sung also by the tenor but not completed—render the reduced figuration of the initial theme of the Kyrie, that is, dotted eighth-sixteenth-eighth, the pattern that serves as the central thematic motif of both Harrer’s Kyrie II and the Largo of Bach’s Kyrie I. The harmonic nucleus of Harrer’s Kyrie I is sustained by the oboes, trombe, and viola, prefiguring what was later to become a common technique of the Pre-Classical Mannheim school.

The first four measures of the Adagio of Bach’s Kyrie I (Example 2) are also characterized by the solemnity required by the text, an imprecation to the Lord. The use of instruments, articulation of the text, and texture are similar to those in the Harrer: the differences lie in the key used, the instrumentation, the rhetorical treatment, and the fugal elaboration in the second part (Largo) of Bach’s Kyrie I.

Indeed, in the Harrer, the tonality is D major, with a conclusive cadence in the dominant, A major, whereas Bach changes from B minor to a half cadence on the fifth degree, F-sharp minor, which resolves into B minor in measure 5 of the following Largo. Likewise, the key used differentiates Bach’s ethos from Harrer’s. The former conveys the plea to God by means of a minor key which implies a plaintive semantic, whereas Harrer uses a major key, D major, possibly more in accordance with the new aesthetic values of the time or with the regal solemnity suitable for a divine king.

In fact, the link between royalty and God had ancient origins. The symbiosis of the God-king pairing was expressed in the doctrine...
Example 1. G. Harrer: Kyrie I, Andante
Example 2. J. S. Bach: Kyrie I, Adagio
known as the divine right of kings: monarchs desired to be seen as
God’s representative on earth and thereby to perpetuate their
dynasties forever. We need only recall the Te Deum (1719) celebrated
in Dresden for the wedding of Frederick Augustus II (the future
Augustus III of Poland) to Maria Josepha of Habsburg, in the royal
church (Hofkirche im Theater, converted into a church). Although
Harrer’s Mass in D is dated 1735, the desire to cater to the king’s
absolutist position may have been one of the reasons for choosing the
major key.

In his 1713 treatise Das Neu = Eröffnete Orchestre, Johann
Mattheson already referred to the ethos of the various keys. Thus, in
the title of the corresponding chapter he explained the relationship
between key and emotion: “Von der Musicalischen Thone / Eigen-
schaft und Würckung in / Ausdrückung der Affecten.” As can be
seen there, the use of a particular tonality implied a specific affect, in
the case of Bach, an atmosphere of meditation, with Harrer, a more
festive and operatic mood. Here we only quote the references to the
four tonalities appearing in the Kyries of the masses under study (the
boldface text is Mattheson’s):

§. 22. / H.moll. (15.) ist bizarre, unlustig und melancholisch;

deswegen er auch selten zum Vorschein kommet / und mag

solches vielleicht die Ursache seyn / warum ihn die Alten aus ihren

---

Wolfgang Horn, Die Dresdner Hojkirchenmusik 1720–1745: Studien ņt Voraussetzungen
und ihrem Repertoire (Stuttgart: Carus, 1987), 9. Here we should recall that the model
of absolute monarchy assumed that the royal religion was the religion of the nation
“un roi, une loi, une foi,” an idea close to Bossuet’s concept of Gallicanism, that is,
“Cuius regio, eius Religio.” In fact, Boussuet himself was a political leader in charge
of political-religious affairs in the absolutist France of Louis XIV. See “Bossuet” in
Die Religion in Geschichte und Gegenwart, vol. 1 (Tübingen: Verlag von J. C. B. Mohr,
1927), cols. 1206–1207.

Johann Mattheson, Das Neu = Eröffnete Orchestre (1713), facsimile edition (Hildes-
heim: Georg Olms Verlag, 1993). In chapter two of the third part of his treatise,
Johann Mattheson gives various explanations of the character of each key (pp.
231–53). For further commentary on the keys in various Bach works, see also Rudolf
the character of the keys and the assimilation of modality to tonality and the various
period notations, see Rita Steblin, A History of Key Characteristics in the Eighteenth
and Early Nineteenth Centuries, 2nd edition, (Rochester: University of Rochester Press,
2002).
Clöstern und Zellen so gar verbannet haben / dab sie sich auch seiner nicht einmahl erinnern mögen.

