

Check for updates

Review



Author for correspondence: Jennifer McElwain Email: jmcelwai@tcd.ie

Received: 10 September 2023 Accepted: 19 December 2023

Tansley review

Functional traits of fossil plants

Jennifer C. McElwain¹ (D), William J. Matthaeus¹ (D), Catarina Barbosa¹ (D), Christos Chondrogiannis¹ (D), Katie O' Dea¹, Bea Jackson¹ (D), Antonietta B. Knetge¹ (D), Kamila Kwasniewska¹ (D), Richard Nair¹ (D), Joseph D. White² (D), Jonathan P. Wilson³ (D), Isabel P. Montañez^{4,5} (D), **Yvonne M. Buckley⁶ (D), Claire M. Belcher**⁷ (D) and Sandra Nogué^{8,9} (D) ¹School of Natural Sciences, Botany, Trinity College Dublin, Dublin, D02 PN40, Ireland; ²Department of Biology, Baylor University, Waco, 76798-7388, TX, USA; ³Department of Environmental Studies, Haverford College, Haverford, Pennsylvania 19041 PA, USA; ⁴UC Davis Institute of the Environment, University of California, Davis, CA 95616, USA; ⁵Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, University of California, Davis, CA 95616, USA; ⁶School of Natural Sciences, Zoology, Trinity College Dublin, Dublin, D02 PN40, Ireland; ⁷wildFIRE Lab, University of Exeter, Exeter, EX4 4PS, UK; ⁸Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Bellaterra (Cerdanyola del Vallès), 08193, Catalonia, Spain; ⁹CREAF, Bellaterra (Cerdanyola del Vallès), 08193, Catalonia, Spain

Contents

	Summary	1	VI	Fossil leaf functional traits	10
I	Introduction	2	VII	Fossil stem functional traits	16
П	Toward the development of fossil plant functional traits	2	VIII	Whole plant functional traits applied to fossils	19
ш	Taphonomic constraints for a paleo-functional trait approach	3	IX	Concluding remarks	22
IV	Methodological constraints for a paleo-functional trait approach	5		Acknowledgements	23
v	Functional traits of fossil spores, pollen, and seeds	5		References	23

Summary

New Phytologist (2024) **doi**: 10.1111/nph.19622

Key words: earth system processes, fossil plant preservation modes, functional traits, leaf economic spectrum, paleobiology, paleobotany, plant fossil record, taphonomy. A minuscule fraction of the Earth's paleobiological diversity is preserved in the geological record as fossils. What plant remnants have withstood taphonomic filtering, fragmentation, and alteration in their journey to become part of the fossil record provide unique information on how plants functioned in paleo-ecosystems through their traits. Plant traits are measurable morphological, anatomical, physiological, biochemical, or phenological characteristics that potentially affect their environment and fitness. Here, we review the rich literature of paleobotany, through the lens of contemporary trait-based ecology, to evaluate which well-established extant plant traits hold the greatest promise for application to fossils. In particular, we focus on fossil plant functional traits, those measurable properties of leaf, stem, reproductive, or whole plant fossils that offer insights into the functioning of the plant when alive. The limitations of a trait-based approach in paleobotany are considerable. However, in our critical assessment of

New Phytologist © 2024 New Phytologist Foundation

This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited and is not used for commercial purposes.

over 30 extant traits we present an initial, semi-quantitative ranking of 26 paleo-functional traits based on taphonomic and methodological criteria on the potential of those traits to impact Earth system processes, and for that impact to be quantifiable. We demonstrate how valuable inferences on paleo-ecosystem processes (pollination biology, herbivory), past nutrient cycles, paleobiogeography, paleo-demography (life history), and Earth system history can be derived through the application of paleo-functional traits to fossil plants.

I. Introduction

To date, the predominant focus of enquiry in paleobotany has been to document plant diversity and evolution (taxonomy and systematics), and through the development of climatic and atmospheric proxies (paleoclimatology), to examine how longterm environmental change has influenced plant form and diversity across time and space (paleoecology, evolutionary biology). Fewer studies have focused on the capacity of vegetation to 'force' the Earth system through its heterogeneous alteration of the hydrological cycle, weathering rates, and elemental fluxes between land and ocean. It is hypothesized that the magnitude of plant-driven forcing of the Earth system is influenced by the evolution of new plant groups that possess novel traits and trait combinations (Bonan, 1995; Boyce et al., 2010; Boyce & Lee, 2010; Franks et al., 2017; White et al., 2020), yet to date, we lack a robust foundation of functional data on extinct plants to test these hypotheses in sufficient detail.

In this paper, we review a rich resource of paleobotanical and plant trait literature and outline a methodology for bringing fossil and extinct plants 'to life' using a functional trait-based approach pioneered by contemporary plant trait ecologists. We present a critical assessment of fossil plant functional traits that influence Earth system processes in particular. Such traits are referred to as 'effect traits' (Lavorel & Garnier, 2002; Chapin 3rd, 2003; Violle et al., 2007) and are well-established in contemporary ecology. These traits have an 'effect' on ecosystem-scale processes such as carbon sequestration, chemical weathering, and decomposition. In addition to modulating local processes differently across the globe, variation in these traits is a key determinant of global biogeography. Our overarching aim is thus to identify and semi-quantitatively rank a set of fossil plant functional traits that are robust to taphonomic constraints, are relatively easy to measure across various fossil plant preservation modes and which have played a role in shaping Earth's environment, climate, and atmosphere through time via their effect on the carbon, oxygen, nutrient, and hydrological cycles (Fig. 1). We do not focus on 'response traits', such as leaf area, leaf physiognomy and wood growth rings (Lavorel & Garnier, 2002; Chapin 3rd, 2003; Violle et al., 2007; Wright et al., 2017), which are plant traits predominantly shaped by local environmental factors, because they have been extensively used as the fundamental underpinning of fossil plant paleo-climate proxies and reviewed in depth elsewhere (Peppe et al., 2011, 2014; Yang et al., 2011, 2014; Allen et al., 2020; Spicer et al., 2021).

For each paleo-functional trait, we: (1) provide some brief examples of how fossil plant functional traits can elucidate population and ecosystem processes, plant-climate, and plantatmosphere interactions in Earth's deep past. (2) We highlight relationships between traits and trade-offs that have been robustly established within contemporary global datasets and that could be applied to fossil plants to obtain additional, indirect paleofunctional trait data. In cases where no suitable direct methods or trait-trait relationships have been established, (3) we present opportunities for future research to address these paleo-ecological gaps. Finally, (4) we assess how modes of fossil plant preservation and relevant taphonomic factors may potentially influence paleofunctional trait fidelity to the original trait value and its variability. Using these criteria, the author team has semi-quantitatively scored 26 fossil plant functional traits out of 30 initially assessed (Fig. 1) as a starting point for broader community engagement and to illustrate the relative ranking of paleo-functional traits based on our review.

We have organized the review using the contemporary trait selection in the 'New handbook for standardized measurement of plant functional traits worldwide' (Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013) with a focus first on regenerative traits that can be obtained from fossil palynomorphs and seeds followed by an appraisal of paleo-functional traits of fossil leaves and stems. In the last sections of the paper, we evaluate whole plant traits and trait syndromes that provide critical insights into extant plant ecological strategy and assess which can robustly be applied to plant fossils given their often fragmentary nature. Traits presented by Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.* (2013) without potential application as paleo-functional traits (4 out of 30 traits) are included along with our assessment and reasoning in Supporting Information Notes S1-S7.

II. Toward the development of fossil plant functional traits

Current Earth system models (ESMs) incorporate vegetation, and biosphere feedbacks and drivers, but generally have not considered how plant-driven feedbacks and forcing over time may have changed with the emergence of new plant evolutionary groups and their associated functional traits (Matthaeus et al., 2023). On geological timescales, the primary drivers of plant trait selection and filtering such as Earth's global mean annual temperature and precipitation, atmospheric composition, wildfire ecology, biota of herbivores, pathogens, symbionts, mutualists, dispersers, pollinators have all changed dramatically. Marked filtering and selection of 'response traits' in an evolving Earth may in turn have changed the forcing strength or capacity of plant traits to have an 'effect' on processes within their ecosystems. For instance, increasing atmospheric CO₂ in the earliest Jurassic selected for plants with lower stomatal conductance (g_{max}) . Changes in g_{max} trait values halved evapotranspiration rates of early Jurassic forests impacting run-off in the hydrological cycle, a key Earth system process

Review

Ŗ	****		$\textcircled{\begin{tabular}{c} \bullet \end{array}}$	S
Initial assessment of 30 traits using contemporary trait handbook	Score on factors for transforming traits developed for living plants to traits of fossil plants	Discuss paleo- functional trait scores Quantify consensus scores among team	Score strength of paleo-functional trait effect on earth system	Consider if trait can be parameterized in paleo-ecosystem models & score
26 Contemporary plant traits selected for further analysis	Paleo-functional trait scores	Paleo-functional trait (PT) scores	Earth system effect (ESE) scores	Earth system implementation (ESI) scores
4 rejected (see Supporting Information) 15 Leaf traits	(each author) i) Taphonomic bias? (1–3)		v) Driver of an earth system process? a modifier? minimal effect?	vi) Represented in paleo-ecosystem models? in related models? is there a path to parameterization?
5 Stem traits 4 Regenerative traits	ii) Likelihood of preservation? (1–3) iii) Robustness of methods? (1–3)		(multiplier; 0–1) (e.g. Matthaeus <i>et al.,</i> 2023)	(multiplier; 0–1) (e.g. White <i>et al.,</i> 2020)
6 Whole-plant when adjective (Pérez-Harguindeguy <i>et al.,</i> 2013)	iv) Direct or indirect method? (1–2)		$PT \ score$ $(i + ii + iii + iv) \times v \times vi =$ $ESE \ score$	ESI score

Fig. 1 Methodological framework used to critically evaluate 30 contemporary plant traits (from Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013) for their potential application to the plant fossil record as paleo-functional traits. Four traits (leaf water potential, leaf dry matter content, leaf and litter PH, and seedling functional morphology, see Supporting Information Notes S1–S7) were deemed to have low potential applicability to fossil plants and were not evaluated beyond the initial assessment step. The 26 remaining traits were reviewed (Sections V–VII) and semi-quantitatively evaluated by the authors to produce an initial list of paleo-functional traits (Table S1), which we then ranked according to taphonomic bias (i, ii), ease and robustness of trait measurement in fossil plants (iii, iv), strength of the trait's impact on the Earth system (v) and capacity to quantify the impact of the trait on an Earth system process within paleo-ecosystem models (vi; Figs 3, 4).

(Steinthorsdottir et al., 2012). We propose, therefore, that a paleofunctional trait approach in paleobotany will provide an improvement to the representation of vegetation-ESM interactions that is evidence-based, provides testable hypotheses, and is scalable. For example, a linear multiplier has historically been used to account for enhanced plant-driven chemical weathering over geological time (reviewed in Goddéris et al., 2023). This assumption could be tested using fossil functional traits that likely influence weathering rates such as photosynthetic rate, litter decomposability, and xylem conductivity and by tracking changes in their trait values over time. Terrestrial productivity exerts critical influence on the carbon and nutrient cycles (N, P; Lenton et al., 2018), in large part via weathering rates, and is hypothesized to have undergone stepchange increases over geological time with more recently derived plant groups (angiosperms) generally being more productive than their ancestors (gymnosperms; Boyce & Zwieniecki, 2012; Boyce et al., 2023). These ideas, however, are challenged by the observation that long-extinct plants (Carboniferous) had similar rates of photosynthesis and transpiration as modern angiosperms (Wilson et al., 2017, 2020; Yiotis & McElwain, 2019) and are ripe for further testing using multiple paleo-functional traits - but which ones should we focus on? The uncertain trajectory of plant functional trait evolution over geological time thereby introduces uncertainty to key Earth system processes (e.g. hydrological cycle and weathering) that exert substantial control on the long-term carbon and oxygen cycles, global temperature, and the habitability of the planet.

A wealth of contemporary ecological studies demonstrates that the functional diversity of plant traits does not map simply to plant evolutionary groups (Diaz et al., 2016; Bruelheide et al., 2018). Global trait-based ecology has emerged in the field of contemporary ecology as a powerful tool to categorize how plants influence their abiotic and biotic environment based on their morphological, anatomical, chemical, physiological, demographic, and/or reproductive traits rather than their species identity or evolutionary relationships (Wright et al., 2004; Cornwell et al., 2008; Diaz et al., 2016; but see van der Plas et al., 2020). A trait-based ecology approach in paleobotany, where species identities are often uncertain compared with contemporary taxonomy, would thus allow the functional characterization of plants, whether long extinct or living, by their functional traits preserved in fossils. In order to critically evaluate the potential of different plant functional traits to inform Earth system science, we have semi-quantitatively evaluated every trait we review in the ensuing sections on the strength of its impact on the Earth system (Earth system effect (ESE) score, Fig. 1) and on the current capacity to quantify this impact using paleo-ecosystem models (Earth System implementation (ESI) score; Fig. 1).

III. Taphonomic constraints for a paleo-functional trait approach

A tree fell in a forest 200 million years ago; no one was there to observe it. Depending on plant type and circumstances, we might

still infer how it functioned based on its traits. The plant fossil record is mostly composed of fragmented plant parts (e.g. spores, seeds, leaves, and shoots) that are preserved separately. Broadly, tissue type, preservation mode, and taphonomy (reviewed in Collinson, 1983; Greenwood & Donovan, 1991; Gastaldo, 2001; Ferguson, 2005; Sims & Cassara, 2009) determine the availability of different plant parts on which functional trait measurements can be obtained. Furthermore, each combination of tissue type, preservation mode, and trait requires a unique set of considerations regarding the bias of the resulting trait values (Fig. 1). All fossil preservation types depend on the presence of water, introducing a taphonomic mega-bias favoring plants that grew in or near wet locations or that can survive transport by water to a depositional environment (Ferguson, 2005). Furthermore, because fossil preservation is a rare outcome, robust estimates of the distribution of trait values, and extreme values (i.e. maxima) are likely unavailable most of the time, and require exceptionally preserved floras where thousands of fossil plant parts, including the most delicate (e.g. fossil flowers, pollen tubes, and fern fiddleheads), are available for study. In combination with fragmentation, taphonomy also makes disentangling trait variation from development difficult but not impossible. Part of the solution to the filtering of original trait values by the fossil record is integrating an understanding of the taphonomic factors that transform a living community of plants at some past instance in geological time to a dead assemblage of fossil plant parts, each with their measurable trait values. Taphonomic processes are very well understood for fossil plants and what is required now is that this field is extended to explicitly consider functional traits.

Most often, plant parts are preserved when they are buried quickly, enter anaerobic conditions that hinder decomposition, and are then further altered where the sediment around them becomes rock. This produces compression fossils when original organic material remains, and still-valuable impression fossils when the original matter is lost. Compression/impression fossils allow for the measurement of gross morphological trait values, but deformation due to compression may alter individual traits. Chemical traits may be measured from compressions, though they may be altered in diagenesis (Box 1; Ferguson, 2005) and biased by fossilization potential (Spicer, 1989; Tegelaar et al., 1991; Bacon et al., 2016) likely imposing artifacts in trait values at the plant community/ fossil assemblage scale. This mode of preservation is more likely to preserve tissues that are resistant to fragmentation, deformation, and decomposition, suggesting that functional traits measured from compression/impression fossils will more likely be biased toward trait values of more robust plants and plant parts with dense and/or tough lignin-rich, suberin-rich, or polymer-rich tissues.

In a few special circumstances, anatomy can be preserved in plant fossils. Plant tissues that are flooded with mineral-saturated water or inundated *in situ* by volcanic ash falls (e.g. Wuda Tuff flora), or partially burned in forest fires produce permineralization (see Box 1) and charcoalified fossils, respectively (Schopf, 1975; Wang *et al.*, 2012). These allow measurement of cellular-scale and morphological traits that can be obtained with minimal alteration due to deformation but in most cases, little unaltered organic Box 1 Definition of terms.

Demographic traits: vital rates for the processes of growth, survival, and reproduction that are calculated at a population level. Demographers use life-history traits measured at population levels to model complex attributes of vital rates such as lifespan and maximum age at reproductive maturity.

Diagenesis: the physical and chemical alterations to plants and plant parts and their surrounding sediments that occur during the process of fossilization (before deep metamorphic processes under high temperatures and pressures) and ultimately determine whether the plant/ plant part and its trait values are preserved or destroyed.

Fossil plant (paleo-) functional traits: a measurable property of a plant fossil that is inferred to have influenced the function of the plant while it was alive, and which likely affected its environment or its fitness. These inferences are usually made through relationships between structure or chemistry, and plant function that have been established, and continue to be developed in modern plants.

Fossil plant preservation modes: types of plant fossil preservation are determined by the matrix type (and grain size) the fossil is embedded in as well as the specimens' paleoenvironmental setting. There are six broad preservation categories. Those of two-dimensional preservation are compressions and impressions (Schopf, 1975); the latter lacking any remaining organic material. Three-dimensional preservations are permineralization, casts/molds, and compactions, with permineralizations lacking organic material (except cell walls) as the plant tissue is infiltrated by mineral deposits during formation. These modes have been abundantly described in the literature by case-to-case scenarios and much descriptive work was initially addressed by Schopf (1975). Lastly and of more recent application, molecular preservation retains organic compounds though lack structural remains.

Life-history traits: metrics or quantities that are integrated over a plant's life cycle and usually calculated at population levels (e.g. maximum age at reproductive maturity). Some life-history traits can also be considered as plant functional traits when measured at the level of individual rather than population. Our focus here is on those which can be measured on individuals.

Plant functional traits: broadly defined as any measurable morphological, anatomical, physiological, biochemical, or phenological trait of an individual plant that potentially affects its environment or its fitness (from Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013). For the purpose of this review, we focus more on plant functional traits which affect their local, regional and/or global environment (Chapin 3rd's (2003) 'effect' traits) as these are important for Earth system modelling (*sensu* Lavorel *et al.*, 2007) in the present and past (Matthaeus *et al.*, 2023).

Taphonomy: the fossil record of plants presents a biased representation of living vegetation that once existed. Taphonomy is defined as the processes and factors involved in the transformation of these once-living plant communities to an assemblage of fossil plants preserved within the rock record. According to Greenwood & Donovan (1991), 'plant taphonomy incorporates the processes of the initial abscission of plant parts, their transport (by air and/or water) to a place of eventual deposition, entrapment and eventual burial, and subsequent lithification'.

Trait syndrome: suite of consistently coordinated/correlated traits that occur across multiple scales of biological organization and environmental gradients that result from evolutionary processes (e.g. plant flammability, litter decomposability, and photosynthetic pathway).

material remains, precluding ready access to functional traits based on plant chemistry or stoichiometry. Permineralization of fossils allows preservation with less fragmentation, and occasionally of

herbaceous plants and delicate structures, depending on the process of initial burial. In some exceptional cases, for example, the Rhynie Chert (Trewin, 1994) and Chemnitz Fossil Forest (Rößler et al., 2012) communities are preserved in growth position, allowing measurement of multiple functional traits from the same fossil plant, and whole plant traits in an ecosystem context. In sections V-VIII, we evaluate the research potential of reproductive, leaf, stem, and whole fossil plant functional traits in the context of some of the biases and limitations imposed by preservation mode and taphonomy (i and ii in Fig. 1).

IV. Methodological constraints for a paleo-functional trait approach

The form, development, and taxonomy of plants are increasingly uncertain for extinct plants in deep time. Whereas modern plant ecologists generally begin their investigations with whole plants of known species, plant paleobiologists must start from plant parts. Understanding plant form from a mostly fragmented fossil record requires conceptual reconstruction of plants from fossils containing attachments of one organ to a different kind of organ (e.g. a shoot with an attached seed). Whole plant reconstructions represent a best-case scenario, requiring a comprehensive collection of attachments, often from different fossiliferous beds (e.g. Matsunaga & Tomescu, 2017). The core experimental grouping of the plant paleobiologist, therefore, is not an individual plant, but the plant part available to measure. Furthermore, the co-variation of traits in whole plants is generally unavailable on an individual fossil specimen due to fragmentation and separation of stems, leaves and fruits due to taphonomic processes (Box 1). However, information on the co-variation of traits is often available within a fossil assemblage at the bed level where tens to thousands of different plant organs that originally occurred as litter within the living community are preserved in the same relative abundance ranking as was present in the living vegetation (Burnham et al., 1992). Fossil plant assemblages of this nature enable deep investigation into trait variance within- and between species, assessments of appropriate sample sizes needed to achieve stable trait means, and ultimately the calculation of community-weighted mean trait values.

The limitations of using a paleo-functional trait approach are considerable and multifaceted. Nonetheless, plant fossils represent the one ground-truth record of the foundation of terrestrial ecosystems across deep time. Inferences of trait values from fossil plants may be made more robust by combining estimates from multiple plant parts and using direct measurement alongside biophysical and biochemical relationships between sub-tissue properties and function (e.g. C3/C4 photosynthetic pathways may be distinguished directly using anatomy when it is preserved, and indirectly using C isotopic signatures). Furthermore, the integration of contemporary plant ecology regarding trait tradeoffs and economics with the plant fossil record allows for the inference of additional trait values by analogy or through observed trait-trait correlations. For example, six leaf traits (photosynthetic capacity (Amass), dark respiration rate (Rmass), leaf mass per area (LMA), leaf lifespan (LL), leaf nitrogen (N_{mass}) , and phosphorous content (P_{mass}) co-vary strongly in contemporary global datasets

ded from https://nph.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/nph.19622 by Readcube (Labtiva Inc.), Wiley Online Library on [27/02/2024]. See the Terms and Conditions (https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/term

across thousands of species and climate zones; they collectively describe the 'leaf economic spectrum' - the economics of constructing and maintaining a leaf and the trade-offs involved (Wright et al., 2004). Because correlations between some functional traits are so well constrained for extant plants, this opens a window of possibility in paleobotany to infer traits that cannot be measured in fossils, such as P_{mass} , from those that can using multiple methods (e.g. LMA; see leaf economic traits). Variation in trait inferences may then be studied across scales (i.e. within and among fossiliferous bed, horizon, region, biome, and age) to form a picture of vegetation-climate interactions across deep time. We take these methodological considerations (iii and iv in Fig. 1) into account in a semi-quantitative evaluation of every trait in the following sections to ultimately calculate a '-Paleo-functional trait score' for each trait we review. A ranked list of paleo-functional traits is finally produced in the conclusion section by weighting Paleo-functional trait scores for each trait by its ESE and Implementation Scores (see Fig. 1).