§. 23. / Fis. moll (16.) ob er gleich zu einer grossen Betrübniß leitet / ist dieselbe doch mehr languissant und verliebt als lethal; es hat sonst dieser Thohn etwas abandonirtes / singulieres und misanthropisches an sich . . .

§. 20. / A dur, (No. 13.) greifft sehr an / ob er gleich brilliert / und ist mehr zu klagenden und traurigen Passionen als zu divertissem genet; insonderheit schickt er sich sehr gut zu Violin-Sachen . . .

§. 14. / Der siebende Thon / D. Dur. ist von Nature etwas scharff und eigensinnig; zum Lernen, lustigen, kriegerischen, und aufmunternden Sachen wol am allerbequemsten; doch wird zugleich niemand in Abrede seyn / daß nicht auch dieser harte Thohn / wenn zumbuhl an statt der Clarine eine Flöte / und anstatt der Paucke eine Violine dominiret / gar artige und frembde Anleitung zu delicaten Sachen geben könne . . .

§. 22. B minor is strange, dull, and melancholic; this is why it also rarely appears and may perhaps be the reason why the ancients even ousted it from their monasteries and cells so that they cannot even remember one occurrence.

§. 23. F-sharp minor, although it leads directly to great sadness, is nevertheless itself more languid and amorous than lethal; moreover, this tonality possesses something of the abandoned, unique, and misanthropic.

§. 20. A major is very moving, although also brilliant / and is more inclined to lamenting and sad passions than to diversion; it is especially suitable for themes for the violin . . .

§. 14. The seventh tonality, D major, is rather sharp and headstrong by nature; indeed most suitable for noisy, jovial, warlike, and animating matters; yet no one will deny that this hard tonality can also provide agreeable and unaccustomed introduction to delicate matters, above all, if instead of the bugle a flute predominates, and instead of the kettledrum, a violin . . .]
With regard to instrumentation, unlike Harrer, Bach uses woodwind timbres that reinforce the deeper registers (bassoon) and are singular (oboe d'amore)\textsuperscript{10} or ethereal (transverse flute), creating a wide range of colors in both the Adagio and the Largo of his Kyrie I. Along with the B-minor key, these timbres underscore the plaintive semantic of the text. The Andante of Harrer's Kyrie, on the other hand, evokes the magnificence of God, as mentioned above. In this respect, two trumpets and timpani are employed to give extra emphasis to the words "Kyrie eleison" on initial and final beats of the measure (measures 1-2 and measures 7-8, respectively). Furthermore, Bach employs many more continuo figures than Harrer does, indicating the more complex harmonic structure of Bach's setting.

The 122-measure fugue that follows in Bach's Kyrie I displays the composer's brilliant mastery of the technique (Example 3). This is a solemn \textit{fuga gravis}\textsuperscript{11}—highly symmetrical in its architecture and tinged

\textsuperscript{10}Philip Bate, \textit{The Oboe: An Outline of its History, Development and Construction} (London: Ernest Benn Limited, 1962), 88–89. The oboe d'amore is an oboe pitched in A. The bell-shaped opening of the Baroque oboe in C (soprano) gives it a very different timbre from that of the oboe d'amore, whose opening is pear-shaped. Along with other characteristics of the instrument, this bell-shaped opening ensures more brilliant harmonics than those of the oboe d'amore. Conversely, however, the latter's markedly pear-shaped bell confers on it a peculiar timbre that is very suitable for playing in minor keys with sharps. To quote Bate (pp. 89–90): "It is probable that the oboe d'amore was originally taken as interchangeable with the treble when the tessitura of the music demanded, and this seems to be the way in which Bach usually regarded it. His writing for the d'amore shows a consistent tendency towards medium sharp keys, while such signatures are rare in contemporary parts for the C oboe. Conversely, Bach's choice of key may to some extent have been dictated by the instrument in cases where he wished to exploit its characteristic tone—more sombre than that of the treble, less weighty than that of the tenor. Two oboes d'amore were available in the household of the Prince Anhalt-Cöthen, and at Leipzig, Bach employed one regularly from 1723 onwards." See also George B. Stauffer, \textit{Bach. The Mass in B Minor: The Great Catholic Mass} (New York: Schirmer Books, 1997), 52–53. Stauffer also indicates that the mass's instrumental scoring contrasts with its vocal treatment. While the latter is closer to Italian models, the former relies on German tradition in its greater emphasis on the woodwinds and brass (p. 52). See also the excellent, detailed account of the instruments of Bach's time in Jürgen Eppelsheim's "The instruments" in \textit{Johann Sebastian Bach: Life, Times, Influence}, eds. Barbara Schwendowius and Wolfgang Dömling (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1977), 127–42; more specific to the oboe d'amore, see p. 136.

\textsuperscript{11}Stauffer (1997), 55.
with the melancholy color of its B-minor tonality. The fugue subject intensifies the declamation of the text by means of numerous rhetorical and musical devices: the insistent *repercussio* of the initial word "Kyrie" (B B B B: measure 5; in the tenor, measure 30), the *exclamatio* (ascending leap of a diminished seventh: measure 7; in the tenor, measure 32), and the *suspiratio* (off-the-beat notes interspersed with pauses in the word "eleison": measures 62–64).12

![Example 3. J. S. Bach: Kyrie I, Largo](image)

---

Thus, the Kyrie I text elicits two very different responses from the two composers with respect to tonality, number of measures, instrumentation, and textural development. In contrast to Harrer, Bach emphasizes pathos—an affect characteristic of Baroque aesthetics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Christe Movements</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Christe</strong></td>
<td><strong>Christe</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bach</strong></td>
<td><strong>Harrer</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R₁ (measures 1–10) D major</td>
<td>R₁ (measures 1–28) A major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A₁ (measures 10–33) D major → A major</td>
<td>A₁ (measures 28–68) A major → E major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R₂ (measures 33–42) A major</td>
<td>R₂ (measures 68–83) E major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A₂ (measures 42–53) A major → B minor</td>
<td>A₂ (measures 83–131) E major → A major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R₃ (measures 53–58) B minor</td>
<td>R₃ (measures 131–49) A major</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A₃ (measures 58–76) B minor → D major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>R₄ (measures 76–85) D major</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Both composers divide the Christe into sections (see Table 2), following the model of an aria with ritornellos (similar to ABA form). However, there are clear differences in the rhythmic-melodic, and instrumental content. Bach's setting calls for two sopranos, unison violins, and basso continuo, whereas Harrer employs solo alto, two

---

13Harrer's Christe contains three brief instrumental interludes or bridges (measures 40–41; measures 4–49; measures 103–104), which I have not included in the corresponding table but in the vocal part, as they do not exhibit all of the thematic material of the ritornellos analyzed. However, they could be interpreted as brief interruption points of the melodic line.

14We interpret ritornello R₃ as acting as a bridge, a transition towards the final key rather than the ritornello proper since, although it contains the thematic material of the ritornellos, it does not develop it fully. Please note that R = ritornello and A = vocal and instrumental part.
violins, viola, and basso continuo. For his rhythmic and melodic pattern, Bach uses quadruple meter (C), whereas Harrer resorts to triple meter (3/8), more characteristic of dances such as the minuet. Since the key chosen by Harrer for the composition of the Christe also concurs with the concept proposed by Mattheson, we note here the latter’s idea of the minuet:

Le Menuet, la Minuetta, sie sey gemacht zum Spielen, zum Singen, zum Tantzen, ins besondere Keinen andern Affect, als eine mässige Lustigkeit.15 [Translation: The minuet, the minuetta, are not made for playing, for singing, or for dancing, in particular, for no other effect than a restrained happiness.]