V. Functional traits of fossil spores, pollen, and seeds

1. Spores and pollen

The study of functional traits of fossil pollen and spores provides key insights into persistence and resilience of plants, fungi, and ecosystems under environmental change, in particular drought (Abrego et al., 2017; Brussel et al., 2018; Sande et al., 2019; Table 1) as well as inferences on dispersal syndrome and pollination success. Thicker spore walls in forest edge fungi are likely linked to UV-light tolerance, and/or harsher environmental conditions (Norros et al., 2015; Abrego et al., 2017) and habitat characteristics (e.g. moisture) have likely played a substantial role in the evolution of pollen morphology (Ackerman, 2000; Franchi et al., 2011). The presence of pollen wall apertures is related to environments characterized by dry seasons or occasional droughts (Franchi et al., 2011). Although much pollen trait-based research to date tends to be reliant on recently collected data (c. 20 yr; Franchi et al., 2011; Nogué et al., 2022), several studies have shown the importance of the incorporation of paleo-ecological and paleontological data into trait frameworks to understand plant performance, fitness, and/or functioning (Reitalu et al., 2015; Brussel et al., 2018; van der Sande et al., 2023). The microscopic size of pollen and spores and their low taxonomic resolution create a challenge to their incorporation as functional traits into global trait analysis. However, potential methodologies have been proposed (reviewed in Reitalu & Nogué, 2023; Table 1). Taphonomic biases in the pollen and spore record are very well constrained compared with other fossilized plant parts, and there is a high likelihood of their fossilization. For these reasons, together with a high potential for direct measurement of trait values from pollen and spores, we attributed a relatively high overall Paleo-functional trait score to spores and pollen (10) (Fig. 3; Table S1). However, lower ESE (3) and ESI (0.3) scores were however assigned (Fig. 1), because although dispersal is a key determinant of biogeographic units, which in turn influence climate and biogeochemical cycles, realized dispersal also relies on vegetative traits. Furthermore, dispersal is

and-conditions) on Wiley Online Library for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons Licens

Т

Table 1 Functional traits of fossil pollen.					
Trait	Life history/ dispersal syndrome*/climate preference Trait description in relation to drought tolerance and dispersal				
Pollen size Small (S), 10–25 μm Medium (M), 26–50 μm Large (L), 51–100 μm	<i>Tolerance to drought</i> : Larger pollen grains should have an advantage over smaller ones when desiccation intensity increases: to minimize the rate of water loss due to desiccation, a plant produces larger grains that also have a lower surface-to-volume ratio (Ejsmond <i>et al.</i> , 2011) <i>Dispersal</i> : We expect small and medium pollen grains (e.g. 20-40 μm) to disperse better than those with larger pollen grain (> 40 μm; Vonhof & Harder, 1995). We also expect that small and medium pollen grains to be wind-pollinated and that larger pollen grains to be mostly animal-pollinated. But this is controversial. Smaller sizes are suggested to reduce the settling velocity and, thus, increase the dispersal distance of the pollen (Niklas, 1992). However, various mechanisms exist to increase dispersal distances by reducing pollen mass, such as the presence of air sacs of many conifers (Ackerman, 2000; Schwendemann <i>et al.</i> , 2007) Pollen size has been found to be affected by chromosome ploidy level, environmental factors, and flower characters, among others (Muller, 1979; Stroo, 2000) and may determine reproductive and seed-siring success as large pollen grains have higher chances of successful fertilization because their size determines the growth				
Shape oblate, prolate, spheroidal	rate of pollen tubes (Cruzan, 1990; Ejsmond et al., 2011) <i>Dispersal:</i> There is evidence that suggests that spherical pollen grains are more present in wind-pollinated plants (Niklas, 1985b; Vaknin et al., 2008). In addition, spherical pollen grains dispersed further (Niklas, 1985b; Jackson & Myford, 1999; Ackerman, 2000). The relationship between oblate and prolate pollen grain shapes and dispersal type is not clear. Pollen shape does not seem to play a major role in preferences of forage sources (e.g. honeybees on <i>Cossynium Hissultur</i> ; Vaissière & Vinson 1994)				
Aperture types and number	<i>Tolerance to drought</i> : Pollen tolerance to drought may be indicated by the presence of apertures (furrows, pores;				
Innaparture (0)	Fig. 2; Moore et al., 2008, Franchi et al., 2011). Apertures are structural elements that allow variation in the				
Colpate (1, 2, 3, > 3)	pollen volume with changing moisture conditions (Franchi <i>et al.</i> , 2011)				
Porate $(1, 2, 3, > 3)$	Pollen grains with low desiccation tolerance ('recalcitrant') and furrows are usually absent and there may be an				
Colporate $(1, 2, 3, > 3)$	Pollen grains with high desiccation tolerance ('orthodox'), furrows are usually present				
Presence of sculptures (exine) Psilate, Perforate (micro- and macro-); Reticulate; Rugulate; Striate; Gemmate; Verrucate; Echinate	<i>Dispersal</i> : Pollen wall sculptures (e.g. perforate, reticulate, and rugulate) may be affected by pollination syndrome (reviewed in Hesse <i>et al.</i> , 2000; Konzmann <i>et al.</i> , 2019). Rich ornamentation is associated with entomophily (Vaknin <i>et al.</i> , 2000; Hu <i>et al.</i> , 2008). Sculpturing plays an important role in attachment to insect pollinators and to the stigma of the flower				
	Wind-pollinated species often lack elaborate sculptures and appear smooth (i.e. psilate). But, this is controversial as the presence of sculptures on the pollen wall is suggested to be a specific feature for each plant taxon (Pacini & Hesse, 2012)				
Dispersal unit (e.g. monad, tetrad)	<i>Dispersal</i> : Pollen grains are generally dispersed as monads (single grains) and tetrads (four grains derived from the same meiocyte; Pacini & Franchi, 1999). In addition, some pollen grains present a fluid called pollenkitt. This fluid glues the pollen grains together and forms clumps of both monads and tetrads (e.g. Ericaceae) Monad pollen is a common characteristic for both entomophilous and anemophilous taxa (Chaloner, 1986). However, pollenkitt is typically present in almost all zoophilous plants (Pacini & Hesse, 2005)				
Wall thickness (exine)	Tolerance to drought: The function of the wall is considered to be mainly protection against adverse				
$< 2 \mu m$	environmental conditions such as desiccation and UV radiation (found in fungal spores also). Reduced wall				
> 2 µm	thickness has been considered to be an advantage for taxa living in humid, moist, or even wet environments. The advantage consists of a rapid germination due to the short rehydration time (Pacini & Hesse, 2012)				

Terminology used for the six pollen traits (pollen size, shape, apertures, sculptures, dispersal unit, and wall thickness) follows the Palynological Database-PalDat (https://paldat.org) and Halbritter et al. (2018).

*We use the concept pollen dispersal to refer to how far for example airborne pollen grains may travel before being deposited (Yao et al., 2022).

not currently parameterized within paleo-ecosystem models. Furthermore, many of the key functional traits conferring resilience to drought highlighted below (Table 1) are stronger 'response' traits than 'effect' traits.

2. Seed size and shape

Here, we consider the traits of seeds as they enter the soil or a suitable depositional environment and do not include the fruit or dispersal structures (Fig. 2) associated with the seed as these are much less likely to be preserved in the fossil record. There is an enormous (11 orders of magnitude) variation in seed size among extant plants (Moles et al., 2005a). Still, biases imposed by the

fossilization process and factors that influence the movement of seeds into suitable depositional environments are all likely to filter the full range of paleo-seed diversity (Sims & Cassara, 2009). Despite the fact that the fossil record is imperfect, the function of seeds to protect and transport the embryo means that of all plant parts, seeds are very well represented as fossils. Seed size is one of six plant traits selected for its global significance in defining the functional bauplan of extant plants (Diaz et al., 2016); it defines a trade-off between the seedling survival and colonization potential and is strongly correlated with plant height (Diaz et al., 2016). Seeds are usually discrete units but there are exceptions. Seed size, shape, and structure, especially, have been shown to be good indicators of seed persistence in the soil in some biomes (Thompson *et al.*, 1993; Diaz & Cabido, 1997; Leishman & Westoby, 1998; Peco *et al.*, 2003), which in turn plays a major role in the survival of species in time and space (Christoffoleti & Caetano, 1998). For example, rounder seeds with lower shape values (closer to 0 than to 1) tend to be buried deeper into the soil and seed bank and persist longer (Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013). Interestingly, small seed size is likely underrepresented in the fossil record (Sims & Cassara, 2009), and fossil seed assemblages often contain seeds from species that have travelled long distances and are not therefore representative of the local flora (Collinson, 1983; Burnham, 1990), suggesting considerable taphonomic filtering at play.

In extant plants, seed size (sometimes referred to as mass) is measured by oven-dry mass (Moles et al., 2005a; Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013) and seed shape is defined by its variance in three dimensions (x, y, z - thickness, width, length; Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013). In fossil plants, seed shape can still be defined by its variance in two to three dimensions using a range of microscopy and micro-CT methods (DeVore et al., 2006). Once characterized, seed size and shape can be used beyond taxonomic characterization (DeVore et al., 2006; Matsunaga et al., 2019) and open a window on the functional ecology of the whole plant in the absence of other articulated fossil plant parts. However, taphonomic biases should be considered (Sims & Cassara, 2009). For example, seed mass is strongly correlated with genome size (Beaulieu et al., 2007), growth form (Moles et al., 2005a,b; Beaulieu et al., 2007), dispersal syndrome (Moles et al., 2005a,b), plant lifespan (Moles et al., 2005b), and weakly correlated with net primary production (Moles et al., 2005a). Seed size and shape trait yielded a relatively high paleo-functional trait score in our semiqualitative analyses (10) but low ESE and ESI scores due to the fact that correlations between this trait and Earth system processes such as photosynthesis are weak and because the functional attributes that correlate strongly with seed size such as dispersal and plant lifespan are not currently parameterized within paleo-ecosystem models (Fig. 3; Table S1).

3. Dispersal syndrome

Dispersal syndromes (Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013) are seed, fruit, or spore morphologies (referred to collectively as disseminules) and the associated modifications that enhance the probability of being dispersed away from the parent plant and characterize a distinct mode of dispersal (Hughes et al., 1994). Such syndromes are known to facilitate dispersal via flotation in water, by animal consumption, or by wind, among other modes. Dispersal by gravity will be excluded from this review as no specialized adaptations are required for this mode (Castro et al., 2010; McLoughlin & Pott, 2019). Where dispersal syndrome can be distinguished based on fossil disseminule morphology, it potentially provides useful insights into fossil species biogeographic limits and biotic interactions within paleo-ecosystems even in the absence of body fossils of the disperser (Robledo-Arnuncio et al., 2014; Aslan et al., 2019; Wojewódzka et al., 2019; Rojas et al., 2022).

Dispersal syndrome can be directly inferred from morphological observations of fossils and comparisons with relevant extant examples. Reproductive architectures like the rain-splash cups that accommodate water dispersal seen in liverworts are also found in Cooksonia, one of the earliest land plants, although the dispersal syndromes of the spores themselves remain unspecified (Briggs & Crowther, 2008; Murray, 2012; Medina & Estebanez, 2014). Hypothesized plant-insect mutualism is proposed for Permian lycopsid megaspores based on the presences of external starch structures (elaiosomes; Liu et al., 2018). Dispersal syndrome at the ecosystem scale can be indirectly inferred from dental adaptations (Norconk et al., 1998; Guimarães et al., 2008), and coprolites (Habgood et al., 2003). Spore phytophagy in insects is hypothesized for some Carboniferous lycopsids (Chaloner, 1984), providing early evidence for the potential evolution of a dispersal syndrome based on plant-animal interaction. Combinations of direct and indirect evidence, seed morphology, and availability, inferred from the coprolite record, have helped identify deep-time frugivore diets (Dutta & Ambwani, 2007) and contextualize ecological shifts in more recent ecosystems (Boast et al., 2018; Heinen et al., 2023).

Spatial resolution poses a problem for inference of dispersal syndrome. Any disseminule can be transported accidentally via a prevalent dispersal type regardless of the disseminule's adaptive morphology (Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013), and this limitation is magnified for fossils. For example, nonfrugivorous animals consume a wide array of plants and unintentionally disperse fleshy seeds, carrying them long distances regardless of whether the dispersal syndrome is adapted for long or short distances, biasing inferences from the fossil record (Green et al., 2021). Other taphonomic processes such as preburial filtering, reworking, and transport (allochthonous assemblages) can also make the time and place of origin of fossil disseminules unclear. Fossil disseminules may be disintegrated or ruptured, requiring reconstruction, and interfering with syndrome inferences. Nonetheless, evidence of ornamentation or detachment scars from detached fossil appendages (e.g. wings; Fig. 2) can aid in classification (McLoughlin & Pott, 2019). However, even direct morphological inferences of paleo-ecological function may be prone to error (Green et al., 2021). For example, dissimilar fern spore morphologies are anemochorous (Gómez-Noguez et al., 2017), are unexpectedly endozoochorous in certain ecosystems (Lovas-Kiss et al., 2018), and may function in other components of life history (see Table 1). Some important features of dispersal syndromes may be irrecoverable from fossils (i.e. smell, color, sticky textures/substances; Tiffney, 2004). However, successful development of fossil color biomarkers in dinosaur feathers (McNamara et al., 2021) and the observation that nano-surface structures on extant flowers influence petal color (Moyroud et al., 2017) suggest that future advances may allow inference on some of these usually hidden features. In the absence of direct observation of dispersal per se, inference of the function of particular structures and dispersal syndromes in the fossil record may therefore be unclear in many cases. This complexity is reflected by the fact that multiple dispersal syndromes have been proposed for some plant groups including Permian Glossopteris (Klavins 8 Review

et al., 2001; McLoughlin & Prevec, 2021), fossil Cycas (Murray, 2012; Liu et al., 2021), and fleshy seeds in general (e.g. Ginkgo; van der Pijl, 1969; Tiffney, 1984; Mack, 2000; Bolmgren & Eriksson, 2005; Del Tredici, 2007; Valenta & Nevo, 2020,

2022). Based on these considerations, we assigned modest paleofunctional trait (7.5) and ESE (5.6) scores for the trait 'dispersal syndrome' and low scores for ESI (0.56), because although undoubtedly the evolution of new dispersal traits through



Fig. 2 Examples of fossil plant functional traits. (a) Vein density trait illustrated for Permian Glossopteris from Esperança Júnior et al. (2023, reused with permission) Bar, 5 mm. (b) Leaf g_{max} trait (a function of stomatal density and pore geometry) illustrated on Cretaceous aged Podocarpaceae compression fossils (Pole & Philippe, 2010, reused with permission) Bar, 50 µm. (c) Spinescence trait (SI) illustrated for Eocene fossil twigs from Tibet (Zhang et al., 2022, reused under the terms of a CC-BY 4.0 license) Bar, 10 mm. (d) Leaf mass per area (LMA) trait illustrated on cross-section of Jurassic fossil Ginkgo leaf estimated from measurements of cuticle thickness (Soh et al., 2017, reused with permission) Bar, 10 µm. (e) Salinity trait illustrated by the ghost presence of CaOx globules (interpreted as druses) on late Oligocene aged Quercus neriifolia impression fossils (Malekhosseini et al., 2022, reused under the terms of a CC-BY 4.0 license) Bar, 200 µm, inset = 40 µm. (f) Plant height trait can be estimated from fossil trunk diameter on in situ fossil tree stumps such as illustrated from the Triassic of Antarctica (Cúneo et al., 2003, reused with permission) pen Bar, 14 cm. (g) Bark thickness trait illustrated on Early Carboniferous fossil tree from Australia (Decombeix, 2013, reused with permission) showing successive zones of periderm layers, Bar, 2 mm. (h) Palatability trait measured from the ratio of presence of feeding damage as illustrated by large circular hole feeding on fossil dicot leaf species (Currano et al., 2008, reused with permission, copyright (2008) National Academy of Sciences) Bar, 11 mm. (i) Xylem conductivity trait measured from xylem pit membrane (arrow), pit orientation, and abundance shown here on longitudinal sections of polished pyritized Eocene fossil twigs of Pityoxylon (Grimes et al., 2002, reused with permission). (j) Cuticle trait illustrated using autofluorescent properties of Cretaceous aged Angiosperm cuticles (LK-B-55) from West Greenland highlighting secretory trichomes (pellucid dots; C Fay, JC McElwain, & S Robinson, unpublished) Bar, 100 µm. (k) Pollen trait indicating resistance to drought by the presence of furrows illustrated here for recent Citrus lanatus (Franchi et al., 2011, reused with permission) Bar, 10 µm. (I) Dispersal syndrome illustrated in winged fossil fruits of Eocene aged Bridgesia bovayensis (Manchester & O'Leary, 2010, reused with permission) scale bar in mm. (m) LMA trait based on petiole thickness illustrated for Eocene Alnus parvifolia from Royer et al. (2007), reused with permission) Bar, 1 cm. (n) Life history and maximum plant lifespan can be indirectly inferred from fossil ring width measurements illustrated here in Jurassic permineralized fossil wood Protophyllocladoxylon from Vajda et al. (2016, reused under the terms of a CC-BY 3.0 license) Bar, 100 µm; (o) Photosynthetic pathway is a syndrome of traits, one of which, cuticle pegs (spandrels) are observed here on the inner surface of the adaxial leaf epidermis of Cretaceous Frenelopsis teixeirae compression fossils (Mendes et al., 2010; reused with permission) Bar, 200 μm. (p) Mesophyll conductance (g_m) trait can be inferred from mesophyll cell wall thickness within anatomically preserved fossil leaves as illustrated here in a permineralized conifer scale leaf of Cunninghamia lanceolata from Brink et al. (2009), reused with permission) Bar, 0.5 mm.



Fig. 3 Comparison of paleo-functional trait scores according to different weighting criteria. (a) Paleo-functional trait (PT in Fig. 1; Supporting Information Table S1) score plots the consensus results of the author team's semi-quantitative evaluation (Fig. 1; Table S1) of how taphonomic bias and methodology of trait measurement influence trait values in fossil plants. Higher PT scores indicate less taphonomic bias and more robust methods of trait estimation. (b) Earth System effect (ESE in Fig. 1; Table S1; ESE = PT × v) score plots the results of the PT score weighted by the author team's semi-quantitative evaluation of the strength of effect of the paleo-trait on the Earth system, with higher scores indicating greater impact. (c) Earth system implementation (Earth system implementation (ESI) in Fig. 1; Table S1; ESI = ESE × vi) score adjusts the results of the ESE score according to the current capacity to parameterize the paleo-trait and its impact on the Earth system within paleo-ecosystem models. Higher ESI scores indicate greater potential application of the paleo-trait to address questions in relation to Earth system processes.

geological time (e.g. the first seed plants in the Devonian and angiosperms in the Cretaceous) influenced biotic interactions and dispersal potential, the 'effect' of such traits on Earth system processes cannot explicitly be quantified within paleo-ecosystem models (Fig. 3; Table S1). This is an interesting research gap that warrants further study.

VI. Fossil leaf functional traits

1. Leaf mass per area

Leaf mass per area (in g m⁻²), also referred to as specific leaf area (SLA = 1/LMA), is calculated for extant plants by dividing the dry mass by the area of one side of a fresh leaf (Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013). LMA is a leaf economic trait, which, together with LL, leaf nitrogen concentration (LNC), photosynthetic rate (Amass), and respiration rate collectively, reflect the spectrum of ways in which a leaf can be constructed, maintained, and operated as primary photosynthetic structure (Wright et al., 2004; Reich, 2014). LMA is one of the most readily measured and useful plant functional traits within the leaf economic spectrum. Broadly speaking, low LMA leaves such as those of extant deciduous trees (median = 75 g m⁻²) tend to grow faster, have higher A_{mass} and stomatal conductance (g_s) , have less carbon investment in structural tissues, shorter LL, and higher LNC; the corollary is observed for leaves with high LMA such as evergreen gymnosperms (median = 227 g m^{-2}), which invest heavily in structural tissues, have long LLs but the trade-off is lower LNC and A_{mass} per mass (Wright et al., 2004; Poorter et al., 2009). Collectively, leaf economic spectrum traits, including LMA, are important predictors of ecosystem-scale processes such as productivity (Chapin 3rd, 2003; Poorter & Bongers, 2006), decomposition and nutrient cycling (see Decomposition; Cornwell et al., 2008), herbivory (see Leaf Palatability; Currano et al., 2008), and water use efficiency (WUE; Soh et al., 2019). They have already been utilized in fossil plants to infer paleo-life history (e.g. pace of life; Blonder et al., 2014) and whole plant ecological strategy (e.g. stress tolerator, Soh et al., 2019), but such inferences are complex (Kelly et al., 2021; see Section VII).

Fresh leaf area and dry mass cannot be directly measured in fossils due to dehydration, shrinkage, compression, and selective loss of internal leaf tissues that occur during fossilization. Furthermore, taphonomic factors likely strongly bias the fossil record against the preservation of low LMA taxa due to the low abundance of carbonrich structural compounds resulting in greater mechanical damage during transport to a depositional environment (Bacon et al., 2016). Despite these challenges, numerous independent proxy methods have been developed to quantify paleo-LMA from adaxial epidermal density (Haworth & Raschi, 2014), leaf petiole width (Royer et al., 2007, 2010; Peppe et al., 2014; Fig. 2), and leaf cuticle thickness (Soh et al., 2017; Fig. 2), all of which scale positively with LMA. Multiple trait models that include leaf ¹³C, petiole width, and epidermal cell area have also been developed to predict paleo-LMA and paleo-canopy position (Cheesman et al., 2020). High LMA leaves have a greater investment in structural tissues, higher densities of smaller cells, larger petioles to mechanically support leaves that have thicker tissue layers (including cuticle), and/or more dense tissue. Application of paleo-LMA methods to fossil plants has enabled functional classification of extinct genera (Soh et al., 2017; Wilson et al., 2017), assessment of extinction selectivity associated with mass extinction events (Blonder et al., 2014; Soh et al., 2017; Butrim et al., 2022), and appraisal of herbivore-plant interactions (Currano et al., 2008) among many others. Not surprisingly, therefore, LMA

scored highly as a paleo-functional trait (8) and ESE Trait (6.4) and yielded high ESI scores in our evaluation as it is among a few functional traits currently parameterized in paleo-ecosystem models (Fig. 3; Table S1).