We might also compare a fragment of Giovanni Battista Pergolesi’s *Stabat Mater*16 (Example 4) with the timbral content and rhythmic-melodic patterns of Harrer’s Christe (Example 5). However, the essential difference lies in the minor key used by Pergolesi, which also distances it from Mattheson’s concept of the minuet:

---

15Johann Mattheson, *Der Vollkommene Capellmeister* (1739), chapter 13, §81; ed. Friederike Ramm (Kassel: Bärenreiter, 1999), 333.
Example 4. Pergolesi: *Stabat Mater*, “Eia, mater, fons amoris” (c. 1736)

Example 5. Harrer: Christe

With regard to the patterns of Bach’s melodic lines, they are clearly Baroque, showing the characteristic twists and turns of this style. The melodic patterns of the violins constitute a good example: sixteenth notes in conjunct motion—ascending, descending, arpeggiating, with octave jumps—with specified articulation (Example 6). By contrast, Harrer favours galant phraseology: short, regular and well-articulated phrases (Example 7), reflecting the fashion in operatic music at the time. For comparison, we can take as an example a
fragment of Antonio Caldara’s opera *Il più bel nome* (1708), where the similarities in phrasing between Caldara and Harrer are obvious (Example 8).

Example 6. J. S. Bach: Christe, violin phrasing

Example 7. G. Harrer: Christe, violin phrasing (measures 1–6)

Example 8. A. Caldara: *Il più bel nome* (1708), violin phrasing (from manuscript RISM B-Bc/584, ff 76–77, preserved at the Bibliothèque of the Conservatoire royal in Brussels).17

A closer look at the phrasing shows that Bach articulates the duet of sopranos with thirds (Example 9) and parallel sixths (measures 10–13 and 18–21) and imitations with retardandos18 (Example 10) (measures 14–17). Such devices are juxtaposed alternately throughout the whole of the Christe aria. It is also of interest that Bach uses

---

17Ursula Kirkendale, *Antonio Caldara*, (Graz-Köln: Hermann Böhlaus Nachf., 1966), 41–42, notes that on 2 August 1708, Caldara’s *Componimento da camera per musica: il più bel nome nel festeggiarsi il Nome Felicissimo di Sua Maestà Cattolica Elisabetta Cristina Regina delle Spagne* was performed in Barcelona.

triplets—as if they were *gruppetti* in the form of an actual note—which are also galant devices19 aimed at embellishing the melodic lines of the voices (measures 11 and 20). Stauffer, taking his cue from Marshall, indicates that the duet shows the *affetti amorosi* often found in the love duets of Neapolitan opera of the day.20 Despite the virtuosity, the duet of the two sopranos, both in the range—soprano I is D3-G4 and soprano II B2-F#4—and the registers used and the patterns sung, makes clear a commendable sobriety that further enhances the text sung.

![Example 9. J. S. Bach: Christe, parallel movement](image)

Example 9. J. S. Bach: Christe, parallel movement

![Example 10. J. S. Bach: Christe, suspensions](image)

Example 10. J. S. Bach: Christe, suspensions

Although opera was banned in Leipzig in 1720,21 Neapolitan operatic airs must have had an influence on Bach. In fact, on 14 September 1731 Bach was invited to give an organ recital as part of

19Stauffer (1997) 10–13 and 57. On page 10 and following, he talks about the *Style Galant* and its manifestation in the mass, especially in the Kyrie and the Gloria—the other parts requiring a more polyphonic texture. He also discusses the fashion in Dresden and the music of various Italian (Neapolitan) composers who exported the new taste.


the celebrations of the Dresden premiere\textsuperscript{22} of Hasse’s opera \textit{Cleofide}\textsuperscript{23} the day before. Conducted by Hasse himself and with the main role sung by his wife Faustina Bordoni, this opera introduced a new aesthetic into the Dresden operatic world. This historical fact, already mentioned above, indicates the opportuneness of sampling a fragment of Hasse’s opera \textit{Cleofide} to compare it with the devices used by Bach in the creation of his Christe. Of note in this respect is the development of the duet in an \textit{arioso} with parallel thirds, which we also find in Bach’s Christe, as well as the \textit{affetti amorosi} already referred to:

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{Example_11.png}
\caption{J. A. Hasse: \textit{Cleofide} (1731), Arioso}
\end{figure}

We have already seen how the violins of Bach’s Christe display a phrasing that is both restrained—in the tempo and registers used—and virtuosic, within an endless continuum that accompanies, introduces, and paraphrases the voices. The basso continuo, entrusted with reinforcing the harmonic edifice, also occasionally takes up the thematic material displayed by the violins (measures 17–18 and 67–68), thus giving it some protagonism and releasing it from its role as mere accompaniment.

As regards Harrer, there are \textit{coloratura} elements in the melodic pattern of the alto (Example 12), which clearly reveal the influence of Italian operatic style in ecclesiastical circles, whatever criticism this may have received in some quarters.\textsuperscript{24} As has already been indicated

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{22}Christoph Wolff (2003), 145.
\textsuperscript{23}Daniel Heartz (2003), 321–28. The example is from p. 325.
\textsuperscript{24}Agricola echoed Tosi’s observations on the intrusion of theatrical music into the church: Johann Agricola, \textit{Anleitung zur Singkunst} (1757). \textit{Zusammen mit dem italienischen Original von Pier Francesco Tosi Opinion de’cantori antichi e moderni o sieno Osservazioni sopra il canto figurato} (1723), new edition, with a preface and an appendix by Erwin R. Jacobi, (Hannover: Hermann Moeck Verlag, 1966), 225: “Der Unverstand derer wird ihm misfallen, welche unter die schlüpfrigen theatralischen Arien geistliche Texte legen
\end{footnotesize}
Comparison of Bach and Harrer Kyries

by Stauffer and Kollmar,\textsuperscript{25} many opera singers were very probably active in the church music of the court in Dresden, and therefore could bring operatic glamor, admiration, and spectacle to the service of church music. The alto timbre could be performed by either a falsettist or a castrato, and its color enhanced this phrasing and was in full harmony with the musical aesthetics of the day. The range used by the alto is A♯\textsubscript{3}-D\textsubscript{4}; the most frequent register is D♯\textsubscript{3}-A\textsubscript{3}, although there are some incursions into the acute register. The performer was thus presumably a professional altist with a good technique for changing from head to chest register to homogenize the color or timbre—if a falsettist. Tosi’s commentary is relevant here:

Fra le maggiori diligenze del Maestro una ne richiede la voce delle Scolaro, la quale, ò sia di petto, ò di testa deve uscir limpida, e chiara senza che passi pel naso, nè in gola si affoghi, che sono due difetti i più orribili d’un Cantore, e senza rimedio, quando han preso possesso. [Translation: Among the greatest concerns of the master is the student’s voice itself, which whether chest or head, must issue clean and clear without passing through the nose or being choked in the throat, the two most horrible defects in a singer, and irremediable once they are entrenched.\textsuperscript{26}]

lassen; um eben dieselbe Musik mit Beyfall in der Kirche singen zu können: gleich als wenn zwischen der einen und der andern Schreibart gar kein Unterschied zu befinden wäre; und als wenn die Ueberbleibsel der Schaubühne für den Gottesdienst gut genug wären.” [Translation: “He will be offended by the lack of understanding among those who allow sacred texts to be placed among the most lascivious of theatrical arias, as if there were no difference between one type of writing and the other; and as if the remains of the stage were good enough for the religious service.”] Tosi: p. 105: “Gli dispiacerà l’imprudenza di chi fa tradurre in latino le parole dell’Arie più lubriche del Teatro per cantare l’istessa Musica con applauso in Chiesa, come se tra l’uno e l’altro stile non vi fosse differenza alcuna, e convenissero a Dio gli avanzi delle Scene.” [Translation: “He will dislike the presumption of someone who gets the words of the lowdest arias of the stage rendered into Latin so that he may sing the same music with applause in the church, as if there were no difference between one style and another and the forwardness of the stage were appropriate for God.”] See also Michael Maul, “Das Thomaskantorat im 17. und 18. Jahrhundert” in Zentren der Kirchenmusik, vol. 2, eds. Matthias Schneider & Beate Bugenhagen (Köthen: Laaber, 2011), 257–58.


\textsuperscript{26}Tosi: 13–14 in Johann Agricola, op. cit., 21: “Eine der vornehmsten Sorgen des Meisters muß auf des Schülers Stimme gerichtet seyn. Es mag eine Bruststimme (voce di petto) oder eine Kopfstimme (voce di testa) seyn; so muß sie immer rein und hell heraus kommen; ohne daß sie (wie man sagt) durch die Nase gehe, oder in der
Likewise, the indications on the unification of head and chest voice given by Tosi to the sopranist are equally applicable to the altist:

Un diligente Istruttore sapendo, che un Soprano senza falsetto bisogna, che canti fra l'angustie di poche corde non solamente procura d'acquistarglielo, ma non lascia modo intentato acciò lo unisca alla voce di petto in forma, che non si distingua l'uno de l'altra, che se l'unione non è perfetta, la voce sarà di più registri, e conseguentemente perderà la sua bellezza. [Translation by Johann Galliard, 1743: "A diligent Master, knowing that a Soprano, without the Falsetto, is constrained to sing within the narrow Compass of a few Notes, ought not only to endeavour to help him to it, but also to leave no Means untried, so to unite the feigned and the natural Voice, that they may not be distinguished; for if they do not perfectly unite, the Voice will be of divers Registers, and must consequently lose its Beauty."]

Kehle stecken bleibe. Dieses sind die beyden gräßlichsten Fehler eines Sängers; und wenn sie einmal eingewurzelt sind, ist ihnen nicht mehr abzuhelfen." [Translation: One of the primary concerns of the master must be that of judging his pupil's voice. Whether a chest voice (voce di petto) or a head voice (voce di testa), it should always be pure and luminous, without passing (as they say) through the nose, or getting stuck in the throat. These are the two most horrible faults in a singer; and once they have become rooted, there is nothing to remedy it.]

27Tosi, 14 in Agricola, op. cit., 21: "Ein fleißiger Unterweiser, weil er weis, daß ein Sopran, ohn Falsett, genöthiget ist in dem engen Umfange nur weniger Töne zu singen; so suchet er nicht allein ihm das Falsett zu verschaffen; sondern er läßt auch nichts unversuchet, damit dasselbe mit der natürlichen Stimme auf eine solche Art vereiniget werde, daß man eins vom andern nicht unterscheiden könne. Denn wenn diese Vereinigung nicht vollkommen ist: so hat die Stimme einen verschiedenen Laut, oder (wie die Wälschen sagen) verschiedene Register (n), und verliert folglich ihre Schönheit ...." [Translation: A diligent instructor, because he knows that a soprano without falsetto is confined to the narrow compass of just a few notes, will not only seek to help him acquire the falsetto, but also leave nothing untried in helping him unite it to the chest voice in such a way that the one is indistinguishable from the other. For if this union is not perfect, the voice will have a differentiated sound, or (as the Italians say) different registers, and consequently will lose its beauty ....]
Example 12. G. Harrer: Christe, coloratura

By way of comparison, see the following fragment of Leonardo Vinci’s opera Artaserse, premiered in Rome in 1730. This opera was very well received and greatly applauded by the public. The effect created by the ascending and descending coloraturas with Lombard rhythms captivated the Rome opera public.\(^{28}\) It is interesting to highlight here not so much the tessitura—sopranist in Vinci and altist in Harrer—as the similarity of colorature and the use of Lombard rhythms that became so fashionable in the early decades of the eighteenth century, and which as we have seen were also finding their way into liturgical church music:

Example 13. Leonardo Vinci: Artaserse, lombard rhythms

With respect to the violins of Harrer’s Christe, as in Bach, they also act as prelude, interlude, postlude and accompaniment to the