2. Leaf lifespan and duration of green foliage

Leaf lifespan, or the period of time for which a leaf is alive and physiologically active, as well as duration of green foliage, is useful in understanding a plant's nutrient use strategy, life history, leaf decomposability, palatability, and canopy position (Aerts, 1995; Wright et al., 2004). Leaf lifespan covaries with LMA, Amass, and gs (Wright et al., 2004; Poorter et al., 2009). The duration of green foliage is important in the hydrological cycle, for productivity and Earth albedo effects, and should be included where possible within paleo-ecosystem models (Matthaeus et al., 2023). Shorter-lived leaves tend to show resource allocation toward high photosynthetic rates and have lower investment in C-rich lignified tissues, whereas longer-lived leaves are often lignin-rich and tend to allocate resources toward leaf protection (Reich et al., 1991). Longer-lived leaves decompose more slowly due to a higher proportion of structurally complex tissue, but they tend to sink in water faster than leaves with lower LMA (Greenwood & Donovan, 1991; Gastaldo, 2001). This may provide a taphonomic bias toward leaves with a long lifespan in fossil litter deposits preserved in situ (Bacon et al., 2016; e.g. volcanic ash deposits) but toward leaves with a much shorter lifespan in fossil assemblages filtered by transport via water (e.g. lake deposits).

Leaf physiognomy (size and shape) and abscission scars (Thomas & Cleal, 1999) have traditionally been used to characterize whether a fossil leaf is deciduous or evergreen; however, these parameters provide mixed signals in relation to LL. Thick leaves, small leaf surface area, and thick cuticles in combination are typically associated with an evergreen habit (Thomas & Cleal, 1999; Falcon-Lang & Cantrill, 2001), but there are many exceptions and leaf thickness cannot be measured easily in fossils. Entire margins, drip tips, and leaf size are associated with tropical rainforests, which have an evergreen canopy but with varied LL (Burnham & Johnson, 2004). Fossil growth ring anatomy may be a better way to assess LL in fossils; leaf traces within the rings of juvenile stems or branches differ between deciduous and evergreen conifers (Falcon-Lang & Cantrill, 2001). In some cases, anatomically preserved leaf traces can show a number of growth ring increments indicating the longevity of a particular leaf (Falcon-Lang & Cantrill, 2001). However, this method is not widely applicable due to difficulties associated with preservation and sample preparation (Falcon-Lang & Cantrill, 2001). Furthermore, a precise age estimate is not possible for LLs of < 1 yr. The markedness of the growth ring boundary in trunk woods may also be used to estimate LL in anatomically preserved coniferopsids (Falcon-Lang, 2000a,b; Falcon-Lang & Cantrill, 2001), but the method requires wellpreserved specimens, which lack growth abnormalities (Falcon-Lang & Cantrill, 2001). Both methods using growth ring anatomy also require the assumption that distinct growth rings represent annual increments, which may not be the case.

The most fruitful route for obtaining LL estimates from fossils comes from leaf trait relationships within the leaf economics

spectrum; in particular with LMA (Wright et al., 2004; Poorter et al., 2009; see LMA section above). While the leaf LL-LMA relationship is significant (positive), it is also noisy, showing a shallower response along an environmental gradient (e.g. increasing aridity, temperature, and irradiance; Wright et al., 2004; Royer et al., 2010). Therefore, it is more appropriate to infer LL from LMA at an assemblage level to avoid over-interpreting LMA estimates of individual taxa (Royer et al., 2010; Soh et al., 2017). Chemical characterization of fossil leaf waxes may also prove useful in the development of novel LL proxies in the future (García-Plazaola et al., 2015; Leide et al., 2020). Large differences are observed between n-alkane abundance in angiosperms and gymnosperms, and within these groups, a higher abundance of nalkanes is associated with longer-lived leaves (Diefendorf et al., 2011). However, when considered in a broader phylogenetic context, these differences appeared to be less pronounced (Diefendorf et al., 2015). Further work incorporating more detailed descriptors of LL (as opposed to just 'evergreen' or 'deciduous'; Diefendorf et al., 2015), as well as a more comprehensive leaf chemical characterization (Leide *et al.*, 2020) are thus needed. High scores were assigned to LL across all the categories in our semi-quantitative analyses as although taphonomic biases toward certain LL trait values are highly probable, because these biases are well known for different depositional environments, associated errors can be constrained (Fig. 3; Table S1). Overall, the potential of using LL as a paleofunctional trait (score = 5.2) ranked slightly lower than LMA because the methods of estimating LL trait values from fossils are not as well developed as those for LMA despite both traits having equal strength of impact on the Earth system (Figs 3, 4; Table S1).

3. Leaf nitrogen concentration

Leaf nitrogen concentration (LNC) refers to the total amount of N per unit dry leaf mass expressed in mg g^{-1} (or sometimes as % dry leaf mass; Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013). N is essential for protein (such as photosynthetic enzymes) and nucleotide synthesis (Moreau et al., 2019). Despite its abundance in the environment, N is one of the most limiting plant nutrients, often existing as forms inaccessible to plants such as N2, NO3-, and NH4+ (Aerts & Chapin, 1999; Jia & von Wiren, 2020). As such, LNC measurements can provide valuable insights into plant ecology and physiology (Chapin, 1980) and it is considered an important plant functional trait. Leaf N concentration correlates negatively with LL (Reich et al., 1992; Wright et al., 2004), positively with Amass (Field & Mooney, 1986; Wright et al., 2004), and negatively with LMA (Wright et al., 2004). These relationships within the leaf economic spectrum represent the trade-off between investment in structural tissue and allocation of N to RuBisCO, though longlived leaves tend to have lower LNC and vice versa (Wright et al., 2004; Luo et al., 2021).

LNC can be measured directly from extant and compression fossil plant material using elemental analysis (White *et al.*, 2020). Currently, however, the fate of LNC during diagenesis and fossilization is not well known. Loss of internal leaf structures and leaching of solutes during the fossilization process (Haworth &

Raschi, 2014) could severely alter the original trait values. Pyrolysis experiments have been used to simulate the chemical changes that take place within leaves due to diagenesis (Mosle et al., 1997) and would be equally valuable to assess the fate of LNC during fossilization. Pilot LNC measurements on compression fragments of Late Pennsylvanian fossil taxa have yielded promising results that plot within the trait values of modern LNC (Matthaeus et al., 2023) and are in line with expectations based on their other paleo-leaf economic spectrum traits but further systematic investigation is required. A likely future challenge in establishing direct protocols for measuring fossil LNC will be to collect adequate amounts of compression fossil material (a minimum of 1 mg of ground-up sample material is required; Aslam et al., 2012). Fossil LNC could also be estimated indirectly using trait relationships with LMA. However, paleo-LMA is also subject to diagenetic effects and reliance on indirect inference could mask the detection of unusual trait combinations that may have arisen during plant evolution but are no longer present in extant plants Based on these considerations, the authors attributed paleo-functional trait, ESE, and ESI scores of 6.5, 5.2, and 5.2, respectively (Figs 3, 4; Table S1).

4. Maximum theoretical stomatal conductance

Maximum theoretical stomatal conductance (gmax, sometimes referred to as G_{max} or g_{smax}) is a measure of the total diffusive stomatal area available for the exchange of CO2 and water vapor into and out of the leaf respectively and assumes that all stomatal pores on the leaf (or photosynthetic stem) are open to their maximum geometry (circle or ellipse). gmax can be calculated from extant and fossil plants by combining measurements of stomatal density, stomatal pore length (to calculate maximum pore area), and guard cell width into the equation of Parlange & Waggoner (1970) modified by Franks & Beerling (2009; Fig. 2). Maximum geometry of the stomatal pore is estimated by fitting an ellipse (Lawson et al., 1998) or circle, using stomatal pore length (m) as the long axis (diameter) and m/2 as the short axis. Because all stomata on a leaf surface are never fully open to a maximum circular or elliptic geometry in field conditions, gmax is considered a theoretical maximum rate (Dow et al., 2014; McElwain et al., 2016). Stomatal opening behavior is dynamic (Lawson & Vialet-Chabrand, 2019) and patchy (Weyers & Lawson, 1997) across the leaf surface and the degree of dynamism, coordination, and patchiness varies across evolutionary groups (Brodribb & McAdam, 2011), meaning that no living plant operates at its theoretical maximum. Extensive field surveys of woody angiosperm trees and laboratory-based measurements of a broad range of evolutionary groups demonstrate that living plants operate (g_{op} and referred to as g_s) at around from 25% (Franks) to 26% (Murray et al., 2020) of their g_{max} value. It is therefore possible to estimate the operational stomatal conductance (g_{op}) of extinct fossil plants to both CO₂ (g_{CO2}) and water vapor $(g_{H2O}; 1.6 \text{ times } g_{CO2})$ using the g_{max} trait (McElwain *et al.*, 2016). As functional plant traits, g_{max} and g_{op} provide vital insights into a fossil plant's likely ecological strategy within a paleo-community as $g_{\rm op}$ correlates strongly with photosynthetic rate (reviewed in Berry et al., 2010; Medlyn et al., 2011) and other key traits in the leaf economic spectrum (Kröber et al., 2015) including LMA (Soh



Fig. 4 A ranked list of paleo-functional traits that can be applied to fossil plants. (a) Ranked list of paleo-functional traits based on Earth system implementation (ESI) scores illustrating the rank order of traits with the highest (photosynthetic rate) to lowest (salinity tolerance) potential application to the plant fossil record as evaluated by the author team. (b) Bi-plot illustrating the breakdown of components within the final trait ranking shown in panel a, where the horizontal axis shows the Earth system effect (ESE) score (in Fig. 1; Supporting Information Table S1; ESE = PT × v) and the vertical axis is the implementation multiplier (vi in Fig. 1; Table S1).

et al., 2019; Wu *et al.*, 2020), LNC (Schulze *et al.*, 1994; Juhrbandt *et al.*, 2004), and LL (Poorter & Bongers, 2006), and also whole plant WUE (Soh *et al.*, 2019). Based on the relative ease with which g_{max} can be measured across various modes of plant fossil preservation (McElwain & Steinthorsdottir, 2017) and the fact that it constrains understanding of paleo-productivity (Franks & Beerling, 2009; Wilson *et al.*, 2015; McElwain *et al.*, 2016), the hydrological cycle at local to global levels (Steinthorsdottir *et al.*, 2012; Jasechko *et al.*, 2013; White *et al.*, 2020), and fossil plant WUE (Reichgelt *et al.*, 2020), we evaluate it here as a paleo-plant functional trait with strong potential application to a range of research questions relating to plant–climate and plant–atmosphere evolution and Earth system processes in general (Matthaeus *et al.*, 2023). Paleo-functional trait, ESE, and ESI scores of 9, 8.1, and 8.1 were, respectively assigned (Fig. 3; Table S1).

5. Water use efficiency

Water use efficiency is a measure of how water saving a plant is in relation to photosynthesis. Low values in the 20 to 40 μ mol mol⁻¹ range are typically observed in modern angiosperm trees of tropical everwet forest biomes while higher values (60 to 80 μ mol mol⁻¹) are recorded from desert plants and those from seasonally dry biomes (Soh *et al.*, 2019). Water use efficiency is an informative functional trait in relation to the hydrological cycle and hydroclimate generally in the deep past (White *et al.*, 2020) and allows broad characterization of paleo-biomes from fossil iWUE estimates of dominant taxa within paleo-ecosystems (Matthaeus *et al.*, 2023). Intrinsic water use efficiency (iWUE) is expressed as the ratio of photosynthesis (*A*) and leaf conductance to water vapor transfer (*g*) of which *g*, is the dominant component. It

can be calculated using stable carbon isotope ratios of modern and fossil plants according to the equation of Farquhar *et al.* (1982) below. However, in the case of fossils both the concentration and $\delta^{13}C_{air}$ of CO₂ cannot be measured directly and need to be inferred from proxies. Furthermore, differential preservation of fossil plant tissue can bias $\delta^{13}C_{plant}$ samples toward lighter or heavier values and must also be taken into account along with other sources of variability (Sheldon *et al.*, 2020). $\delta^{13}C_{air}$ in the geological past is estimated from temperature-sensitive equations (Romanek *et al.*, 1992) applied to measurements of $\delta^{13}C_{calcite}$ of marine brachiopods and their estimated paleo-temperature at the time of growth. Paleo-CO₂ concentration can be obtained from stomatalbased proxies applied to the same leaf or fossils within the same assemblage (McElwain & Steinthorsdottir, 2017) or other proxy CO₂ methods (CenCO₂PIP Consortium, 2023).

An isotope ratio mass spectrometer is used to determine the ratio of C^{13} : C^{12} in a living and fossil plant sample ($\delta^{13}C_{plant}$) (Farquhar *et al.*, 1982).

iWUE =
$$A/g = c_a(1-c_i/c_a)/1.6$$

= $c_a(1-(\Delta_{plant}-a)/(b-a))/1.6$

where $\Delta_{\text{plant}} = (\delta 13C_{\text{air}} - \delta 13C_{\text{plant}})/1 + (\delta 13C_{\text{plant}}/1000); c_i/c_a$ is calculated according to $\Delta_{\text{plant}} = a + (b-a)$ (c_i/c_a), where *a* is fractionation due to diffusion in air (=4.4\) and *b* is net fractionation caused by carboxylation (=27\%); $\delta^{13}C_{\text{air}} =$ the stable isotope ratio of CO₂ in the air at the time the leaf developed; $c_a = \text{CO}_2$ concentration of the atmosphere at the time of leaf development.

An alternative method of estimating iWUE of fossil taxa is from model estimates of photosynthesis (A) and stomatal conductance (g_s) $(A/g_s = WUE)$ that can be derived from biochemical proxy CO₂ models (Franks et al., 2014) using a methodology fully described in Reichgelt et al. (2020) or inferred from multiple traits that are directly measurable on fossilized stems (stem hydraulic conductance; Wilson et al., 2015) and leaves (vein density (VD) to infer A and G_{max}; McElwain et al., 2016; Murray et al., 2019, 2020) and integrated to get a picture of the whole plant WUE (see detailed discussion in Wilson et al., 2015). Our semi-quantitative analysis of iWUE yielded high paleo-functional trait scores (9) as this trait can be measured using multiple independent methods but lower ESE scores (6.75) because the trait is a ratio, and it is difficult to quantify its impact on the Earth system as this requires disentangling the combined impacts of photosynthesis and transpiration. A lower ESI score (3.37) reflects the fact that the trait is an output of paleoecosystem models rather than an input.

6. Photosynthetic rate

The light-saturated CO₂ assimilation rate (A_{max}) represents the theoretical potential of a leaf's photosynthetic capacity. Canopy-scale assimilation, which influences the organic C cycle, is proportional to A_{max} (Wilson *et al.*, 2017). Well-established correlations with other parameters of the world-wide leaf economics spectrum (Wright *et al.*, 2004), such as LMA (see leaf mass per area) and N_{mass} (see leaf nitrogen concentration) allow

indirect estimation of Amax from plant fossils. The mechanistic model proposed by Franks et al. (2014) may also be used to estimate $A_{\rm max}$ from plant fossils based on the photosynthetic activity of a modern ecophysiological analog (A_0) under ambient conditions (C_{a0}) , diffusive estimates of g_{max} (see Section V), and c_i/c_a as estimated from fossil carbon isotopes. Methods of estimating paleo-functional trait values which do not rely on the use of, or comparison with, modern ecophysiological analogs are preferable, however, especially for extinct species with unusual trait combinations that have no appropriate modern equivalents. Alternatively, A_0 can be indirectly estimated from fossils by measuring leaf venation properties $(D_v, D_m; McElwain et al., 2016)$ and g_{max} . The Franks model relies on a linear correlation between photosynthetic carbon gain and C_a , which may not be physiologically accurate in some cases (McElwain, 2018). This trait was identified as the trait with the highest potential as a paleo-functional trait (score = 9) as it can be estimated from multiple methods and is currently parameterized in paleo-ecosystem models, yielding a high ESI score (9) (Figs 3, 4; Table S1).

7. Leaf cuticle traits

The leaf cuticle membrane is denser than wood (Onoda et al., 2012) and because of its unique acid and enzymaticresistant qualities is exceptionally well preserved in the plant fossil record (McElwain & Chaloner, 1996). The cuticle of all plants functions to protect the plant against water loss via transpiration (Zeisler & Schreiber, 2016). Although cuticular conductance (g_{\min}) is low relative to stomatal conductance (g_{op}) , it varies widely among extant plants (Duursma et al., 2019; Slot et al., 2021) and is critical to whole plant function and survival during heatwaves and drought when stomata are closed but low quantities of transpiration water loss still occur. Ultimately, the permeability of cuticle to water molecules and resistance of cuticles to water loss is dependent on both physical and chemical (e.g. waxes) attributes, which can be readily determined in fossils. The chemical composition of waxes and their distribution are considered the most important determinants of cuticular water loss, with long-chain n-alkanes playing a particularly important role (Leide et al., 2007), and both can be measured in compression fossils. Additional cuticular traits can be determined for fossil cuticle samples using their autofluorescent properties (Fig. 2j); these analyses yield chemoecological data in relation to plant-insect interactions via chemical signaling to pollinators, seed dispersers, and prey and on secondary metabolites defense against UV-B radiation (reviewed in García-Plazaola et al., 2015; Leide et al., 2020). For example, strong autofluorescence in the blue (emission at 475 nm) under excitation with UV light (360 nm) can signal the presence of UV-protecting compounds such as coumarin (García-Plazaola et al., 2015; Jardine et al., 2019).

Physical cuticle traits including thickness, density, and mechanical properties (tensile strength and modulus of elasticity) vary substantially across evolutionary groups (Onoda *et al.*, 2012) and show strong correlations with whole-leaf functional traits such as LMA and LL. Interesting trait trade-offs have been observed for cuticle alone. For example, cuticle thickness is not correlated with

cuticular conductance, suggesting that thickness does not play a role in reducing water loss; however, thick cuticles have higher tensile strength (Onoda et al., 2012) and are positively correlated with LL. This suggests that thick cuticles contribute to the overall mechanical strength of long-lived leaves (Onoda et al., 2012) and could therefore be a route to estimating LL of fossils from cuticle fragments. Despite the fact that the cuticle membrane of leaves is thin compared with the total leaf thickness, because it is dense, it contributes substantially to overall LMA (Onoda et al., 2012). It is unsurprising, therefore, that cuticle thickness has been developed as a paleo-LMA proxy (Soh et al., 2017; Fig. 2d). Techniques for extracting and observing fossil cuticle are reviewed in Kerp & Bomfleur (2011). The abundance of cuticle in the fossil record and the range of significant functional characteristics that can be inferred for the whole plant from fossil cuticle fragments resulted in a high paleo-functional trait score (9.5) but low ESE score (2.85) because its influence on reflectivity and water relations cannot be easily quantified currently, nor are these attributes parametrized within paleo-ecosystem models (Fig. 3; Table S1).

8. Vein density

Venation architecture shows diverse patterns across different phylogenetic groups and across evolutionary time, applying functional constraints on hydraulic conductance and indirectly on photosynthetic rate, as well as providing mechanical stability (Roth-Nebelsick et al., 2001; Boyce et al., 2009; Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013; Sack et al., 2013). Leaf VD (the length of veins per unit leaf area) is therefore a functional, measurable leaf trait in megaphyll leaves playing an important role in ecosystem processes such as transpiration and productivity. On a global scale, VD influences the carbon and hydrological cycle (Boyce et al., 2009). Vein density shows a high degree of phenotypic plasticity, showing adaptations to resource gradients (e.g. light, nutrient, and soil water availability) and environmental conditions (e.g. humidity and wind speed; Roth-Nebelsick et al., 2001; Sack & Scoffoni, 2013), and emerging work has demonstrated that vein conductivity can compensate for lower VD (Rockwell & Holbrook, 2017). Given these caveats, taphonomic biases should be taken into consideration when measuring VD traits in the geological past. The paleobotanical record is biased toward the preservation of certain leaf types (e.g. sun leaves) and toward the preservation of plants growing near lacustrine or fluvial environments (Van der Burgh, 1994; Ferguson, 2005). As VD is affected by both light and soil water availability, these taphonomic factors may lead to an overrepresentation of certain vein network traits in the fossil record. These can be controlled for, in part, by using proxies for leaf canopy placement such as epidermal undulation index (Kürschner, 1997), leaf ¹³C (Carvalho et al., 2021), and number of vein endings per leaf perimeter (Boyce, 2009).

Vein density is measurable on compression/impression leaf fossils and has been used extensively in taxonomic work and to infer paleoecophysiology (Uhl & Mosbrugger, 1999; Boyce *et al.*, 2009; Boyce *et al.*, 2010; Esperança Júnior *et al.*, 2023; Fig. 2a). VD can also be estimated on cross-sections of anatomically preserved leaf specimens from trait correlations with interveinal distance (Uhl & Mosbrugger, 1999). However, this is a less reliable parameter than leaf vein length per area (Uhl & Mosbrugger, 1999). Relatively unaltered fossil leaf remains can be prepared for VD measurements by clearing, following similar methods for modern material (Dilcher, 1974; Evans-FitzGerald *et al.*, 2016). For compression/impression fossils, various photography and lighting techniques can be employed (Kerp & Bomfleur, 2011) as well as latex or silicone molds (Barbosa & Muchagata, 2021) and transfers (Dilcher, 1974; Kouwenberg *et al.*, 2007). Vein density can be measured from photographed fossil specimens using digital tracing in image processing software provided there is sufficient contrast between the leaves' nonvenal tissue and vein network (Sack *et al.*, 2014). Additional difficulties can be caused by the surrounding matrix not being sufficiently fine to preserve small morphological features.

A denser vein network provides greater mechanical stability (Roth-Nebelsick et al., 2001). Therefore, VD may be useful to consider in the context of leaf strength and palatability traits (Vincent, 1990; Sack & Scoffoni, 2013). VD measurements are also used to model assimilation rates of fossil plants (Boyce & Zwieniecki, 2012; Blonder et al., 2014; McElwain et al., 2016; Wilson et al., 2017), to reconstruct paleo hydroclimate, to infer canopy position (Carvalho et al., 2021), and to estimate leaf size from fossil fragments (Sack et al., 2012). Vein density may also have some application as a paleo-functional trait in distinguishing different photosynthetic pathways as it is generally higher for C4 than C3 and crassulacean acid metabolism (CAM) plants (Sack & Scoffoni, 2013). Vein networks can however be highly threedimensional in the succulent leaves of CAM plants suggesting that VD would likely underestimate their conductive capacity (Ogburn & Edwards, 2013). Overall, VD is a thoroughly useful trait and our semi-quantitative assessment yielded high paleo-functional trait (10.5) and ESE scores (7.8) but lower ESI scores (3.9) (Fig. 1) because although this trait is important for the hydrological cycle/productivity, it is not currently directly parameterized within paleo-ecosystem models (Fig. 3; Table S1).

9. Mesophyll conductance

Mesophyll conductance $(g_m; \text{mol CO}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ s}^{-1})$ is the measure of CO₂ diffusion from the substomatal cavity through the mesophyll tissue to the site of carboxylation. Low mesophyll conductance can limit photosynthesis, and its relative importance varies significantly between different phylogenetic lineages and under different atmospheric compositions (Gago *et al.*, 2019; Yiotis & McElwain, 2019). In bryophytes, lycophytes, and in some CAM plants, g_m is the predominant limiting factor in photosynthetic capacity, whereas more evolutionarily recent lineages show a co-limitation between g_m and g_{op} (Males & Griffiths, 2017; Gago *et al.*, 2019; Yiotis & McElwain, 2019). As a functional trait, therefore, g_m has a bearing on the productivity of past ecosystems that depends on prevailing climatic and atmospheric conditions and dominant plant evolutionary group.

It should be measured using multiple different approaches in modern-day plants to obtain robust trait values (Flexas *et al.*, 2013). The principal methods to estimate g_m in living plants include chlorophyll fluorescence and gas exchange (Harley *et al.*, 1992), carbon isotope analysis (Evans *et al.*, 1986), and A/Ci curve fitting

(Ethier & Livingston, 2004), none of which can be applied to fossils. However, anatomical features, such as leaf mesophyll cell wall thickness and exposure of chloroplasts to cell perimeter (S_c/S), play an important role in constraining g_m and have been used as a basis to develop g_m proxies for permineralized and charcoalified fossil plants (Tomas *et al.*, 2013; Veromann-Jurgenson *et al.*, 2017; Carriqui *et al.*, 2019; Fig. 2p).

Anatomical data such as porosity, mesophyll cell width, cell wall thickness, and thickness of mesophyll tissue have also been used to model mesophyll conductance for well-preserved fossils (Roth-Nebelsick & Konrad, 2003; White et al., 2020). However, this type of preservation is exceptionally rare, and anatomically preserved specimens may also have undergone postburial deformation. Furthermore, while there is a good correlation between anatomy-based models and chlorophyll fluorescence/gas exchange approaches for extant plants, there are some discrepancies. Anatomical modelling tends to overestimate g_m in species with high LMA and underestimate it in species with low LMA (Tomas et al., 2013). In addition, uncertainties with anatomical approaches are increased when applied to fossils, as fewer parameters can be directly measured, and must be inferred from extant plants (e.g. using a scaling relationship between S_c/S and mesophyll surface area exposed to intercellular air spaces per unit of leaf area (S_m/S) in White et al. (2020)).

Other methods include the use of scaling relationships between $g_{\rm m}$ and photosynthetic rate ($A_{\rm n}$) to estimate $g_{\rm m}$ from paleoassimilation rate (see An; Niinemets et al., 2009; Franks et al., 2014; Veromann-Jurgenson et al., 2017; Gago et al., 2019), carbon isotopic technique which require measurements of g_{max} and δ^{13} C of a leaf fossil and δ^{13} C of the prevailing atmospheric CO₂ (Pons et al., 2009), and neurofuzzy logic model approaches for defining $g_{\rm m}$ from the inputs of leaf hydraulic conductance ($K_{\rm leaf}$) and LMA (Flexas et al., 2013). Isotopic approaches may be too difficult to resolve in the fossil record given that discrimination by g_m is so small compared with other drivers of variability in leaf δ^{13} C. In the case of the latter method as more traits (K_{leaf} and LMA and VD) are required to model g_m and those traits are typically observed in different fossil plant preservation modes, they may have weak predictive power (Flexas et al., 2013). Given some of the limitations to inferring g_m in fossils and its indirect impact on the Earth system (via photosynthesis), our analysis yielded relatively low scores for the $g_{\rm m}$ trait across all of the indicators developed (Fig. 3; Table S1).

10. Leaf palatability

Leaf palatability is one of the most widely studied functional traits in fossils (Royer *et al.*, 2007; Currano *et al.*, 2008). It is important for understanding biotic interaction, ecosystem productivity, and nutrient recycling in the deep past because palatable leaves are usually more nitrogen-rich (Currano & Jacobs, 2021). In modern plants, palatability is the measure of a model herbivore's preference for the leaves of certain plants, or the proportion of leaf area eaten (Dostalek *et al.*, 2020). This preference is affected by numerous underlying leaf-quality traits (Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2003, 2013). The suite of leaf traits that influence palatability also affect decomposability due to their similar constraints (low LNC, high concentration of lignin, and secondary metabolites); as a result, they are positively correlated (Grime *et al.*, 1996; Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013). There is a correlation between LMA and palatability: high LMA has been linked to lower nutrient concentrations and tougher leaves, which makes them less palatable to herbivores (Coley & Barone, 1996; Wright *et al.*, 2004; Royer *et al.*, 2007; Currano *et al.*, 2008).

It is important that herbivory damage in fossils is first distinguished from detritivory before palatability measurements are undertaken (Labandeira & Allen, 2007), as palatability only concerns the former. The four main criteria used to differentiate between the two are reviewed in Labandeira (1998). Palatability is quantified by the percentage or ratio of leaf area consumed vs total leaf area and then compared between species (Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013; Dostalek *et al.*, 2020). Williams & Abbott (1991) proposed using the total proportion damaged for a tree or stand instead of the average proportion damaged:

TPD =
$$\sum_{i=1}^{n} D_i / \sum_{i=1}^{n} T_i$$
, D = Damaged area, T = Total area

Alternatively, for fossil leaves, Currano *et al.* (2008) calculated the ratio of leaves with/without feeding damage instead of measuring the consumed leaf area ratio. This metric can be compared among fossil species for assemblages with diverse and well-preserved fossil floras, and between assemblages from the same depositional environments and likely similar taphonomic filtering of palatable/unpalatable leaf categories. The Currano *et al.* (2008) method is better suited to paleobotanical studies due to the general incompleteness of the fossil record and because true preference tests on leaf palatability cannot be undertaken for extinct herbivores.

On average, gap demanders are more palatable than shadetolerant plants, due to lower concentrations of tannins, lower tensile strength, and lower fiber content (Coley, 1987), whereas taxa with high LMA and LL are more well-defended (Wright et al., 2004). Ultraviolet-B absorbing compounds can also make plants unpalatable (Liu et al., 2023) and because UV-B dosage has changed dramatically in the geological past, especially at mass extinction boundaries and before the establishment of an ozone layer, it is important to couple palatability traits with those that allow inferences on canopy position (e.g. Carvalho et al., 2021) and UV-B dose (Jardine et al., 2019). Leaf palatability scored relatively highly in our analysis as a paleo-functional trait (7) because the taphonomic processes which can under- or overrepresent certain leaf categories in the fossil record are well studied. A lower ESE score was assigned because its impact on Earth system processes is difficult to quantify and implement within paleo-ecosystem models (Figs 3, 4; Table S1).

11. Photosynthetic pathway

There are three well-recognized photosynthetic pathways in terrestrial plants, C3, C4, and CAM, each of which is characterized by a broadly distinctive suite of associated biochemical, physiological, anatomical, and carbon isotopic traits that are collectively

referred to as trait syndromes (reviewed in Sage, 2017; Edwards, 2019, Box 1). CAM and C4 are carbon-concentrating photosynthetic pathways that originated and diversified in the Cenozoic according to molecular clock estimates (Sage, 2017; Edwards, 2019) but may have had multiple pre-Cenozoic origins in extinct lineages (Raven & Spicer, 1996; Green, 2010; Looy et al., 2021). Identifying the likely photosynthetic pathway of fossil plants relies mainly on anatomical (C4, C3, and CAM) and carbon isotopic (C4 and C3) traits; however, these can only rarely be measured from the same fossil sample and distinguishing CAM from C4 in fossils remains a challenge. Determining photosynthetic pathway is important from a functional traits perspective, because as a trait syndrome, it has consequences for overall productivity within the paleo-ecosystem, the timing and magnitude of water flux to the atmosphere (at night for CAM and in the day for C4 and C3), and for both the timing (in the day for C3 and C4 and night for CAM) and optimal conditions for photosynthesis (Sage, 2017; Edwards, 2019). C4 photosynthesis is found in hot, high-light, and dry environments, where photorespiration is increased due to high temperatures, while CAM photosynthesis is found in arid environments where mesophyll CO₂ concentrations are low due to stomatal closure and tissue succulence. In general, C4 plants have higher photosynthetic rates and productivity than C3 plants, while the opposite trend is found in CAM plants (Sage, 2017).

C4 photosynthesis takes place in modified, thickened bundle sheath cells that surround veins, which are rarely observable in fossils. High leaf bundle sheath : mesophyll ratio in C4 plants (Christin *et al.*, 2013; Edwards, 2019) could be indirectly inferred from high vein densities (see section V). C4 plants can also be distinguished from C3 plants based on their distinctive carbon isotopic signatures which range from – 10‰ to –14‰ under modern atmospheric δ^{13} C values of *c.* –8‰ compared with the C3 plants range of –21‰ to –35‰ (Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013).

Detecting CAM plants in the fossil record is more complex because their C isotopic values overlap with the ranges of both C3 and C4 depending on whether they are obligate (-10% to -15%) or facultative CAM (-10% to -30%; Winter et al., 2015; Edwards, 2019). Extant CAM plants typically have very high LMA values, which overlap with those of evergreen gymnosperms (Poorter et al., 2009). Despite this apparent complexity in definitively detecting CAM in the fossil record, there is a suite of leaf traits associated with obligate and 'strong' CAM plants (i.e. those with C3 + CAM that predominantly use CAM), which are potentially highly recognizable in a myriad of fossilization modes that warrant future coordinated research. These traits are functionally associated with either reducing water loss in arid environments (high iWUE) or facilitating water transport from water storage tissue and veins in succulent leaves and stems that have low leaf and/or stem g_m (Edwards, 2019). They include leaf succulence, long LL, large mesophyll cell size, low stomatal density, low intercellular air space and low g_m , thick cuticles with high hydrophobicity, thick inter-epidermal cuticular pegs (spandrels; Fig. 20) and intra-cuticular wax and often with Calcium oxalate crystals (druses), 3D leaf venation, leaves that are terete or

oblong in cross-section, extra-xylary vascular bundles (xylem and phloem tissue that are grouped into units of vascular tissue occurring in the pith outside of the main grouping of vascular bundles that occur in the stele) and photosynthetic phylloclades (modified flattened, usually photosynthetic, stem that is often subtended by a scale-like leaf; Bernardino-Nicanor *et al.*, 2012; Ogburn & Edwards, 2013; Males & Griffiths, 2017; Edwards, 2019; Niechayev *et al.*, 2019; Fig. 2). The extinct Cheirolepidiaceae conifers that were widespread in saline, arid, and humid environments in the Jurassic and Cretaceous (Gomez *et al.*, 2002; Mendes *et al.*, 2023) possess a number of potential CAM functional traits and may be a good target for further research. This syndrome of traits scored highly as paleo-functional traits and moderately as ESE traits in our semi-quantitative analysis (Fig. 3; Table S1).

VII. Fossil stem functional traits

1. Xylem conductivity

Xylem conductivity (K) is a measure of the capacity of xylem tissue to transport and supply water from roots to leaves. It is considered a master regulator of photosynthesis and plant productivity (Sperry et al., 2008; Brodribb, 2009) and damage to stem water-transport capacity plays an outsized role in plant mortality. Many plants can survive the temporary loss of conductivity in leaf and branch xylem, whereas stem damage can be fatal (Choat et al., 2012). The movement of water through xylem is a function of the anatomy of the xylem conduits and how resistant they are to flow (measured as plant, stem, or leaf conductance) and the negative water potential gradient between soil and leaves (Sperry et al., 2008). As water potential cannot be measured or inferred from fossil plants and multiple studies on extant plants have demonstrated the importance of xylem anatomy for whole plant water movement (Hacke et al., 2004; Pittermann et al., 2005, 2011; Feild et al., 2009, 2011; Schulte & Hacke, 2021), it follows that xylem conductivity (K) has emerged as a key functional trait in paleobotany (Cichan, 1986; Wilson & Knoll, 2010). Fossilized xylem conduits provide a timeline on both the evolution of xylem conductivity and on the appearance of novel safety-giving anatomies, which evolved to maintain water flow under changing environmental stressors (Niklas, 1985a; Kenrick & Crane, 1991, 1997; Friedman & Cook, 2000; Edwards et al., 2006; Wilson & Fischer, 2011; Strullu-Derrien et al., 2013; Wilson, 2016; Decombeix et al., 2019; Olson et al., 2021). Fossilized xylem anatomy has also been measured to infer potential vulnerability in water-conducting tissues to drought, aridity, and freezing (Wilson & Knoll, 2010; Matthaeus et al., 2022).

Xylem conductivity (K) describes water flow through the vascular system, and it can be expressed on several anatomical or spatial scales. For example, K can be expressed as either Ks (stem-specific conductivity) or Kl (conductivity including selected leaf area measured Kl = Ks/leaf area : sapwood cross-sectional area) per unit of pressure gradient (kg m⁻¹ s⁻¹ MPa⁻¹) in living plants. Detailed guidance on how to perform measurements of K in living plants can be found in Jarvis & Whitehead (1981), Gleason

et al. (2012) and Pérez-Harguindeguy et al. (2013). Although K cannot be directly measured in fossil plants, xylem cells are well preserved and common in the fossil record dating back to the early Devonian (Kenrick & Crane, 1997; Kenrick et al., 2012). Moreover, mature xylem conduits are dead cells in living plants; therefore, estimating K for fossil specimens is facilitated with less taphonomic filtering than for live tissues. Estimating K in paleobotany is broadly achieved by measurements of xylem conduit area, diameter, and length, paired with cell wall morphology/dimensions, while considering decay, and diagenesis (Cichan, 1986; Kenrick & Crane, 1991; Wilson et al., 2008; Strullu-Derrien et al., 2013). Estimations of K in all plants are grounded in adaptations of the Hagen-Poiseuille equation (Cichan, 1986; Wilson et al., 2008) and Ohm's Law (van den Honert, 1948), applied at the cellular level rather than per whole plant. This is also ideal for paleobotanical research given the frequent disarticulation of plant specimens (Wilson et al., 2008; Wilson & Knoll, 2010; Wilson & Fischer, 2011; Wilson, 2013, 2016). In these, xylem flow is estimated as conductance on a singlecell scale, where Ksc (cross-section conductivity) and Ksp (conduitspecific conductivity) represent *K*, normalized by transverse lumen and tracheid wall areas rather than by rate of flow, allowing for quantitative functional comparison of plants across genera independent of individual pressure gradients and environmental conditions.

Ultimately, the objective of representing conductance in extinct plants requires models and theory capable of piecing together the missing and perhaps *unknown* anatomical features of the whole plant. Therefore, a prominent focus in deep-time xylem conductivity studies over the past decade has been the role of pits, their membranes, and how their resistance and safety ultimately impact K and xylem transport. Pit membranes and pit apertures are preserved in the fossil record (Fig. 2i), and can be of use in estimating extinct plant hydraulics (Jones & Chaloner, 1991; Duerden, 1993; Wilson *et al.*, 2008; Pittermann, 2010; Wilson, 2013; Matthaeus *et al.*, 2022; Wilson *et al.*, 2023); xylem conductivity scored highly in our semi-quantitative assessment as a paleo-functional trait (9) and as an ESE trait (7.2) but achieved lower scores for ESI because it cannot currently be parameterized in a paleo-ecosystem model (Table S1; Figs 3, 4).

2. Stem-specific density

Stem-specific density (SSD) is the dry mass of a stem segment divided by the fresh volume of the same segment (Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013) and is of primary importance in the herbaceous-woody plant divide in global plant trait variation (Diaz *et al.*, 2016). Most of the carbon in the extant biosphere is incorporated into the stems of woody plants (Zanne *et al.*, 2010), and although the carbon concentration of stems is generally *c.* 50% across species and climates, the total carbon stocks stored in an individual tree is largely a function of the diameter of the tree at chest height and SSD (Chave *et al.*, 2005, 2009). Large-scale changes in SSD over geological time and space therefore influence the long-term carbon cycle. Burial of woody biomass with different SSD values would in turn influence the long-term oxygen cycle by preventing decomposition and oxidation processes. Increased SSD is associated with stem resistance to biomechanical and hydraulic failure (King et al., 2006; Diaz et al., 2016; Meinzer et al., 2016; Fu et al., 2019), at the cost of decreased growth rate due to increased stem carbon requirements. Plants with higher SSD tend to be more resilient to environmental stressors, have lower mortality rates, wider ecological niches, and achieve greater heights. In paleobotany, manoxylic (low SSD), and pycnoxylic (high SSD) wood types correspond to the two end members of the SSD continuum (Galtier & Meyer-Berthaud, 2006), and opportunities remain to tease out finer paleo-ecological strategies of fossil taxa using quantitative proxies for SSD (proposed below). Applying standard techniques for direct measurement of modern SSD (sensu stricto) to stem fossils is not possible due to the inaccessibility of fresh volume. Morphological distortions during fossilization (e.g. compression) further complicate the direct measurement of SSD. However, SSD and related quantities like wood density might be reconstructed based on stem biochemistry, anatomy (xylem lumen diameter), and compared with SSD in modern plant taxa to develop paleoproxies for this trait.

Stem-specific density can be decomposed into wood and bark density. These tissues serve different functions and are expected to have different chemical compositions, physical structures, and densities (Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013). In woody plants, structural support is provided by the secondary xylem, necessitating enrichment with biomolecules like lignin, while phloem and stem parenchyma perform biochemical functions, bark protects the tree from water loss, herbivory, and fire (Rosell, 2019). Because wood density is a commercially important property, a considerable body of literature exists on the patterns and causes of wood density variation in commercial forestry species. This literature might be leveraged to establish relationships between areal fractions of wood tissues and density, which could then be applied to the fossil record. In tropical angiosperm trees, for example, wood density is positively correlated to vessel wall fraction, and negatively correlated to fiber lumen fraction, vessel area, and pith area (Ziemińska et al., 2013; Zieminska et al., 2015).

SSD may be inaccessible for fossil tissues where there is a high degree of density variation, or for which function is expected to be different between extinct and modern plants. For example, lycopsids were likely structurally supported by bark rather than secondary xylem (DiMichele et al., 2013), and medullosan stelar and parenchyma arrangements are unlike any modern tree (Wilson et al., 2017). In such cases, biochemical analyses combined with inferences about potential tissue function may be applied as an additional lens for estimating SSD. For example, modern-stem bulk C: N is associated with the proportion of the tissue in various structural and functional tissue types that have well-characterized densities. A database of these associations would allow bulk stem compression C: N ratios to serve as a proxy for SSD that is more broadly applicable to the fossil record. Taphonomy experiments would however be required to test the robustness of the original stem C:N signal through temperature and pressure changes associated with fossilization (sensu McNamara et al., 2021). In summary, therefore, although SSD is undoubtedly important for Earth system processes and woody fossils are well preserved in the fossil record, given the highly preliminary nature of methodology to estimate this trait from fossils, SSD achieved relatively low paleofunctional (5.5), ESE (3.85), and ESI scores (0.38) (Table S1; Figs 3, 4).

3. Xylem vulnerability

Xylem of vascular plants facilitates the transport of water to plant tissues from the soil and the maintenance of plant function (Zanne et al., 2014). Water is drawn from soil through tracheary conduits in xylem by negative water potential (Ψ) induced by transpiration from leaves. During dry periods, water potential may exceed the physiological limits of xylem, causing water-transport failure, also known as hydraulic failure. The primary mode of failure is thought to be embolism via air-seeding (Venturas et al., 2017): Under extreme negative potential air is pulled into water-filled conduits from adjacent tissues resulting in conduit blockage and reduction of total xylem water-transport capacity (Mayr et al., 2014). Ecosystem functions like transpiration and photosynthesis depend on xylem water transport, and the physiological limitations of xylem are associated with tree mortality and vegetation distribution in modern ecosystems (Sperry, 2000; Sperry et al., 2002; McDowell et al., 2008; Choat et al., 2012; Adams et al., 2017). Therefore, xylem vulnerability to failure has likely had an impact on ecosystems and Earth surface processes since the initial diversification of vascular plants in the Devonian (Banks, 1975; Chaloner & Sheerin, 1979; Niklas, 1980, 1983, 1985a; Bouda et al., 2022).

Xylem physiology has been inferred from morphological and anatomical measurements of deep-time fossils (e.g. Niklas, 1985a; Wilson et al., 2008; Wilson & Knoll, 2010; Wilson, 2013), and has largely focused on the conductivity allowed by conduits and pit apertures. Pits are openings in the xylem secondary cell wall that leave only the middle lamella between adjacent conduits (i.e. the pit membrane; Choat et al., 2008). Pit characteristics are a good target for estimating xylem hydraulic vulnerability from fossil conduit anatomy. Recent work has shown that the pit-membrane area-tothickness ratio is a strong predictor of the hydraulic limitations of xylem (Kaack et al., 2021). Unfortunately, pit membranes are challenging to measure, and measurements at the nanometer scale (i.e. of pit-membrane thickness) would be subject to considerable preservation biases. Though this has not yet been tested, fossil pitmembrane thickness may not be representative of in vivo-pit thickness. Another anatomical character, pit-area per conduit, also informative on xylem vulnerability to embolism (Pittermann et al., 2006; Hacke et al., 2007; Brodersen et al., 2014), has been applied to late Pennsylvanian-aged fossil plants (Matthaeus et al., 2022; Wilson et al., 2023). Inferring absolute watertransport properties and ecosystem impacts based on conduit anatomy, however, requires assumptions about tissue-scale properties - of xylem as a whole (e.g. size distribution of conduits and sapwood area), which is accessible from stem permineralizations based on network connectivity (Bouda et al., 2022) - along with the whole plant architecture and the whole plant coordination of traits. We evaluated xylem vulnerability as having lower potential as a paleo-functional trait because of the reliance on fossilized pitmembrane anatomy, the difficulty of obtaining trait values from

fossilized pit membranes and due to the complexity of incorporating the trait within paleo-ecosystem models (Figs 3, 4; Table S1).

4. Bark thickness

Bark is a complex tissue with diverse physiological and ecological functions (Rosell, 2019). In extant plants, bark thickness is simply measured with calipers. There is a robust relationship between bark thickness and stem diameter in many tree taxa (Borger, 1973; Williams et al., 2007; Rosell et al., 2017), suggesting that it might be used as a proxy for stem diameter in fossil plants where whole stems are not preserved. However, the relationship between bark thickness and stem diameter varies among taxa, bark types, and between main stem and twigs - as bark thickness is also associated with a number of different environmental factors and physiological functions (Rosell et al., 2017; Rosell, 2019; see flammability). In the most extreme cases - for species with decorticating bark (Gill & Ashton, 1968; Borger, 1973) or bark shed in strips (Williams et al., 2007) - there may be little or no allometric relationship between bark thickness and stem diameter. Attempts to account for the factors influencing bark thickness in contemporary ecology have considered different parts of bark (e.g. inner and outer) and varied environments (e.g. tropical rainforest, temperate forest, or savannah), and they have made progress in disentangling interactions (Paine et al., 2010; Hempson et al., 2014; Rosell et al., 2015, 2017). These studies have also laid the foundations for using fossil bark thickness as a paleo-functional trait to infer wildfire frequency and intensity (Uhl & Kauffman, 1990; Hoffmann et al., 2003; Lawes et al., 2013; Pausas, 2015). Stem photosynthesis and herbivory defense may be inferred from the proportion of inner and outer bark, and the presence or absence of rhytidome (outermost bark which is characterized by multiple layers of periderm tissue interspersed by phloem-rich layers; Rosell et al., 2015; Rosell, 2019). Bark (wound periderm) has also been observed in extant CAM plants as a defense against high UV-B flux (dos Santos Nascimento et al., 2015).