\(^{28}\)Heartz (2003), 313–14. Also, as Heartz indicates, “Hasse’s setting for Venice in 1730 of the revised text was one of the numbers taken over in the London Artaserse during the 1734–35 season, in which both Farinelli and Cuzzoni repeated their roles. It figures in The Favourite Songs in the Opera call’d Artaserse by Sig. Hasse . . . . Hasse chose a more rarefied key, E, clothing an Adagio in common time, as in Vinci’s aria. He too uses Lombard rhythms, but more in the violins than in the voice part. He also deploys the ever-so-modish three-note snaps of the Neapolitans.” The example here is from p. 314.
voice. Conversely, the figurations used by Harrer are those of galant phrasing—short, periodic and articulated—at the same time using the Lombard rhythms so fashionable at the time and that would later be taken up by the voice:

Harrer’s *basso continuo* occasionally works with drum bass or broken pedal note patterns: see the comparison of and obvious difference between the respective accompaniment patterns of Harrer and Bach. Once again, we see a lack of figures in the Harrer and their detailed use in Bach’s Christe:

\[\text{Example 14. G. Harrer: Lombard rhythms}\]

\[\text{Example 15. G. Harrer: Christe, drum bass}\]

\[\text{Example 16. J. S. Bach: Christe, basso continuo}\]

Kyrie II

For the Kyrie II, Harrer writes a fugal subject derived from the rhythmic pattern found in Kyrie I, conferring a certain cyclical unity on this part of the mass and even on the mass as a whole, since the same pattern reappears in the Dona nobis pacem of the Agnus Dei. As we have seen, this pattern is identical to the one Bach uses for his Kyrie I fugue.

Thus, both composers cast Kyrie II as a fugue. In Harrer’s work, it is a modern fugue in D major, with a vivace tempo, 4/4 meter, and vocal and instrumental tutti (the instruments doubling the voices). Noteworthy, too, is the appearance of an instrumental interlude (measures 24–30). These aspects differentiate Harrer’s setting from Bach’s (Example 17), which clearly employs the stile antico, its counterpoint driving to the final cadence without interruption.

Bach’s writing here places him securely within the Baroque stile antico tradition, while Harrer’s modern treatment (characterized by a percussive subject and other galant traits) places him firmly within the new style (Example 18):

Example 17. J. S. Bach: Kyrie II

For references to the stile antico applied to Bach, see Christoph Wolff, Der Stile antico in der Musik Johann Sebastian Bachs: Studien zum Bachs Spätwerk (Wiesbaden: Franz Steiner Verlag, 1968), 129–42.
In any event, Bach’s counterpoint is much richer than that of Harrer, whose work lacks the versatility and density of Bach’s fugal writing, despite his position as a Kappellmeister and composer. Furthermore, his rendering of Bach’s figured bass reveals his deep grasp of scholastic fugal technique, underpinning as they do the harmonic and contrapuntal edifice of the musical discourse.

Lastly, it should also be noted that rhetoric is of less importance in Harrer than in Bach. Indeed, if we compare the initial design of the Harrer’s Kyrie, we note the presence there too of a *repercussio*. However, both the ascending leap of a perfect fifth and the D major tonality weaken the supplicatory nature of the plea to God. The setting might more readily be described as a festive Kyrie, in which the sense of the text is subsidiary to the music per se.
Conclusions

The above analysis reveals the following differences between the two settings, with respect to the three aspects studied:

Timbral Aspects

The instrumental palettes of the two works are markedly different, both with regard to color and treatment. Bach still resorts to the color of the oboe d’amore, which fell into gradual disuse in favor of an instrumental standardization attributable to practical, social, and technical factors. Bach also used the traversi, instruments that do not appear in Harrer. By contrast, Harrer used timpani as a marking element in certain passages. The use and function of the strings also marks an obvious difference between Bach and Harrer. Taken together, these timbral aspects clearly highlight a change from late Baroque style to Style Galant.