The fossil record contains bark components (i.e. periderm; Fig. 2g; vascular cambium) as early as the Lower Devonian, and may coincide with the earliest appearance of secondary growth (Banks, 1981; Hoffman & Tomescu, 2013). Functional inferences based on bark thickness traits and constituent structures require the preservation of complete sections of bark which can be achieved when the bark type (i.e. its physiology) is known, and the delimiting structures are identifiable (e.g. vascular cambium and periderm). Even in these cases, the actual thickness of the outermost structures will likely be thinner than *in vivo* due to alteration during burial. These processes may be indistinguishable from normal, in vivo shedding from periderm. Furthermore, the considerable differences in the physiological function of bark in some extinct taxa that completely lack any living structural analogs (e.g. all extant lycopsids are herbaceous but many ancestral taxa were arborescent with extensive bark) may make high-confidence inferences difficult for those taxa. Chemical components of fossil bark (dos Santos Nascimento et al., 2015; Angyalossy et al., 2016) may, however, provide broadly useful information on the paleo-function of the individual even in the absence of phylogenetically related modern

analogs. Considering all of the factors reviewed above, we assessed bark thickness as having lower potential as a paleo-functional and ESE trait relative to many of the other traits reviewed here with scores of 6.5 and 1.95 respectively (Figs 3, 4; Table S1).

5. Plant height

Plant height is the shortest distance between the upper boundary of the main photosynthetic tissues and the ground level, expressed in meters (Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013). Direct measurement of height is not usually possible within the fossil record due to fragmentation (Niklas, 1994). Rare fossilization events can lead to whole tree stumps being preserved in situ (Cúneo et al., 2003; Wang et al., 2012) and whole-body fossils being preserved intact (Sun et al., 1998; Fig. 2f). In such cases, fossil plant height can be measured directly. For the most part, fossil plant stems and trunks are not intact. However, their height can be estimated indirectly. Niklas has developed formulae for estimating fossil plant height based on the allometric scaling relationships of diameter at chest height across phylogenetic and ontogenetic differences (Niklas, 1994; Enquist & Niklas, 2001). Height has also been estimated based on the shape of permineralized logs by projecting to vanishing point (Falcon-Lang & Scott, 2000). However, this methodology may underestimate tree height where the base width of trunks is unknown (Falcon-Lang & Scott, 2000).

Height is a key trait in the global spectrum of plant form and function (Diaz et al., 2016). It represents the economic trade-off between investment in structural tissues, stem maintenance, and access to light (Falster & Westoby, 2003). Taller plants are linked to increased biomass, acting as carbon sinks (Moles et al., 2009), and woody debris of taller plants such as trees slows decomposition (Gora et al., 2019 and references therein). Taller canopies provide niche partitioning by opening up understory and aerial habitats. Increased plant height is therefore associated with greater plant and animal diversity in contemporary ecosystems (August, 1983; Moles et al., 2009). Maximum plant height is also associated with an ability to disperse reproductive propagules and can thus provide useful insights on reproductive success (Beckman et al., 2018). Therefore, particularly since the acquisition of arborescence in the late Devonian (Stein et al., 2007), plant height can tell us a great deal about total ecosystem function (Moles et al., 2009), and has been used extensively to provide key ecological contexts for swamp dwelling plants of the Carboniferous (Philips & DiMichele, 1992; DiMichele et al., 2013). However, the light-competitive advantage of height depends on the relative height of other species within the paleo- or modern plant community rather than the absolute height of a species (Falster & Westoby, 2003), complicating inferences for fossil communities. Although plant height scored modestly as a potential paleo-functional trait (6) in our semi-quantitative evaluation, because of its importance in affecting ecosystem-scale and Earth system processes outlined above it ranked relatively highly as an ESE trait (score = 5.4; Figs 3, 4; Table S1). We suggest this paleo-functional trait has good potential for further development of methods to quantify trait values from fossils and to parameterize within paleo-ecosystem models.

VIII. Whole plant functional traits applied to fossils

1. Life history and maximum plant lifespan

Life-history strategies are described by the timing and intensity of the demographic processes of growth, survival, and reproduction (Stearns, 1992). Life-history strategies are indicators of ecological strategy and give insights into how populations respond to abiotic and biotic drivers, including climate (Csergo et al., 2017) and variation in these traits is strongly associated with environmental stress (Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013). As an example, extant gymnosperm and angiosperm trees with high longevity (high maximum lifespan) are slow-growing and usually occupy sites that are harsh (cold, nutrient-poor, frequently flooded etc.) but are subject to little storm disturbance (reviewed in Di Filippo et al., 2015). Quantification of life-history strategies thus informs potential responses of populations to environmental change (Buckley et al., 2019). Contemporary life-history metrics, however, cannot usually be calculated directly for extinct populations, as demography is usually unavailable. Nonetheless, life history has been considered for even the oldest, most basal plants using whole plant concepts (Matsunaga & Tomescu, 2017).

Direct morphological and anatomical evidence of life-history strategies for fossils are generally lacking. For instance, counting permineralized annual growth rings of woody stems and roots merely elucidates a plant's age at the time of death (Creber & Chaloner, 1984; Weaver et al., 1997; Luthardt et al., 2017) not the tree or species potential longevity. Long sequences of fossil growth rings are also rare (Chapman, 1994; Luthardt et al., 2017). Growth rate estimates based on mean annual ring widths from the same fossil trunks/roots (Fig. 2n) could however, be used to infer longevity using scaling relationships between mean ring width and longevity that have been developed for living taxa (Di Filippo et al., 2015), although they are biome specific. Population-level surveys of mean ring width from in situ preserved fossil forests provide some of the best data sources to model the longevity of fossil taxa (e.g. Cúneo et al., 2003) but it is acknowledged that these are exceptionally rare. For taxa that lack annual growth rings (e.g. most wet tropical taxa), plant lifespan is more difficult to interpret (Chaloner & McElwain, 1997; Boyce & DiMichele, 2016).

Counting the mean size of the annual increments on the stolon or rhizome may be the only way to indirectly assess maximum lifespan via growth rate in nonwoody fossil plants (Hotton *et al.*, 2001; Gensel & Berry, 2016). In cases without clear annual increments, detailed analysis of morphology, including the presence of perennating roots and shoots, counting the number of annual stem growth increments in woody shoots, presence of leaf scars on shoots and shoot scars on roots, will at least determine whether the fossil is an annual or perennial. Alternatively, if LL and plant height can be estimated for the fossil taxon, and leaves with axial attachment are available, a rough estimate of axial growth rate can be compared with overall tree height to estimate age at death (Boyce & DiMichele, 2016).

Most current inferences of paleo-life-history rest on plant form (e.g. woodiness and seed size), leaf economics, and trait-climate

associations (e.g. leaf shape). However, interpretation of lifespan for taxa that lack living relatives or equivalents (NLEs) or those that have extinct combinations of physiological traits can result in vastly different estimates for the plant's lifespan (Philips & DiMichele, 1992; Cleal & Thomas, 2005; Boyce & DiMichele, 2016; Thomas & Cleal, 2018). For example, lifespan estimates for the iconic late Pennsylvanian Lepidodendron, which reached an estimated height of 45 m, range from decades (Thomas & Cleal, 2018) to centuries (Boyce & DiMichele, 2016). For fossil taxa with no obvious NLEs, studies have relied on observations that extant plant life histories are structured by two major axes - a 'pace of life' axis and a reproductive axis (Salguero-Gomez et al., 2016). Furthermore, maximum plant lifespan is strongly aligned with the pace of life dimension of life-history strategies (Salguero-Gomez et al., 2016). These principles have been applied to early angiosperms, where a fast-paced 'weedy' life strategy has been inferred from single paleo-functional traits such as seed size (Wing & Boucher, 1998) and LMA (Royer et al., 2010). Recent studies, however, demonstrate the complexity of inferring demography from individual functional traits; seed size and plant height are positively correlated with maximum lifespan in extant plants but only in hot relatively invariable climates (Kelly et al., 2021). Furthermore, very different life forms, such as herbs and trees, can give rise to similar life histories (Salguero-Gomez et al., 2016), and divergent life forms can converge on similar trait and life-history profiles depending on environment and phylogeny (Kelly et al., 2021). Thus, combinations of paleo-functional traits, with information from multiple plant organs as well as the sedimentary and paleo-climatic environment context of the fossils may improve our understanding of the life-history strategy of fossil plants in the future. Based on these myriad considerations and obvious complexity, we assessed this syndrome of traits with a relatively high Paleo-functional trait value (6) but low ESE (2.4) and even lower ESI scores (0.24) due to the difficulty of integrating ecosystem models and demography models for current living vegetation let alone developing a paleo-demography model for fossils (Figs 3, 4; Table S1).

2. Litter decomposability

Decomposition of plant litter is important for nutrient recycling, soil fertility, and productivity. It regulates terrestrial biogeochemical cycles at both a global and local ecosystem scale (Zhang *et al.*, 2021) by restoring nutrients from dead plant parts into the soil and CO_2 to the atmosphere, while slow decomposition provides fuel for wildfires (Cornwell *et al.*, 2008). Decomposition involves the breakdown of plant litter, both physically and chemically, into its elements through progressively simpler compounds (Aerts, 2006). In contemporary ecosystems, the majority of aboveground litter is leaf litter, and broadly, chemical trait–decomposability relationships are preserved both across organs (leaves, roots, and stems) of different species and within organs in the same species (Freschet *et al.*, 2012).

Experimentally, the rate of decomposition is the percentage of mass loss over time with k (decomposition constant) defining a mass loss curve (Pérez-Harguindeguy *et al.*, 2013). Litter

decomposition is the result of interactions between climate and the community of decomposers (Berg & McClaugherty, 2008). Global litter decomposition is primarily driven by environmental conditions such as temperature and precipitation (Aerts, 1997), which are relevant to environmental change in geological time. Plant traits affect decomposition rate, primarily via their influence on usefulness as a resource for decomposer organisms (i.e. chemical composition and morphology), referred to as litter quality. Litter quality varies significantly among living plant lineages, so patterns of plant effects on nutrient cycling probably varied through deep time (Liu *et al.*, 2014). For instance, the leaves of gymnosperms generally decompose 44% slower than eudicots, and ferns and bryophytes decompose more slowly again (Liu *et al.*, 2014).

The most important traits contributing to litter quality are chemical traits that can be assessed in fossils. These are N content, lignin content, toughness (can be inferred from VD and cuticle thickness), and LMA (see section V; Cornwell et al., 2008; Freschet et al., 2012). Other leaf traits that go beyond the scope of fossil taxa such as N form (Rosenfield et al., 2020) and phenolics also influence the decomposition rate. Morphological traits further impact decomposability. At the very least size/volume (S/V), ratios affect the area exposed to decomposers in the early stages of decomposition. Consequently, overall prediction of decomposition relies on a relatively full picture of taxon traits. Litter quality is, therefore, a trait syndrome that is relevant for past environmental change but accessible from fossils only via correlations with chemical traits (available from compression fossils and coal balls) and morphological and anatomical traits (available from most fossil preservation modes). Detailed taphonomic studies suggest that most compression leaf fossils and leaves preserved in carbonaceous coal balls were likely preserved rapidly by covering recent falls of undecomposed leaf litter (Greenwood & Donovan, 1991; Gastaldo, 2001), making them the best targets for relatively unbiased assessment of paleo-litter decomposability in future studies.

For litter decomposition and biomass turnover, it is important to note that plants are made up of multiple organs that may have different geochemical effects; for instance, stem and root litter typically decompose slower and contain more lignin, so they have a disproportionate role in humus formation (Swift, 1977). Particular traits may also vary in their contribution to litter quality per organ; for instance, lignin content is important for wood decomposition. The effect of chemical traits may also change due to differing access to decomposers; for instance, N is found in enzymes in leaves and roots for CO₂ assimilation/absorptive capacity, while it is primarily found in storage and defense compounds in stems (Freschet et al., 2012). Lignin is in itself notable because it is a complex polymer fundamental to the lignin-cellulose structural matrix of wood and relevant to co-evolution of enzymatic mechanisms in decomposers. It is hypothesized that the evolution of wooddegrading enzymes was a key event ending coal formation at the end of the Carboniferous (Floudas et al., 2012) although this is disputed based on evidence of from the fossil record of fungi and plants (Nelsen et al., 2016). Chemical derivatives of lignin are readily preserved and extractable from fossils (Niklas, 1981; Logan & Thomas, 1987) throughout the geological record although to our knowledge no paleo-decomposability metric for fossil lignin content has been developed. Overall, interactions with both decomposers and other species in litter mixtures (Porre *et al.*, 2020) are a key modulator of the effects of traits on decomposition and may act differently on different traits. Hence, litter decomposability should be cautiously inferred from the fossil record and we have attributed relatively low paleo-functional trait scores accordingly (6), although the Earth system score (5.4) and ESI (4.05) scores are high because of the quantifiable impacts on biogeo-chemical cycling (Figs 3, 4; Table S1). Our assessment is that this paleo-functional trait syndrome is a good target for further study because of its high potential value to address interesting questions on plant evolution–Earth system interaction.

3. Plant flammability

Wildfire has occurred for > 400 million years (Ma; Edwards & Axe, 2004; Glasspool et al., 2004; Belcher, 2016) and has likely been relevant to Earth system processes for at least 350 Ma (Scott & Glasspool, 2006). Plants host many traits that either influence fire or respond to fire, many of which can be, or have the potential to be, observed in the fossil record. These can be linked to variations in environmental conditions such as weather, seasonality, climate, and the abundance of oxygen in the atmosphere and therefore, have the potential to clarify a broad range of Earth system processes across deep time (Archibald et al., 2018). Of critical importance and often overlooked in deep-time research is the influence of plant traits on flammability (the propensity of plant material to ignite, given an ignition source, and then propagate a fire) and the nature of the subsequent fire behavior (rate of spread and intensity), which interacts with ecosystem processes to determine the effects that a fire may have. While other proxies such as charcoal abundance may serve as indicators of fire frequency, we can utilize fire-linked plant traits to make the bestinformed interpretations of fire effects (sensu the 'effect' trait concept) in the ancient past (Belcher, 2016).

Plant traits influence flammability and fire behavior at the leaf level, the whole plant level, and the physiological/phenological level (Archibald et al., 2018) and act together to determine whether fires may burn in the canopy of forests, in the surface fuels (the understory) in litter or in ground fuels (such as organic soils and peat). There is a considerable literature describing the variety of plant traits that impact fire regimes (Kane et al., 2008; Schwilk & Caprio, 2011; Cornwell et al., 2015; Grootemaat et al., 2015), many of which are observable in the fossil record. Perhaps the most obvious are the leaf morphological traits of leaf length and leaf area (Notes S1), which are particularly important in determining the nature of fires in leaf litter because they influence the bulk density of the litter. The bulk density of leaf litter decreases with leaf area and length such that litters that have leaves with larger areas or longer needles will carry more rapidly spreading fires (de Magalhães & Schwilk, 2012). Such measurements have been linked to the energy production from paleolitter fires where leaves that pack tightly in high bulk density litter beds will burn more slowly but with an overall high total energy release that can damage soils and seed banks, while those of larger leaves or longer needles that pack less densely will run rapidly

through litter beds but impart little heat downward (Belcher, 2016).

The opposite tends to be true for tree or shrub canopies, where small leaves increase the ease of heat transfer and tend to form dense canopies (Schwilk & Ackerly, 2001; Archibald et al., 2018). LMA likely also influences flammability, where higher LMA leaves ought to contain overall more energy to give to a fire (both crown, surface, and litter fires) but will also affect litter fires via their influence on rates of decomposition (Cornwell et al., 2008). Other traits that enhance canopy flammability include dead branch retention (Bond & Midgley, 1995; Schwilk & Ackerly, 2001) and the retention of dead leaves (He et al., 2011). Low canopy base heights and dead branch retention influence the ability of surface fires to climb into the canopy. Hence, whole plant reconstructions are of importance to understanding the likely potential fire behavior that might exist in an ancient ecosystem. Other observations - such as branch or shoot shedding, a trait observed in many extant Pinaceae - tend to be associated with surface fire regimes. This trait has been noted using careful observations of Permian age conifer fossils (Looy, 2013). Similarly, thick bark tends to be associated with survival in surface fire regimes, where thick bark protects the trees' cambium from the heat of surface fires, while thinner bark is associated with traits such as canopy seed storage (serotiny) and tends to be linked to crown fire regimes (Pausas, 2014). The evolution of thick bark and serotiny in *Pinus* appears to date back to the Cretaceous, a time of enhanced flammability (He et al., 2012). It has also been suggested that a woody rachis that supports a compact cone with bracts/scales covering winged seeds are traits that might be considered as characteristic of serotinous cones (He et al., 2016). Such observations demonstrate the potential of using paleo-functional traits to indicate the likely fire regime operating in ancient ecosystems. Similarly, variations in leaf biochemical traits (such as terpene content) have been linked to flammability and being capable of driving different fire regimes. For example, conifers in surface fire regimes appear to have higher needle terpene contents, which appears to enhance litter flammability, encouraging frequent surface fires (Dewhirst et al., 2020).

Ancient ecosystems have been reconstructed using plant traits and included in models that make fire behavior predictions for time periods such as the Permian (He et al., 2016), the Triassic-Jurassic (Belcher et al., 2010; Belcher, 2016; Baker et al., 2022), the Cretaceous (Belcher & Hudspith, 2017), and the Miocene (Boulton & Belcher, 2019). More recently, global dynamic vegetation models have been used to answer deep-time questions regarding atmospheric oxygen that rely on consideration of plant functional types (Vitali et al., 2022). Therefore, the study of fossil plant traits has a significant potential to inform novel understanding of paleo wildfires and their effects, and we have scored this trait highly as a paleo-functional trait (7) accordingly (Table S1). Flammability has significant but complex impacts on the carbon and oxygen cycles, resulting in an ESE score of 5.6 (Figs 3, 4). Furthermore, although paleofire can be modelled currently within paleo-ecosystem models, flammability is a trait syndrome made up of many individual traits and it is not a simple task to parameterize at individual trait level, thus resulting in a lower ESI score (2.8) (Figs 3, 4; Table S1).

4. Salinity tolerance

Salinity tolerance is a complex trait consisting of the ability of plants to grow in saline environments. Saline-tolerant plants (halophytes) appear to be present as early as the Devonian (Channing & Edwards, 2009); however, the fossil record of halophytes is often based on the sedimentary context indicating a marine influence (Vakrahmeev, 1991; Gomez et al., 2002; Mendes et al., 2023) rather than more direct evidence based on fossil plant functional traits. Stable carbon isotopic analysis of leaf compression fossils has been used to indicate likely salinity gradients among fossil plant taxa from the same depositional setting (Nguyen Tu et al., 1999) with greater discrimination against C^{13} (less negative ¹³C values) used to indicate higher salinity sub-environments. Variability in stable carbon isotopes can also be influenced by photosynthetic syndrome (see section V), light intensity, aridity, and many other factors, so it is not a straightforward salinity indicator (Arens et al., 2000; Diefendorf et al., 2011; Cernusak et al., 2013). Nowadays, only a small fraction of terrestrial plants exhibit salinity tolerance. Plants use three main mechanisms by which they deal with excess environmental NaCl: (1) salt exclusion, (2) salt excretion, and (3) salt compartmentalization.

Roots of many salt-tolerant plants maintain K⁺ uptake, discriminating against Na⁺, resulting in an increased K⁺/Na⁺ ratio compared with the growing medium. K : Na selectivity (S) can be calculated as: $S = ([K^+]/[Na^+])_{plant}/([K^+]/[Na^+])_{soil}$ (Pérez-Harguindeguy et al., 2013). Ion concentrations in living plants and modern soils can be measured by atomic emission spectrometry (AES) and atomic absorption spectrometry (AAS) but are not currently available in fossils due to unknown effects of diagenesis on the original K/Na ratios. Other salt-tolerant plants excrete salt through special salt glands. These glands, found mostly on leaves and sometimes on stems, show different structural and functional diversity (Dassanayake & Larkin, 2017; Grigore & Toma, 2020). Microscopic observation of fossil plant cuticle with epifluorescence (see Cuticle Traits) may reveal their presence as many have autofluorescent properties and are superficially similar in size and structure to ordinary trichome bases which are readily observed on fossil leaves. Some salt-tolerant species compartmentalize Na⁺ in vacuoles and these are often succulent. Although direct observation of this type of compartmentalization is currently not possible to study in fossils, which typically lack cellular level preservation, LMA (reviewed in detail in section V) is a good general predictor of succulence (Poorter et al., 2009). However, LMA cannot be used in isolation as values for evergreen gymnosperms and succulent overlap (Poorter et al., 2009). Traits associated with salt excretion which are observable in fossils include the presence of regularly spaced crystals (salt recreation) and their anatomical excretory structures (sclereids, tracheo-ideoblasts; Grigore & Toma, 2020). For example, salt tolerance is often associated with the presence of calcium oxalate (CaOx) crystals in idioblasts of leaves and roots (Santos et al., 2016; Karabourniotis et al., 2020). SEM EDX analysis of Oligocene fossil leaves has confirmed the presence of ghost accumulations of CaOx crystals (druses; Malekhosseini et al., 2022), suggesting that additional underutilized traits are now available to study paleo salinity tolerance in fossil plants (Fig. 2e).