With regard to treatment of the voices, Harrer (unlike Bach) allows bel canto brilliance to prevail over a pious demeanor—especially in the Christe. Harrer relishes the occasion to showcase the soloist in question, in manner of a theatrical/operatic production. Here it is obvious that the Style Galant is being imposed on an ecclesiastical context, providing a clear contrast to Bach’s treatment.

Formal Aspects

The melodic lines of the two works are very different. Bach’s work shows the continuum of Baroque melody. Harrer’s setting, by contrast, employs the short, periodic, and articulated phrases typical of the Style Galant as well as coloraturas in the solo voice. These traits become more marked in the Christe, since it is written as an aria, providing the clearest example of the stylistic difference. The treatment of the choruses also reveals a clear difference between Bach and Harrer. In the former, counterpoint is emphasized more than in the latter.
Bach also places more weight on the fugues than Harrer does. In the course of the Kyries Bach composes two, Harrer only one. Furthermore, in terms of intervallic and rhythmic design, Bach's fugues follow the patterns of a Baroque discourse, while Harrer's single fugue has a wholly galant conception.

Bach's continuo figures are also much more explicit and elaborate than Harrer's, creating a richer and more complex harmonic structure. Harrer's harmonies are more simply behaved, constantly affirming basic tonal functions—I-IV-V-I—with respective modulations to neighboring tones and a closing galant cadence. This produces a more static harmonic rhythm than in Bach, indicating the coming of a new era, whose tastes and aesthetics suggest the plastic expression of Rococo art and the Neapolitan musical style. Contrasts between Bach's continuo lines and Harrer's drum bass similarly mark a change in style.

Bach and Harrer are also very different in their approach to ornamentation. Whereas Bach favors restraint, Harrer employs many ornaments: trills, appoggiaturas, and mordents, along with thirds and Lombard rhythms—elements that seek to enhance the bellum rather than the pulchrum. Thus, for example, Harrer seems more interested in the embellished and cantabile melodic line of the Christe than in the work as a whole, since the movement's only role is to showcase the melody.

Relationship between Music and Text

We have observed that the two composers employed very different approaches with respect to tonality, instrumental/vocal forces, and textural development, as they relate to the liturgical text. Bach's setting is in keeping with Baroque Tonmalerei and its emphasis on close text-music relations. Harrer, in contrast, is fond of music for its own sake and therefore adopts a more flexible relationship with the religious text. The three-fold emphasis emanating from the rhetoric, docere, delectare et movere (teach, delight, move), are fully articulated by Bach, whereas with Harrer one senses that the entire burden falls on delectare. The use of symbolism is more obvious in Bach than in Harrer, since rhetoric and symbol lose force in Harrer's galant
aesthetic. Thus, Bach shows his Baroque demeanor when applying his hermeneutic to the liturgical text, while Harrer uses the text as an opportunity to adorn the music.

Overall, Bach’s Kyrie is an expression of the late Baroque musical style, whereas Harrer’s setting exemplifies the new tastes of the day. Bach’s music is rooted in religion and intrinsically identifies with faith and the never-ending praise of God. Harrer, on the other hand, resorts to the models and archetypes imported from Italy, which enjoyed great favor at the Dresden court. With Harrer, we see the stilus theatralis slowly penetrating ecclesiastical music, even those forms linked to strict liturgical adherence and texts that had ecclesiastical status like that of the mass. This trend is especially evident in the central section of Harrer’s Kyrie, the Christe. Harrer treats the Mass more as concert work, while Bach conceives it as a vehicle for liturgical expression and, as a result, shows greater concern for the text.

Therefore, in the light of the data and the analysis conducted, I hope to have demonstrated the feasibility of the hypothesis that the Kyries of Johan Sebastian Bach’s Mass in B minor (BMV 232) and Gottlob Harrer’s Mass in D major (HarWV 32) fall mid-way between Late Baroque and the Style Galant. Two compositional solutions that reflect the aesthetic and stylistic change in seventeenth-century Europe, and specifically in the Leipzig and Dresden of their day.