Overall, however, salinity tolerance achieved low scores across all categories (Table S1; Figs 3, 4), suggesting that it ranks low in terms of future development potential as a paleo-functional trait compared with others reviewed here. IX. Concluding remarks Measurement of fossils forms the primary record of vegetationclimate interactions across deep time. Traditionally, fossil plants have been used to document paleodiversity and plant evolution and as proxies of past environmental change. Less often have individual fossils been used to measure trait values as a means to evaluate their functioning within paleo-ecosystems. Incorporation of trait values within paleo-ecosystem models provides a powerful tool with which to evaluate the impact of newly evolved traits and suites of traits on the Earth system. Our critical review and semi-quantitative assessment of plant traits have resulted in a ranked list of paleofunctional traits (Fig. 4) that we identify as having the greatest potential to use in further studies investigating how plant evolution has shaped their environment, Earth surface, and Earth system processes through deep time. We have focused on and attempted to rank 'effect' traits; however, we view our ranked list as a working hypothesis and preliminary rather than a final and definitive outcome. Our methodological framework outlined in Fig. 1 provides a means for others to re-assess our scores and re-evaluate our ranking or to develop new paleo-functional trait evaluations that align better with the specific questions being asked. For example, we expect that an entirely different paleo-functional trait ranking will emerge if the traits are evaluated for their 'response' to rather than 'effect' on their paleo-environment. Response traits that have been strongly filtered by paleo-environment are the foundation stone of paleo-climate and paleo-atmospheric proxies. Pollen, spore, and leaf area traits would rank highly under a 'response to environment' evaluation. Where relevant in the review, we highlighted particular traits that

are ripe for further development but have scored relatively low under our ranking criteria because they require systematic approaches to quantify their trait values from fossils and further control for bias and error (e.g. plant height, CAM photosynthesis, LNC, SSD). Our critical assessment of paleo-functional traits has also revealed a constellation of traits (flammability, iWUE, xylem conductivity, VD, plant height, and dispersal syndrome) that are measurable in the fossil record and critically important for Earth system processes but are not yet parameterized within paleoecosystem models (Fig. 4). We highlight these, in particular, as excellent targets for future data-model integration. Perhaps somewhat unsurprisingly, leaf traits in the leaf economic spectrum rank among the highest paleo-functional traits (Figs 3, 4), which is encouraging as their application to fossil plant assemblages is growing and methodologies for their estimation are improving.

While individual paleo-functional traits provide interesting quantitative insight into the function of individual plant parts, a paleo-ecosystem-scale network of traits using multiple traits from different organs and community-weighted plant trait values (calculated as the product of relative taxon abundance and average trait values; e.g. Soh *et al.*, 2017) should be our ultimate goal. Trait-

based whole-plant understanding of plant function should incorporate existing knowledge about architecture, growth form, life history, and phenology from the rich literature of paleoecological inference as a framework for checking the robustness of individual trait values. Synthesizing all available paleo-functional traits in this way also provides a framework for integration with processes, global constraints, and trade-offs observed in modern plant ecology to allow the understanding of global vegetation effects across deep time and plant evolution.

Inference of vegetation function across deep time is a major outcome of interest for paleo-functional trait analysis. A parallel goal is obtaining a deeper understanding of the tempo of plant trait evolution and an overview of the functional traits that confer ecological resilience in a changing global climate (e.g. through xylem vulnerability, spore, and pollen traits). The impact of improving the resolution of trait spaces within phylogenetic and ecological groupings, as well as clarification of plant and ecosystem processes by modern plant scientists will expand understanding of deep-time vegetation processes. Coordination between paleo- and contemporary plant scientists is warranted, for example, to promote the measurement of traits that have a high degree of ecological impact and are measurable from both living and fossil plants (Fig. 4). We hope that our review and semiquantitative assessment of fossil plant functional traits will provide ideas and 'fossil for thought' toward this endeavor. Equally, we hope that our proposed methodological framework to evaluate paleo-functional traits will provide a useful basis for the development of new paleo-functional trait metrics and trait rankings in the future that are aligned with the specific questions being asked.

Acknowledgements

JM and SN acknowledge support from H2020 European Research Council funded Grants TERRAFORM ERC-ADG-2020-101020824 and TIME-LINES ERC-CoG-2021-101045309, respectively. IPM acknowledges funding from NSF EAR 1338281. YB acknowledges an Irish Research Council Laureate Awards 2017/2018 IRCLA/2017/60. Sincere thanks to four anonymous reviewers who provided a wealth of ideas and insights toward the improvement of our contribution. Open access funding provided by IReL.

Competing interests

None declared.

Author contributions

JCM and SN conceived the project. JCM and WJM designed the review structure and approach. JCM, WJM, BJ, AK, CC, SN, CB, KO'D, KK, CMB, IPM, JDW, YMB and RN drafted the manuscript. JCM, WJM, CC, YMB, JPW, JDW and SN prepared the figures and tables. KK, AK, KO'D and CB prepared the bibliography. All authors participated in the discussion and editing of the manuscript, figures, and tables.

Catarina Barbosa D https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1179-6553 Claire M. Belcher D https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3496-8290 Yvonne M. Buckley D https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7599-3201 Christos Chondrogiannis D https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4586-5537

Bea Jackson (D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3914-3661 Antonietta B. Knetge D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2493-8250 Kamila Kwasniewska b https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3446-413X William J. Matthaeus Dhttps://orcid.org/0000-0002-0117-4059 Jennifer C. McElwain D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1729-6755

Isabel P. Montañez D https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0492-3796 Richard Nair (D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6293-3610 Sandra Nogué D https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0093-4252 Joseph D. White D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9249-5009 Jonathan P. Wilson D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8586-171X

References

- Abrego N, Norberg A, Ovaskainen O, Aerts R. 2017. Measuring and predicting the influence of traits on the assembly processes of wood-inhabiting fungi. Journal of *Ecology* **105**: 1070–1081.
- Ackerman JD. 2000. Abiotic pollen and pollination: ecological, functional, and evolutionary perspectives. Plant Systematics and Evolution 222: 167-185.
- Adams HD, Zeppel MJB, Anderegg WRL, Hartmann H, Landhausser SM, Tissue DT, Huxman TE, Hudson PJ, Franz TE, Allen CD et al. 2017. A multi-species synthesis of physiological mechanisms in drought-induced tree mortality. Nature Ecology & Evolution 1: 1285-1291.
- Aerts R. 1995. The advantages of being evergreen. Trees 10: 402-405.
- Aerts R. 1997. Climate, leaf litter chemistry and leaf litter decomposition in terrestrial ecosystems: a triangular relationship. Oikos 79: 439-449.
- Aerts R. 2006. The freezer defrosting: global warming and litter decomposition rates in cold biomes. Journal of Ecology 94: 713-724.
- Aerts R, Chapin FS. 1999. The mineral nutrition of wild plants revisited: a re-evaluation of processes and patterns. Advances in Ecological Research 30: 1-67.
- Allen SE, Lowe AJ, Peppe DJ, Meyer HW. 2020. Paleoclimate and paleoecology of the latest Eocene Florissant flora of central Colorado, USA. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 551: 109678.
- Angyalossy V, Pace MR, Evert RF, Marcati CR, Oskolski AA, Terrazas T, Kotina E, Lens F, Mazzoni-Viveiros SC, Angeles G et al. 2016. IAWA list of microscopic bark features. IAWA Journal 37: 517-615.
- Archibald S, Lehmann CER, Belcher CM, Bond WJ, Bradstock RA, Daniau AL, Dexter KG, Forrestel EJ, Greve M, He T et al. 2018. Biological and geophysical feedbacks with fire in the Earth system. Environmental Research Letters 13: 33003.
- Arens NC, Jahren AH, Amundson R. 2000. Can C3 plants faithfully record the carbon isotopic composition of atmospheric carbon dioxide? Paleobiology 26: 137-164.
- Aslam TJ, Johnson SN, Karley AJ. 2012. Plant-mediated effects of drought on aphid population structure and parasitoid attack. Journal of Applied Entomology 137: 136-145.
- Aslan C, Beckman NG, Rogers HS, Bronstein J, Zurell D, Hartig F, Shea K, Pejchar L, Neubert M, Poulsen J et al. 2019. Employing plant functional groups to advance seed dispersal ecology and conservation. AoB Plants 11: plz006.
- August PV. 1983. The role of habitat complexity and heterogeneity in structuring tropical mammal communities. Ecology 64: 1495-1507.
- Bacon KL, Haworth M, Conroy E, McElwain JC. 2016. Can atmospheric composition influence plant fossil preservation potential via changes in leaf mass per area? A new hypothesis based on simulated palaeoatmosphere experiments. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 15: 51-64.

- Baker SJ, Dewhirst RA, McElwain JC, Haworth M, Belcher CM. 2022. CO₂induced biochemical changes in leaf volatiles decreased fire-intensity in the run-up to the Triassic-Jurassic boundary. *New Phytologist* 235: 1442–1454.
- Banks HP. 1975. The oldest vascular land plants: a note of caution. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 20: 13–25.
- Banks HP. 1981. Peridermal activity (Wound repair) in an Early Devonian (Emsian) Trimerophyte from the Gaspe Peninsula, Canada. *Palaeobotanist* 28: 20–25.
- Barbosa C, Muchagata J. 2021. The use of latex moulds as a complement for studying paleobotanical specimens. *Comunicações Geológicas* 108: 21–26.
- Beaulieu JM, Moles AT, Leitch IJ, Bennett MD, Dickie JB, Knight CA. 2007. Correlated evolution of genome size and seed mass. *New Phytologist* 173: 422– 437.
- Beckman NG, Bullock JM, Salguero-Gómez R, Violle C. 2018. High dispersal ability is related to fast life-history strategies. *Journal of Ecology* 106: 1349–1362.
- Belcher CM. 2016. The influence of leaf morphology on litter flammability and its utility for interpreting palaeofire. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences* 371: 20150163.
- Belcher CM, Hudspith VA. 2017. Changes to Cretaceous surface fire behaviour influenced the spread of the early angiosperms. *New Phytologist* 213: 1521–1532.
- Belcher CM, Mander L, Rein G, Jervis FX, Haworth M, Hesselbo SP, Glasspool IJ, McElwain JC. 2010. Increased fire activity at the Triassic/Jurassic boundary in Greenland due to climate-driven floral change. *Nature Geoscience* 3: 426–429.
- Berg B, McClaugherty C. 2008. Decomposition, hummus formation, carbon sequestration. In: Springer, ed. *Plant litter*. Berlin Heidelberg, Germany: Springer, 315 p.
- Bernardino-Nicanor A, Mora-Escobedo R, Montañez-Soto JL, Filardo-Kerstupp S, González-Cruz L. 2012. Microstructural differences in Agave atrovirens Karw leaves and pine by age effect. *African Journal of Agricultural Research* 7: 3550–3559.
- Berry JA, Beerling DJ, Franks PJ. 2010. Stomata: key players in the Earth system, past and present. *Current Opinion in Plant Biology* 13: 232–239.
- Blonder B, Royer DL, Johnson KR, Miller I, Enquist BJ. 2014. Plant ecological strategies shift across the Cretaceous–Paleogene boundary. *PLoS Biology* 12: e1001949.
- Boast AP, Weyrich LS, Wood JR, Metcalf JL, Knight R, Cooper A. 2018. Coprolites reveal ecological interactions lost with the extinction of New Zealand birds. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 115: 1546–1551.
- Bolmgren K, Eriksson O. 2005. Fleshy fruits origins, niche shifts, and diversification. *Oikos* 109: 255–272.
- Bonan GB. 1995. Sensitivity of a GCM simulation to inclusion of inland water surfaces. *Journal of Climate* 11: 2691–2704.
- Bond WJ, Midgley JJ. 1995. Kill thy neighbour: an individualistic argument for the evolution of flammability. *Oikos* 73: 79–85.
- Borger GA. 1973. In: Kozlowski TT, ed. Shedding of plants parts. New York, NY, USA: Academic Press.
- Bouda M, Huggett BA, Prats KA, Wason JW, Wilson JP, Brodersen CR. 2022. Hydraulic failure as a primary driver of xylem network evolution in early vascular plants. *Science* **378**: 642–646.
- Boulton CA, Belcher CM. 2019. A novel approach for predicting the probability of ignition of palaeofires using fossil leaf assemblages. *Palaeontology* 62: 715–730.
- **Boyce CK. 2009.** Seeing the forest with the leaves clues to canopy placement from leaf fossil size and venation characteristics. *Geobiology* 7: 192–199.
- Boyce CK, Brodribb TJ, Feild TS, Zwieniecki MA. 2009. Angiosperm leaf vein evolution was physiologically and environmentally transformative. *Proceedings of the Biological Sciences* 276: 1771–1776.
- Boyce CK, DiMichele WA. 2016. Arborescent lycopsid productivity and lifespan: constraining the possibilities. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 227: 97–110.
- Boyce CK, Ibarra DE, Nelsen MP, D'Antonio MP. 2023. Nitrogen-based symbioses, phosphorus availability, and accounting for a modern world more productive than the Paleozoic. *Geobiology* 21: 86–101.
- Boyce CK, Lee J, Field TS, Brodribb TJ, Zwieniecki MA. 2010. Angiosperms helped put the rain in the rainforests: the impact of plant physiological evolution on tropical biodiversity. *Annals of the Missouri Botanical Garden* 97: 527–540.
- Boyce CK, Lee JE. 2010. An exceptional role for flowering plant physiology in the expansion of tropical rainforests and biodiversity. *Proceedings of the Biological Sciences* 277: 3437–3443.

- **Boyce CK, Zwieniecki MA. 2012.** Leaf fossil record suggests limited influence of atmospheric CO₂ on terrestrial productivity prior to angiosperm evolution. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* **109**: 10403– 10408.
- Briggs DE, Crowther PR. 2008. Palaeobiology II. Oxford, UK: Blackwell Science.
- Brink KS, Stockey RA, Beard G, Wehr WC. 2009. Cunninghamia hornbyensis sp. nov.: permineralized twigs and leaves from the Upper Cretaceous of Hornby Island, British Columbia, Canada. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 155: 89–98.
- Brodersen C, Jansen S, Choat B, Rico C, Pittermann J. 2014. Cavitation resistance in seedless vascular plants: the structure and function of interconduit pit membranes. *Plant Physiology* 165: 895–904.
- Brodribb TJ. 2009. Xylem hydraulic physiology: the functional backbone of terrestrial plant productivity. *Plant Science* 177: 245–251.
- Brodribb TJ, McAdam SA. 2011. Passive origins of stomatal control in vascular plants. *Science* 4: 582–585.
- **Brodribb TJ, McAdam SAM, Jordan GJ, Feild TS. 2009.** Evolution of stomatal responsiveness to CO₂ and optimization of water-use efficiency among land plants. *New Phytologist* **183**: 839–847.
- Bruelheide H, Dengler J, Purschke O, Lenoir J, Jimenez-Alfaro B, Hennekens SM, Botta-Dukat Z, Chytry M, Field R, Jansen F *et al.* 2018. Global traitenvironment relationships of plant communities. *Nature Ecology & Evolution* 2: 1906–1917.
- Brussel T, Minckley TA, Brewer S, Long CJ. 2018. Community-level functional interactions with fire track long-term structural development and fire adaptation. *Journal of Vegetation Science* 29: 450–458.
- Buckley J, Widmer A, Mescher MC, De Moraes CM, van Dam N. 2019. Variation in growth and defence traits among plant populations at different elevations: implications for adaptation to climate change. *Journal of Ecology* 107: 2478–2492.
- Burnham RJ. 1990. Paleobotanical implications of drifted seeds and fruits from modern mangrove litter, Twin Cays, Belize. *PALAIOS* 5: 364–370.
- Burnham RJ, Johnson KR. 2004. South American palaeobotany and the origins of neotropical rainforests. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences* 359: 1595–1610.
- Burnham RJ, Wing SL, Parker GG. 1992. The reflection of deciduous forest communities in leaf litter: implications for autochthonous litter assemblages from the fossil record. *Paleobiology* 18: 30–49.
- Butrim MJ, Royer DL, Miller IM, Dechesne M, Neu-Yagle N, Lyson TR, Johnson KR, Barclay RS. 2022. No consistent shift in leaf dry mass per area across the Cretaceous—Paleogene boundary. *Frontiers in Plant Science* 13: 894690.
- Carriqui M, Douthe Č, Molins A, Flexas J. 2019. Leaf anatomy does not explain apparent short-term responses of mesophyll conductance to light and CO₂ in tobacco. *Physiologia Plantarum* **165**: 604–618.
- Carvalho MR, Jaramillo C, de la Parra F, Caballero-Rodríguez D, Herrera F, Wing S, Turner BL, D'Apolito C, Romero-Báez M, Narváez P *et al.* 2021. Extinction at the end-Cretaceous and the origin of modern Neotropical rainforests. *Science* 372: 63–68.
- Castro S, Ferrero V, Loureiro J, Espadaler X, Silveira P, Navarro L. 2010. Dispersal mechanisms of the narrow endemic Polygala vayredae: dispersal syndromes and spatio-temporal variations in ant dispersal assemblages. *Plant Ecology* 207: 359–372.
- Cenozoic CO₂ Proxy Integration Project (CenCO₂PIP) Consortium, Hönisch B, Royer DL, Breecker DO, Polissar PJ, Bowen GJ, Henehan MJ, Cui Y, Steinthorsdottir M, McElwain JC *et al.* 2023. Toward a Cenozoic history of atmospheric CO₂. *Science* 382: eadi5177.
- Cernusak LA, Ubierna N, Winter K, Holtum JA, Marshall JD, Farquhar GD. 2013. Environmental and physiological determinants of carbon isotope discrimination in terrestrial plants. *New Phytologist* 200: 950–965.
- Chaloner WG. 1984. 13th Birbal Sahni Memorial lecture: plants animals and time. Journal of Palaeosciences 32: 197–202.
- Chaloner WG. 1986. Electrostatic forces in insect pollination and their significance in exine ornament. In: Blackmore S, Ferguson IK, eds. *Pollen and spores. Form and function, Vol. 2.* London, UK: Academic Press, 103–108.
- Chaloner WG, McElwain JC. 1997. The fossil plant record and global climatic change. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 95: 73–82.
- Chaloner WG, Sheerin A. 1979. Devonian macrofloras. Special Papers in Palaeontology 23: 145–161.

4698137, 0, Downloaded from https://nph.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/nph.19622 by Readcube (Labtiva Inc.), Wiley Online Library on [27/02/2024]. See the Terms and Conditions (https://onlinelibrary.wiley

- Channing A, Edwards D. 2009. Yellowstone hot spring environments and the palaeo-ecophysiology of Rhynie chert plants: towards a synthesis. *Plant Ecology and Diversity* 2: 111–143.
- Chapin FS 3rd. 2003. Effects of plant traits on ecosystem and regional processes: a conceptual framework for predicting the consequences of global change. *Annals of Botany* 91: 455–463.
- Chapin FS. 1980. The mineral nutrition of wild plants. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 11: 233–260.
- Chapman JL. 1994. Distinguishing internal developmental characteristics from external palaeoenvironmental effects in fossil wood. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 81: 19–32.
- Chave J, Andalo C, Brown S, Cairns MA, Chambers JQ, Eamus D, Fölster H, Fromard F, Higuchi N, Kira T *et al.* 2005. Tree allometry and improved
- estimation of carbon stocks and balance in tropical forests. *Oecologia* 145: 87–99. Chave J, Coomes D, Jansen S, Lewis SL, Swenson NG, Zanne AE. 2009. Towards a worldwide wood economics spectrum. *Ecology Letters* 12: 351–366.
- Cheesman AW, Duff H, Hill K, Cernusak LA, McInerney FA. 2020. Isotopic and morphologic proxies for reconstructing light environment and leaf function of fossil leaves: a modern calibration in the Daintree Rainforest, Australia. American Journal of Botany 107: 1165–1176.
- Choat B, Cobb AR, Jansen S. 2008. Structure and function of bordered pits: new discoveries and impacts on whole-plant hydraulic function. *New Phytologist* 177: 608–626.
- Choat B, Jansen S, Brodribb TJ, Cochard H, Delzon S, Bhaskar R, Bucci SJ, Feild TS, Gleason SM, Hacke UG *et al.* 2012. Global convergence in the vulnerability of forests to drought. *Nature* 491: 752–755.
- Christin PA, Osborne CP, Chatelet DS, Columbus JT, Besnard G, Hodkinson TR, Garrison LM, Vorontsova MS, Edwards EJ. 2013. Anatomical enablers and the evolution of C4 photosynthesis in grasses. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 110: 1381–1386.
- Christoffoleti P, Caetano RSX. 1998. Soil seed banks. Scientia Agricola 55: 74-78.
- Cichan MA. 1986. Conductance in the wood of selected Carboniferous plants. *Paleobiology* 12: 302–310.
- Cleal CJ, Thomas BA. 2005. Palaeozoic tropical rainforests and their effect on global climates: is the past the key to the present? *Geobiology* 3: 13–31.
- Coley PD. 1987. Patrones en las defensas de las plantas por qué. *Revista de Biología Tropical* 35: 151–164.
- Coley PD, Barone JA. 1996. Herbivory and plant defenses in tropical forests. Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics 27: 305–335.
- **Collinson ME. 1983.** Accumulations of fruits and seeds in three small sedimentary environments in southern England and their palaeoecological implications. *Annals of Botany* **52**: 583–592.
- Cornwell WK, Cornelissen JH, Amatangelo K, Dorrepaal E, Eviner VT, Godoy O, Hobbie SE, Hoorens B, Kurokawa H, Perez-Harguindeguy N *et al.* 2008. Plant species traits are the predominant control on litter decomposition rates within biomes worldwide. *Ecology Letters* 11: 1065–1071.
- Cornwell WK, Elvira A, van Kempen L, van Logtestijn RS, Aptroot A, Cornelissen JH. 2015. Flammability across the gymnosperm phylogeny: the importance of litter particle size. *New Phytologist* 206: 672–681.
- Creber GT, Chaloner WG. 1984. Influence of environmental factors on the wood structure of living and fossil trees. *The Botanical Review* 50: 357–448.
- **Cruzan MB. 1990.** Variation in pollen size, fertilization ability, and postfertilization siring ability in *Erythronium grandiflorum. Evolution* 44: 843–856.
- Csergo AM, Salguero-Gomez R, Broennimann O, Coutts SR, Guisan A, Angert AL, Welk E, Stott I, Enquist BJ, McGill B *et al.* 2017. Less favourable climates constrain demographic strategies in plants. *Ecology Letters* 20: 969–980.
- Cúneo NR, Taylor EL, Taylor TN, Krings M. 2003. In situ fossil forest from the upper Fremouw Formation (Triassic) of Antarctica: paleoenvironmental setting and paleoclimate analysis. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 197: 239–261.
- Currano ED, Jacobs BF. 2021. Bug-bitten leaves from the early Miocene of Ethiopia elucidate the impacts of plant nutrient concentrations and climate on insect herbivore communities. *Global and Planetary Change* 207: 103655.
- Currano ED, Wilf P, Wing SL, Labandeira CC, Lovelock EC, Royer DL. 2008. Sharply increased insect herbivory during the Paleocene-Eocene Thermal Maximum. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* **105**: 1960–1964.

- Dassanayake M, Larkin JC. 2017. Making plants break a sweat: the structure,
- function, and evolution of plant salt glands. *Frontiers in Plant Science* 8: 406. Decombeix AL. 2013. Bark anatomy of an Early Carboniferous tree from Australia. *IAWA Journal* 34: 183–196.
- Decombeix A-L, Boura A, Tomescu AMF. 2019. Plant hydraulic architecture through time: lessons and questions on the evolution of vascular systems. *IAWA Journal* 40: 387–420.
- **Del Tredici P. 2007.** The phenology of sexual reproduction in ginkgo biloba: ecological and evolutionary implications. *Botanical Review* **73**: 267–278.
- DeVore ML, Kenrick P, Pigg KB, Ketcham RA. 2006. Utility of high resolution x-ray computed tomography (HRXCT) for paleobotanical studies: an example using London Clay fruits and seeds. *American Journal of Botany* 93: 1848–1851.
- Dewhirst RA, Smirnoff N, Belcher CM. 2020. Pine species that support crown fire regimes have lower leaf-level terpene contents than those native to surface fire regimes. *Firehouse* 3: 17.
- Di Filippo A, Pederson N, Baliva M, Brunetti M, Dinella A, Kitamura K, Knapp HD, Schirone B, Piovesan G. 2015. The longevity of broadleaf deciduous trees in Northern Hemisphere temperate forests: insights from tree-ring series. *Frontiers in Ecology and Evolution* 3: 46.
- Diaz S, Cabido M. 1997. Plant functional types and ecosystem function in relation to global change. *Journal of Vegetation Science* 8: 463–474.
- Diaz S, Kattge J, Cornelissen JH, Wright IJ, Lavorel S, Dray S, Reu B, Kleyer M, Wirth C, Prentice IC *et al.* 2016. The global spectrum of plant form and function. *Nature* 529: 167–171.
- Diefendorf AF, Freeman KH, Wing SL, Graham HV. 2011. Production of n-alkyl lipids in living plants and implications for the geologic past. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 75: 7472–7485.
- Diefendorf AF, Leslie AB, Wing SL. 2015. Leaf wax composition and carbon isotopes vary among major conifer groups. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 170: 145–156.
- Dilcher DL. 1974. Approaches to the identification of angiosperm leaf remains. *Botanical Review* 40: 1–157.
- DiMichele WA, Elrick SD, Bateman RM. 2013. Growth habit of the late Paleozoic rhizomorphic tree-lycopsid family Diaphorodendraceae: phylogenetic, evolutionary, and paleoecological significance. *American Journal of Botany* 100: 1604–1625.
- Dostalek T, Rokaya MB, Munzbergova Z. 2020. Plant palatability and trait responses to experimental warming. *Scientific Reports* 10: 10526.
- Dow GJ, Bergmann DC, Berry JA. 2014. An integrated model of stomatal development and leaf physiology. *New Phytologist* 201: 1218–1226.
- Duerden H. 1993. On the xylem elements of certain fossil pteridophyta. Annals of Botany 47: 187–195.
- Dutta D, Ambwani K. 2007. Capers: a food for Upper Cretaceous dinosaurs of Pisdura, India. *Current Science* 92: 897–899.
- Duursma RA, Blackman CJ, Lopéz R, Martin-StPaul NK, Cochard H, Medlyn BE. 2019. On the minimum leaf conductance: its role in models of plant water use, and ecological and environmental controls. *New Phytologist* 221: 693–705.
- Edwards D, Axe L. 2004. Anatomical evidence in the detection of the earliest wildfires. *PALAIOS* 19: 113–128.
- Edwards D, Geng BY, Li CS. 2016. New plants from the lower Devonian Pingyipu Group, Jiangyou County, Sichuan Province, China. *PLoS ONE* 11: e0163549.
- Edwards D, Li CS, Raven JA. 2006. Tracheids in an early vascular plant: a tale of two branches. *Botanical Journal of the Linnean Society* **150**: 115–130.
- Edwards EJ. 2019. Evolutionary trajectories, accessibility and other metaphors: the case of C4 and CAM photosynthesis. *New Phytologist* 223: 1742–1755.
- Ejsmond MJ, Wrońska-Pilarek D, Ejsmond A, Dragosz-Kluska D, Karpińska-Kołaczek M, Kołaczek P, Kozłowski J. 2011. Does climate affect pollen morphology? Optimal size and shape of pollen grains under various desiccation intensity. *Ecosphere* 2: art117.
- Enquist BJ, Niklas KJ. 2001. Invariant scaling relations across tree-dominated communities. *Nature* 410: 655–660.
- Esperança Júnior MG, Cybis GB, Iannuzzi R. 2023. An efficient method for estimating vein density of Glossopteris and its application. *Palaeontology* 66: e12640.

26 Review

Ethier GJ, Livingston NJ. 2004. On the need to incorporate sensitivity to CO₂ transfer conductance into the Farquhar-von Caemmerer-Berry leaf photosynthesis model. *Plant, Cell and Environment* 27: 137–153.

Evans JR, Sharkey TD, Berry JA, Farquhar GD. 1986. Carbon isotope discrimination measured concurrently with gas exchange to investigate CO₂ diffusion in leaves of higher plants. *Australian Journal of Plant Physiology* 13: 281– 292.

Evans-FitzGerald C, Porter AS, Yiotis C, Elliott-Kingston C, McElwain JC. 2016. Co-ordination in morphological leaf traits of early diverging angiosperms is maintained following exposure to experimental palaeo-atmospheric conditions of sub-ambient O₂ and elevated CO₂. *Frontiers in Plant Science* 7: 1368.

Falcon-Lang HJ. 2000a. A method to distinguish between woods produced by evergreen and deciduous coniferopsids on the basis of growth ring anatomy: a new palaeoecological tool. *Palaeontology* 43: 785–793.

Falcon-Lang HJ. 2000b. The relationship between leaf longevity and growth ring markedness in modern conifer woods and its implications for palaeoclimatic studies. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **160**: 317–328.

Falcon-Lang HJ, Cantrill DJ. 2001. Gymnosperm woods from the Cretaceous (mid-Aptian) Cerro Negro Formation, Byers Peninsula, Livingston Island, Antarctica: the arborescent vegetation of a volcanic arc. *Cretaceous Research* 22: 277–293.

Falcon-Lang HJ, Scott AC. 2000. Upland ecology of some Late Carboniferous cordaitalean trees from Nova Scotia and England. *Palaeogeography*, *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 156: 225–242.

Falster DS, Westoby M. 2003. Plant height and evolutionary games. Trends in Ecology & Evolution 18: 337–343.

Farquhar GD, O'Leary MH, Berry JA. 1982. On the relationship between carbon isotope discrimination and the intercellular carbon dioxide concentration in leaves. *Australian Journal of Plant Physiology* 9: 121–137.

Feild TS, Chatelet DS, Balun L, Schilling EE, Evans R. 2011. The evolution of angiosperm lianescence without vessels-climbing mode and wood structurefunction in *Tasmannia cordata* (Winteraceae). *New Phytologist* 193: 229–240.

Feild TS, Chatelet DS, Brodribb TJ. 2009. Ancestral xerophobia: a hypothesis on the whole plant ecophysiology of early angiosperms. *Geobiology* 7: 237–264.

Ferguson DK. 2005. Plant taphonomy: ruminations on the past, present, and the future. *PALAIOS* 20: 418–428.

Field C, Mooney HA. 1986. The photosynthesis-nitrogen relationship in wild plants. In: Givnish TJ, ed. On the economy of plant form. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 25–55.

Flexas J, Scoffoni C, Gago J, Sack L. 2013. Leaf mesophyll conductance and leaf hydraulic conductance: an introduction to their measurement and coordination. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 64: 3965–3981.

Floudas D, Binder M, Riley R, Barry K, Blanchette RA, Henrissat B, Martinez AT, Otillar R, Spatafora JW, Yadav JS et al. 2012. The Paleozoic origin of enzymatic lignin decomposition reconstructed from 31 fungal genomes. *Science* 336: 1715– 1719.

Franchi GG, Piotto B, Nepi M, Baskin CC, Pacini E. 2011. Pollen and seed desiccation tolerance in relation to degree of developmental arrest, dispersal, and survival. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 65: 5267–5281.

Franks PJ, Beerling DJ. 2009. Maximum leaf conductance driven by CO₂ effects on stomatal size and density over geologic time. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 106: 10343–10347.

Franks PJ, Berry JA, Lombardozzi DL, Bonan GB. 2017. Stomatal function across temporal and spatial scales: deep-time trends, land-atmosphere coupling and global models. *Plant Physiology* 174: 583–602.

Franks PJ, Royer DL, Beerling DJ, Van de Water PK, Cantrill DJ, Barbour MM, Berry JA. 2014. New constraints on atmospheric CO₂ concentration for the Phanerozoic. *Geophysical Research Letters* 41: 4685–4694.

Freschet GT, Aerts R, Cornelissen JHC. 2012. A plant economics spectrum of litter decomposability. *Functional Ecology* 26: 56–65.

Friedman WE, Cook ME. 2000. The origin and early evolution of tracheids in vascular plants: integration of palaeobotanical and neobotanical data. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B: Biological Sciences* 355: 857–868.

Fu X, Meinzer FC, Woodruff DR, Liu YY, Smith DD, McCulloh KA, Howard AR. 2019. Coordination and trade-offs between leaf and stem hydraulic traits and

stomatal regulation along a spectrum of isohydry to anisohydry. *Plant, Cell & Environment* 42: 2245–2258.

New Phytologist

- Gago J, Carriqui M, Nadal M, Clemente-Moreno MJ, Coopman RE, Fernie AR, Flexas J. 2019. Photosynthesis optimized across land plant phylogeny. *Trends in Plant Science* 24: 947–958.
- Galtier J, Meyer-Berthaud B. 2006. The diversification of early arborescent seed ferns. *The Journal of the Torrey Botanical Society* **133**: 7–19.

García-Plazaola JI, Fernández-Marín B, Duke SO, Hernández A, López-Arbeloa F, Becerril JM. 2015. Autofluorescence: biological functions and technical applications. *Plant Science* 236: 136–145.

Gastaldo RA. 2001. Terrestrial plants. In: Briggs DEG, Crowther PR, eds. *Palaeobiology II*. Oxford: Blackwell Scientific, 312–315.

Gensel PG, Berry CM. 2016. Sporangial morphology of the early Devonian zosterophyll *Sawdonia ornata* from the type locality (Gaspé). *International Journal of Plant Sciences* 177: 618–632.

Gill AM, Ashton DH. 1968. The role of bark type in relative tolerance to fire of three central Victorian Eucalypts. *Australian Journal of Botany* 16: 491–498.

Glasspool IJ, Edwards D, Axe L. 2004. Charcoal in the Silurian as evidence for the earliest wildfire. *Geology* 32: 381.

Gleason SM, Butler DW, Ziemińska K, Waryszak P, Westoby M. 2012. Stem xylem conductivity is key to plant water balance across Australian angiosperm species. *Functional Ecology* 26: 343–352.

Goddéris Y, Donnadieu Y, Mills BJW. 2023. What models tell us about the evolution of carbon sources and sinks over the phanerozoic. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences* 51: 471–492.

Gomez B, Martin-Closas C, Barale G, Solé de Porta N, Thévenard F, Guignard G. 2002. Frenelopsis (Coniferales: Cheirolepidiaceae) and related male organ genera from the Lower Cretaceous of Spain. *Palaeontology* 45: 997–1036.

Gómez-Noguez F, León-Rossano LM, Mehltreter K, Orozco-Segovia A, Rosas-Pérez I, Pérez-García B. 2017. Experimental measurements of terminal velocity of fern spores. *American Fern Journal* 107: 59–71.

Gora EM, Lucas JM, Gonzalez A. 2019. Dispersal and nutrient limitations of decomposition above the forest floor: evidence from experimental manipulations of epiphytes and macronutrients. *Functional Ecology* 33: 2417–2429.

Green AJ, Baltzinger C, Lovas-Kiss Á. 2021. Plant dispersal syndromes are unreliable, especially for predicting zoochory and long-distance dispersal. *Oikos* 2: 1–11.

Green WA. 2010. The function of the aerenchyma in arborescent lycopsids: evidence of an unfamiliar metabolic strategy. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences* 277: 2257–2267.

Greenwood DR, Donovan SK. 1991. The taphonomy of plant macrofossils. The processes of fossilization. New York, NY, USA: Columbia University Press.

Grigore MN, Toma C. 2020. Integrative anatomy of halophytes from Mediterranean climate. Handbook of halophytes: from molecules to ecosystems towards biosaline agriculture. Springer.

Grime JP, Cornelissen JHC, Thompson K, Hodgson JG. 1996. Evidence of a causal connection between anti-herbivore defence and the decompositionrate of leaves. *Oikos* 77: 489–494.

Grimes ST, Davies KL, Butler IB, Brock F, Edwards D, Rickard D, Briggs DEG, Parkes RJ. 2002. Fossil plants from the Eocene London Clay: the use of pyrite textures to determine the mechanism of pyritization. *Journal of the Geological Society* 159: 493–501.

Grootemaat S, Wright IJ, Bodegom PM, Cornelissen JHC, Cornwell WK. 2015. Burn or rot: leaf traits explain why flammability and decomposability are decoupled across species. *Functional Ecology* **29**: 1486–1497.

Guimarães PR, Galetti M, Jordano P. 2008. Seed dispersal anachronisms: rethinking the fruits extinct megafauna ate. *PLoS ONE* 3: e1745.

Habgood KS, Hass H, Kerp H. 2003. Evidence for an early terrestrial food web: coprolites from the Early Devonian Rhynie chert. *Earth and Environmental Science Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh* 94: 371–389.

Hacke UG, Sperry JS, Feild TS, Sano Y, Sikkema EH, Pittermann J. 2007. Water transport in vesselless angiosperms: conducting efficiency and cavitation safety. *International Journal of Plant Sciences* **168**: 1113–1126.

Hacke UG, Sperry JS, Pittermann J. 2004. Analysis of circular bordered pit function II. Gymnosperm tracheids with torus-margo pit membranes. *American Journal of Botany* 91: 386–400.

led from https://nph.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/nph.19622 by Readcube (Labtiva Inc.), Wiley Online Library on [27/02/2024]. See the Terms and Conditions (https:

nditions) on Wiley Online Library for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons License

- Halbritter H, Ulrich S, Grímsson F, Weber M, Zetter R, Hesse M, Buchner R, Svojtka M, Frosch-Radivo A. 2018. Illustrated pollen terminology. Springer
- Harley PC, Loreto F, Di Marco G, Sharkey TD. 1992. Theoretical considerations when estimating the mesophyll conductance to CO₂ flux by the analysis of the response of photosynthesis to CO₂. Plant Physiology 98: 1429-1436
- Haworth M, Raschi A. 2014. An assessment of the use of epidermal micromorphological features to estimate leaf economics of Late Triassic-Early Jurassic fossil Ginkgoales. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 205: 1-8.
- He T, Belcher CM, Lamont BB, Lim SL. 2016. A 350-million legacy of fire adaptation among conifers. Journal of Ecology 104: 352-363.
- He T, Lamont BB, Downes KS. 2011. Banksia born to burn. New Phytologist 191: 184-196.
- He T, Pausas JG, Belcher CM, Schwilk DW, Lamont BB. 2012. Fire-adapted traits of Pinus arose in the fiery Cretaceous. New Phytologist 194: 751-759.

Heinen JH, Florens FBV, Baider C, Hume JP, Kissling WD, Whittaker RJ, Rahbek C, Borregaard MK. 2023. Novel plant-frugivore network on Mauritius is unlikely to compensate for the extinction of seed dispersers. Nature Communications 14: 1019.

Hempson GP, Midgley JJ, Lawes MJ, Vickers KJ, Kruger LM. 2014. Comparing bark thickness: testing methods with bark-stem data from two South African fireprone biomes. Journal of Vegetation Science 25: 1247-1256.

Hesse M, Vogel S, Halbritter H. 2000. Thread-forming structures in angiosperm anthers: their diverse role in pollination ecology. Plant Systematics and Evolution 222: 281-292

Hoffman LA, Tomescu AM. 2013. An early origin of secondary growth: Franhueberia gerriennei gen. et sp. nov. from the Lower Devonian of Gaspé (Quebec, Canada). American Journal of Botany 100: 754-763.

Hoffmann WA, Orthen B, Nascimento PKVD. 2003. Comparative fire ecology of tropical savanna and forest trees. Functional Ecology 17: 720-726.

van den Honert TH. 1948. Water transport in plants as a catenary process. Discussions of the Faraday Society 3: 146.

Hotton CL, Hueber FM, Griffing DH, Bridge JS. 2001. Early terrestrial plant environments: an example from the Emsian of Gaspé, Canada. In: Gensel PG, Edwards D, eds. Plants invade the land: evolutionary and environmental perspectives. New York, NY, USA: Columbia University Press, 179-212.

Hu S, Dilcher DL, Jarzen DM, Winship Taylor D. 2008. Early steps of angiosperm pollinator coevolution. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA 105: 240-245.

Hughes L, Dunlop M, French K, Leishman MR, Rice B, Rodgerson L, Westoby M. 1994. Predicting dispersal spectra: a minimal set of hypotheses based on plant attributes. The Journal of Ecology 82: 933.

Jackson ST, Myford ME. 1999. Pollen dispersal models in quaternary plant ecology: assumptions, parameters, and prescriptions. Botanical Review 65: 39-75.

Jardine PE, Kent M, Fraser WT, Lomax BH. 2019. Ginkgo leaf cuticle chemistry across changing pCO2 regimes. PalZ 93: 549-558.

Jarvis SC, Whitehead DC. 1981. The influence of some soil and plant factors on the concentration of copper in perennial ryegrass. Plant and Soil 60: 275-286.

Jasechko S, Sharp ZD, Gibson JJ, Birks SJ, Yi Y, Fawcett PJ. 2013. Terrestrial water fluxes dominated by transpiration. Nature 496: 347-350.

Jia Z, von Wiren N. 2020. Signaling pathways underlying nitrogen-dependent changes in root system architecture: from model to crop species. Journal of Experimental Botany 71: 4393-4404.

Jones TP, Chaloner WG. 1991. Fossil charcoal, its recognition and palaeoatmospheric significance. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 97: 39-50.

Juhrbandt J, Leuschner C, Hölscher D. 2004. The relationship between maximal stomatal conductance and leaf traits in eight Southeast Asian early successional tree species. Forest Ecology and Management 202: 245-256.

Kaack L, Weber M, Isasa E, Karimi Z, Li S, Pereira L, Trabi CL, Zhang Y, Schenk HJ, Schuldt B et al. 2021. Pore constrictions in intervessel pit membranes provide a mechanistic explanation for xylem embolism resistance in angiosperms. New Phytologist 230: 1829-1843.

Kane JM, Varner JM, Hiers JK. 2008. The burning characteristics of southeastern oaks: discriminating fire facilitators from fire impeders. Forest Ecology and Management 256: 2039-2045.

© 2024 The Authors

Kelly R, Healy K, Anand M, Baudraz MEA, Bahn M, Cerabolini BEL, Cornelissen JHC, Dwyer JM, Jackson AL, Kattge J et al. 2021. Climatic and evolutionary contexts are required to infer plant life history strategies from functional traits at a global scale. Ecology Letters 24: 970-983.

Kenrick P, Crane PR. 1991. Water-conducting cells in early fossil land plants: implications for the early evolution of tracheophytes. Botanical Gazette 152: 335-356

Kenrick P, Crane PR. 1997. The origin and early evolution of plants on land. Nature 389: 33-39

Kenrick P, Wellman CH, Schneider H, Edgecombe GD. 2012. A timeline for terrestrialization: consequences for the carbon cycle in the Palaeozoic. Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society of London. Series B, Biological Sciences 367: 519-536.

Kerp H, Bomfleur B. 2011. Photography of plant fossils - new techniques, old tricks. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 166: 117-151.

King DA, Davies SJ, Tan S, Noor NSM. 2006. The role of wood density and stem support costs in the growth and mortality of tropical trees. Journal of Ecology 94: 670-680.

- Klavins S, Taylor EL, Krings M, Taylor T. 2001. An unusual, structurally preserved ovule from the Permian of Antarctica. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 115: 107 - 117
- Konzmann S, Kluth M, Karadana D, Lunau K. 2019. Pollinator effectiveness of a specialist bee exploiting a generalist plant-tracking pollen transfer by Heriades truncorum with quantum dots. Apidologie 51: 201-211.
- Kouwenberg LLR, Hines RR, McElwain JC. 2007. A new transfer technique to extract and process thin and fragmented fossil cuticle using polyester overlays. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 145: 243-248.
- Kröber W, Plath I, Heklau H, Bruelheide H. 2015. Relating stomatal conductance to leaf functional traits. Journal of Visualized Experiments 12: 52738.

Kürschner WM. 1997. The anatomical diversity of recent and fossil leaves of the durmast oak (Quercus petraea Lieblein/Q. pseudocastanea Goeppert)implications for their use as biosensors of palaeoatmospheric CO2 levels. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 96: 1-30.

- Labandeira CC. 1998. Early history of arthropod and vascular plant associations. Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences 26: 329-377.
- Labandeira CC, Allen EG. 2007. Minimal insect herbivory for the Lower Permian Coprolite Bone Bed site of north-central Texas, USA, and comparison to other Late Paleozoic floras. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 247: 197-219
- Lavorel S, Diaz S, Hans J, Cornelissen C, Garnier E, Harrison SP, McIntyre S, Pausas JG, Pérez-Harguindeguy N, Roumet C et al. 2007. Terrestrial ecosystems in a changing world. Berlin, Heidelberg, Germany: Springer.

Lavorel S, Garnier E. 2002. Predicting changes in community composition and ecosystem functioning from plant traits: revisiting the Holy Grail. Functional Ecology 16: 545-556.

Lawes MJ, Midgley JJ, Clarke PJ, Jones R. 2013. Costs and benefits of relative bark thickness in relation to fire damage: a savanna/forest contrast. Journal of Ecology 101: 517-524.

- Lawson T, Vialet-Chabrand S. 2019. Speedy stomata, photosynthesis and plant water use efficiency. New Phytologist 221: 93-98.
- Lawson T, Weyers JD, A'Brook R. 1998. The nature of heterogeneity in the stomatal behaviour of Phaseolus vulgaris L. primary leaves. Journal of Experimental Botany 49: 1387-1395.

Leide J, Hildebrandt U, Reussing K, Riederer M, Vogg G. 2007. The developmental pattern of tomato fruit wax accumulation and its impact on cuticular transpiration barrier properties: effects of a deficiency in a b-ketoacylcoenzyme A synthase (LeCER6). Plant Physiology 144: 1667-1679.

Leide J, Nierop KG, Deininger AC, Staiger S, Riederer M, de Leeuw JW. 2020. Leaf cuticle analyses: implications for the existence of cutan/non-ester cutin and its biosynthetic origin. Annals of Botany 126: 141-162.

Leishman MR, Westoby M. 1998. Seed size and shape are not related to persistence in soil in Australia in the same way as in Britain. Functional Ecology 12: 480-485.

Lenton TM, Daines SJ, Mills BJW. 2018. COPSE reloaded: an improved model of biogeochemical cycling over Phanerozoic time. Earth-Science Reviews 178: 1-28.

Liu F, Bomfleur B, Peng H, Li Q, Kerp H, Zhu H. 2018. 280-m.y.-old fossil starch reveals early plant-animal mutualism. *Geology* 46: 423–426.

- Liu F, Peng H, Marshall JEA, Lomax BH, Bomfleur B, Kent MS, Fraser WT, Philip EJ. 2023. Dying in the sun: direct evidence for elevated UV-B radiation at the end-Permian mass extinction. *Science Advances* 9: eabo6102.
- Liu G, Cornwell WK, Pan X, Cao K, Ye X, Huang Z, Dong M, Cornelissen JHC, Austin A. 2014. Understanding the ecosystem implications of the angiosperm rise to dominance: leaf litter decomposability among magnoliids and other basal angiosperms. *Journal of Ecology* 102: 337–344.
- Liu J, Lindstrom AJ, Chen Y, Nathan R, Gong X. 2021. Congruence between ocean-dispersal modelling and phylogeography explains recent evolutionary history of *Cycas* species with buoyant seeds. *New Phytologist* 232: 1863–1875.
- Logan KJ, Thomas BA. 1987. The distribution of lignin derivatives in fossil plants. *New Phytologist* 105: 157–173.
- Looy CV. 2013. Natural history of a plant trait: branch-system abscission in Paleozoic conifers and its environmental, autecological, and ecosystem implications in a fire-prone world. *Paleobiology* 39: 235–252.
- Looy CV, van Konijnenburg-van Cittert JH, Duijnstee IA. 2021. Proliferation of isoëtalean lycophytes during the Permo-Triassic biotic crises: a proxy for the state of the terrestrial biosphere. *Frontiers in Earth Science* 9: 615370.
- Lovas-Kiss Á, Vizi B, Vincze O, Attila Molnár V, Green AJ. 2018. Endozoochory of aquatic ferns and angiosperms by mallards in Central Europe. *Journal of Ecology* 106: 1714–1723.
- Luo X, Keenan TF, Chen JM, Croft H, Colin Prentice I, Smith NG, Walker AP, Wang H, Wang R, Xu C *et al.* 2021. Global variation in the fraction of leaf nitrogen allocated to photosynthesis. *Nature Communications* **12**: 4866.
- Luthardt L, Rößler R, Schneider JW. 2017. Tree-ring analysis elucidating palaeoenvironmental effects captured in an *in situ* fossil forest – the last 80 years within an early Permian ecosystem. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 487: 278–295.
- Mack AL. 2000. Did fleshy fruit pulp evolve as a defence against seed loss rather than as a dispersal mechanism? *Journal of Biosciences* 25: 93–97.
- de Magalhães RMQ, Schwilk DW. 2012. Leaf traits and litter flammability: evidence for non-additive mixture effects in a temperate forest. *Journal of Ecology* 100: 1153–1163.
- Malekhosseini M, Ensikat HJ, McCoy VE, Wappler T, Weigend M, Kunzmann L, Rust J. 2022. Traces of calcium oxalate biomineralization in fossil leaves from late Oligocene maar deposits from Germany. *Scientific Reports* 12: 15959.
- Males J, Griffiths H. 2017. Stomatal biology of CAM plants. *Plant Physiology* 174: 550–560.
- Manchester SR, O'Leary EL. 2010. Phylogenetic distribution and identification of fin-winged fruits. *The Botanical Review* 76: 1–82.
- Matsunaga KK, Manchester SR, Srivastava R, Kapgate DK, Smith SY. 2019. Fossil palm fruits from India indicate a Cretaceous origin of Arecaceae tribe Borasseae. *Botanical Journal of the Linnean Society* **190**: 260–280.
- Matsunaga KK, Tomescu AM. 2017. An organismal concept for *Sengelia radicans* gen. et sp. nov.–morphology and natural history of an Early Devonian lycophyte. *Annals of Botany* **119**: 1097–1113.
- Matthaeus WJ, Macarewich SI, Richey J, Montañez IP, McElwain JC, White JD, Wilson JP, Poulsen CJ. 2023. A systems approach to understanding how plants transformed earth's environment in deep time. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences* 51: 551–580.
- Matthaeus WJ, Montañez IP, McElwain JC, Wilson JP, White JD. 2022. Stems matter: xylem physiological limits are an accessible and critical improvement to models of plant gas exchange in deep time. *Frontiers in Ecology and Evolution* 10: 955066.
- Mayr S, Kartusch B, Kikuta S. 2014. Evidence for air-seeding: watching the formation of embolism in conifer xylem. *Journal of Plant Hydraulics* 1: e004.
- McDowell N, Pockman WT, Allen CD, Breshears DD, Cobb N, Kolb T, Plaut J, Sperry J, West A, Williams DG *et al.* 2008. Mechanisms of plant survival and mortality during drought: why do some plants survive while others succumb to drought? *New Phytologist* 178: 719–739.
- McElwain JC. 2018. Paleobotany and global change: important lessons for species to biomes from vegetation responses to past global change. *Annals of Botany* 69: 761–787.
- McElwain JC, Chaloner WG. 1996. The fossil cuticle as a skeletal record of environmental change. *PALAIOS* 11: 376–388.

- McElwain JC, Steinthorsdottir M. 2017. Paleoecology, ploidy, paleoatmospheric composition, and developmental biology: a review of the multiple uses of fossil stomata. *Plant Physiology* 174: 650–664.
- McElwain JC, Yiotis C, Lawson T. 2016. Using modern plant trait relationships between observed and theoretical maximum stomatal conductance and vein density to examine patterns of plant macroevolution. *New Phytologist* 209: 94– 103.
- McLoughlin S, Pott C. 2019. Plant mobility in the mesozoic: disseminule dispersal strategies of Chinese and Australian Middle Jurassic to Early Cretaceous plants. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 515: 47–69.
- McLoughlin S, Prevec R. 2021. The reproductive biology of glossopterid gymnosperms a review. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 295: 104527.
- McNamara ME, Rossi V, Slater TS, Rogers CS, Ducrest AL, Dubey S, Roulin A. 2021. Decoding the evolution of Melanin in vertebrates. *Trends in Ecology & Evolution* 36: 430–443.
- Medina NG, Estebanez B. 2014. Does spore ultrastructure mirror different dispersal strategies in mosses? A study of seven iberian orthotrichum species. *PLoS ONE* 9: e112867.
- Medlyn BE, Duursma RA, Eamus D, Ellsworth DS, Prentice IC, Barton CVM, Crous KY, De Angelis P, Freeman M, Wingate L. 2011. Reconciling the optimal and empirical approaches to modelling stomatal conductance. *Global Change Biology* 17: 2134–2144.
- Meinzer FC, Woodruff DR, Marias DE, Smith DD, McCulloh KA, Howard AR, Magedman AL. 2016. Mapping 'hydroscapes' along the iso- to anisohydric continuum of stomatal regulation of plant water status. *Ecology Letters* 19: 1343– 1352.
- Mendes MM, Dinis JL, Gomez B, Pais J. 2010. Reassessment of the cheirolepidiaceous conifer Frenelopsis teixeirae Alvin et Pais from the Early Cretaceous (Hauterivian) of Portugal and palaeoenvironmental considerations. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 161: 30–42.
- Mendes MM, Kvaček J, Doyle JA. 2023. Pseudofrenelopsis dinisii, a new species of the extinct conifer family Cheirolepidiaceae from the probable lower Hauterivian (Cretaceous) of western Portugal. Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology 315: 104905.
- Moles AT, Ackerly DD, Webb CO, Tweddle JC, Dickie JB, Pitman AJ, Westoby M. 2005a. Factors that shape seed mass evolution. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 102: 10540–10544.
- Moles AT, Ackerly DD, Webb CO, Tweddle JC, Dickie JB, Westoby M. 2005b. A brief history of seed size. *Science* **307**: 576–580.
- Moles AT, Warton DI, Warman L, Swenson NG, Laffan SW, Zanne AE, Pitman A, Hemmings FA, Leishman MR. 2009. Global patterns in plant height. *Journal of Ecology* 97: 923–932.
- Moore JP, Vicré-Gibouin M, Farrant JM, Driouich A. 2008. Adaptations of higher plant cell walls to water loss: drought vs desiccation. *Physiologia Plantarum* 134: 237–245.
- Moreau D, Bardgett RD, Finlay RD, Jones DL, Philippot L, Power S. 2019. A plant perspective on nitrogen cycling in the rhizosphere. *Functional Ecology* 33: 540–552.
- Mosle B, Finch P, Collinson ME, Scott AC. 1997. Comparison of modern and fossil plant cuticles by selective chemical extraction monitored by flash pyrolysisgas chromatography-mass spectrometry and electron microscopy. *Journal of Analytical and Applied Pyrolysis* 40-41: 585–597.
- Moyroud E, Wenzel T, Middleton R, Rudall PJ, Banks H, Reed A, Mellers G, Killoran P, Westwood MM, Steiner U *et al.* 2017. Disorder in convergent floral nanostructures enhances signalling to bees. *Nature* 550: 469–474.
- Muller J. 1979. Form and function in angiosperm pollen. *Annals of the Missouri Botanical Garden* 66: 593–632.

Murray DR. 2012. Seed dispersal. Sydney, Australia: Academic Press.

- Murray M, Soh WK, Yiotis C, Batke S, Parnell AC, Spicer RA, Lawson T, Caballero R, Wright IJ, Purcell C et al. 2019. Convergence in maximum stomatal conductance of C(3) woody angiosperms in natural ecosystems across bioclimatic zones. Frontiers in Plant Science 10: 558.
- Murray M, Soh WK, Yiotis C, Spicer RA, Lawson T, McElwain JC. 2020. Consistent relationship between field-measured stomatal conductance and theoretical maximum stomatal conductance in C3 woody angiosperms in four major biomes. *International Journal of Plant Sciences* 181: 142–154.

led from https://nph.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/nph.19622 by Readcube (Labtiva Inc.), Wiley Online Library on [27/02/2024], See the Terms and Conditions (https://onlinelibrary.wiley

conditions) on Wiley Online Library for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons License

- Nelsen MP, DiMichele WA, Peters SE, Boyce CK. 2016. Delayed fungal evolution did not cause the Paleozoic peak in coal production. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 113: 2442–2447.
- Nguyen Tu TT, Bocherens H, Mariotti A, Baudin F, Pons D, Broutin J, Derenne S, Largeau C. 1999. Ecological distribution of Cenomanian terrestrial plants based on C13/C12 ratios. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 145: 79–93.
- Niechayev NA, Pereira PN, Cushman JC. 2019. Understanding trait diversity associated with crassulacean acid metabolism (CAM). *Current Opinion in Plant Biology* 49: 74–85.
- Niinemets Ü, Díaz-Espejo A, Flexas J, Galmés J, Warren CR. 2009. Role of mesophyll diffusion conductance in constraining potential photosynthetic productivity in the field. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 60: 2249–2270.
- Niklas KJ. 1980. Evidence for lignin-like constituents in early Silurian (Llandoverian) plant fossils. *Science* 28: 396–397.
- Niklas KJ. 1981. The chemistry of fossil plants. Bioscience 31: 820-825.
- Niklas KJ. 1983. Organelle preservation and protoplast partitioning in fossil angiosperm leaf tissues. *American Journal of Botany* 70: 543–548.
- Niklas KJ. 1985a. The evolution of tracheid diameter in early vascular plants and its implications on the hydraulic conductance of the primary xylem strand. *Evolution* **39**: 1110–1122.
- Niklas KJ. 1985b. The aerodynamics of wind pollination. *Botanical Review* 51: 328–386.
- Niklas KJ. 1992. Plant biomechanics: an engineering approach to plant form and function. Chicago, IL, USA: University of Chicago Press.
- Niklas KJ. 1994. Predicting the height of fossil plant remains: an allometric approach to an old problem. *American Journal of Botany* 81: 1235–1242.
- Nogué S, de Nascimento L, Graham L, Brown LA, González LAG, Castilla-Beltrán A, Penuelas J, Fernández-Palacios JM, Willis K. 2022. The spatiotemporal distribution of pollen traits related to dispersal and desiccation tolerance in Canarian laurel forest. *Journal of Vegetation Science* 33: e13147.
- Norconk MA, Grafton BW, Conklin-Brittain NL. 1998. Seed dispersal by neotropical seed predators. *American Journal of Primatology* 45: 103–126.
- Norros V, Karhu E, Norden J, Vahatalo AV, Ovaskainen O. 2015. Spore sensitivity to sunlight and freezing can restrict dispersal in wood-decay fungi. *Ecology and Evolution* 5: 3312–3326.
- Ogburn MR, Edwards EJ. 2013. Repeated origin of three-dimensional leaf venation releases constraints on the evolution of succulence in plants. *Current Biology* 23: 722–726.
- Olson ME, Anfodillo T, Gleason SM, McCulloh KA. 2021. Tip-to-base xylem conduit widening as an adaptation: causes, consequences, and empirical priorities. *New Phytologist* 229: 1877–1893.
- **Onoda Y, Richards L, Westoby M. 2012.** The importance of leaf cuticle for carbon economy and mechanical strength. *New Phytologist* **196**: 441–447.
- Pacini E, Hesse M. 2005. Pollenkitt its composition, forms and functions. *Flora* 200: 399–415.
- Pacini E, Hesse M. 2012. Uncommon pollen walls: reasons and consequences. Verhandlungen der Zoologisch-Botanischen Gesellschaft in Österreich 148-149: 291– 306.
- Pacini EF, Franchi GG. 1999. Pollen grain sporoderm and types of dispersal units. Acta Societatis Botanicorum Poloniae 68: 299–305.
- Paine CET, Stahl C, Courtois EA, Patiño S, Sarmiento C, Baraloto C. 2010. Functional explanations for variation in bark thickness in tropical rain forest trees. *Functional Ecology* 24: 1202–1210.
- Parlange JY, Waggoner PE. 1970. Stomatal dimensions and resistance to diffusion. Plant Physiology 46: 337–342.
- Pausas JG. 2014. Bark thickness and fire regime. Functional Ecology 29: 315-327.
- Pausas JG. 2015. Evolutionary fire ecology: lessons learned from pines. *Trends in Plant Science* 20: 318–324.
- Peco B, Traba J, Levassor C, Sánchez AM, Azcárate FM. 2003. Seed size, shape and persistence in dry Mediterranean grass and scrublands. *Seed Science Research* 13: 87–95.
- Peppe DJ, Lemons CR, Royer DL, Wing SL, Wright IJ, Lusk CH, Rhoden CH. 2014. Biomechanical and leaf-climate relationships: a comparison of ferns and seed plants. *American Journal of Botany* 101: 338–347.
- Peppe DJ, Royer DL, Cariglino B, Oliver SY, Newman S, Leight E, Enikolopov G, Fernandez-Burgos M, Herrera F, Adams JM *et al.* 2011. Sensitivity of leaf size

and shape to climate: global patterns and paleoclimatic applications. *New Phytologist* **190**: 724–739.

- Pérez-Harguindeguy N, Díaz S, Garnier E, Lavorel S, Poorter H, Jaureguiberry P, Bret-Harte MS, Cornwell WK, Craine JM, Gurvich DE et al. 2013. New handbook for standardised measurement of plant functional traits worldwide. *Australian Journal of Botany* 61: 167.
- Pérez-Harguindeguy N, Díaz S, Vendramini F, Cornelissen JHC, Gurvich DE, Cabido M. 2003. Leaf traits and herbivore selection in the field and in cafeteria experiments. *Austral Ecology* 28: 642–650.
- Philips TL, DiMichele WA. 1992. Comparative ecology and life-history biology of arborescent lycopsids in late carboniferous swamps of Euramerica. *Annals of the Missouri Botanical Garden* 79: 560–588.
- van der Pijl L. 1969. Principles of dispersal in higher plants. Berlin, Germany: Springer.
- Pittermann J. 2010. The evolution of water transport in plants: an integrated approach. *Geobiology* 8: 112–139.
- Pittermann J, Limm E, Rico C, Christman MA. 2011. Structure-function constraints of tracheid-based xylem: a comparison of conifers and ferns. *New Phytologist* **192**: 449–461.
- Pittermann J, Sperry JS, Hacke UG, Wheeler JK, Sikkema EH. 2005. Torus-margo pits help conifers compete with angiosperms. *Science* **310**: 1924.
- Pittermann J, Sperry JS, Hacke UG, Wheeler JK, Sikkema EH. 2006. Intertracheid pitting and the hydraulic efficiency of conifer wood: the role of tracheid allometry and cavitation protection. *American Journal of Botany* 93: 1265–1273.
- van der Plas F, Schroder-Georgi T, Weigelt A, Barry K, Meyer S, Alzate A, Barnard RL, Buchmann N, de Kroon H, Ebeling A *et al.* 2020. Plant traits alone are poor predictors of ecosystem properties and long-term ecosystem functioning. *Nature Ecology & Evolution* 4: 1602–1611.
- Pole M, Philippe M. 2010. Cretaceous plant fossils of Pitt Island, the Chatham group, New Zealand. *Alcheringa* 34: 231–263.
- Pons TL, Flexas J, von Caemmerer S, Evans JR, Genty B, Ribas-Carbo M, Brugnoli E. 2009. Estimating mesophyll conductance to CO₂: methodology, potential errors, and recommendations. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 60: 2217– 2234.
- Poorter H, Niinemets Ü, Poorter L, Wright IJ, Villar R. 2009. Causes and consequences of variation in leaf mass per area (LMA): a meta-analysis. *New Phytologist* 182: 565–588.
- Poorter L, Bongers F. 2006. Leaf traits are good predictors of plant performance across 53 rain forest species. *Ecology* 87: 1733–1743.
- Porre RJ, van der Werf W, De Deyn GB, Stomph TJ, Hoffland E. 2020. Is litter decomposition enhanced in species mixtures? A meta-analysis. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* 145: 107791.
- Raven JA, Spicer RA. 1996. The evolution of crassulacean acid metabolism. In: Winter K, Smith JAC, eds. *Crassulacean acid metabolism: biochemistry*,
- ecophysiology and evolution. Berlin, Heidelberg, Germany: Springer, 360–385. Reich PB. 2014. The world-wide 'fast–slow' plant economics spectrum: a traits manifesto. *Journal of Ecology* 102: 275–301.
- Reich PB, Uhl C, Walters MB, Ellsworth DS. 1991. Leaf lifespan as a determinant of leaf structure and function among 23 amazonian tree species. *Oecologia* 86: 16–24.
- Reich PB, Walters MB, Ellsworth DS. 1992. Leaf life-span in relation to leaf, plant, and stand characteristics among diverse ecosystems. *Ecological Monographs* 62: 365–392.
- Reichgelt T, D'Andrea WJ, Valdivia-McCarthy AD, Fox BR, Bannister JM, Conran JG, Lee WG, Lee DE. 2020. Elevated CO₂, increased leaf-level productivity, and water-use efficiency during the early Miocene. *Climate of the Past* 16: 1509–1521.
- Reitalu T, Gerhold P, Poska A, Pärtel M, Väli V, Veski S. 2015. Novel insights into post-glacial vegetation change: functional and phylogenetic diversity in pollen records. *Journal of Vegetation Science* 26: 911–922.
- Reitalu T, Nogué S. 2023. Functional vegetation change over millennia. *Nature Ecology & Evolution* 7: 174–175.
- Robledo-Arnuncio JJ, Klein EK, Muller-Landau HC, Santamaría L. 2014. Space, time and complexity in plant dispersal ecology. *Movement Ecology* 2: 16.
- Rockwell FE, Holbrook NM. 2017. Leaf hydraulic architecture and stomatal conductance: a functional perspective. *Plant Physiology* 174: 1996–2007.

- Rojas TN, Zampini IC, Isla MI, Blendinger PG. 2022. Fleshy fruit traits and seed dispersers: which traits define syndromes? *Annals of Botany* 129: 831–838.
- Romanek CS, Grossman EL, Morse JW. 1992. Carbon isotopic fractionation in synthetic aragonite and calcite: effects of temperature and precipitation rate. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* 56: 419–430.
- Rosell JA. 2019. Bark in woody plants: understanding the diversity of a multifunctional structure. *Integrative and Comparative Biology* 59: 535–547.
- Rosell JA, Castorena M, Laws CA, Westoby M. 2015. Bark ecology of twigs vs. main stems: functional traits across eighty-five species of angiosperms. *Oecologia* 178: 1033–1043.
- Rosell JA, Olson ME, Anfodillo T, Martinez-Mendez N. 2017. Exploring the bark thickness-stem diameter relationship: clues from lianas, successive cambia, monocots and gymnosperms. *New Phytologist* 215: 569–581.
- Rosenfield MV, Keller JK, Clausen C, Cyphers K, Funk JL. 2020. Leaf traits can be used to predict rates of litter decomposition. *Oikos* 129: 1589–1596.
- Rößler R, Zierold T, Feng Z, Kretzschmar R, Merbitz M, Annacker V, Schneider JW. 2012. A snapshot of an early Permian ecosystem preserved by explosive volcanism: new results from the Chemnitz Petrified Forest, Germany. *PALAIOS* 27: 814–834.
- Roth-Nebelsick A, Uhl D, Mosbrugger V, Kerp H. 2001. Evolution and function of leaf venation architecture: a review. *Annals of Botany* **87**: 553–566.
- Roth-Nebelsick A, Konrad W. 2003. Assimilation and transpiration capabilities of rhyniophytic plants from the Lower Devonian and their implications for paleoatmospheric CO₂ concentration. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 202: 153–178.
- Royer DL, Miller IM, Peppe DJ, Hickey LJ. 2010. Leaf economic traits from fossils support a weedy habit for early angiosperms. *American Journal of Botany* 97: 438– 445.
- Royer DL, Sack L, Wilf P, Lusk CH, Jordan GJ, Niinemets Ü, Wright IJ, Westoby M, Cariglino B, Coley PD et al. 2007. Fossil leaf economics quantified: calibration, Eocene case study, and implications. *Paleobiology* 33: 574–589.
- Sack L, Caringella M, Scoffoni C, Mason C, Rawls M, Markesteijn L, Poorter L. 2014. Leaf vein length per unit area is not intrinsically dependent on image magnification: avoiding measurement artifacts for accuracy and precision. *Plant Physiology* 166: 829–838.
- Sack L, Scoffoni C. 2013. Leaf venation: structure, function, development, evolution, ecology and applications in the past, present and future. *New Phytologist* 198: 983–1000.
- Sack L, Scoffoni C, John GP, Poorter H, Mason C, Mendez-Alonzo R, Donovan LA. 2013. How do leaf veins influence the worldwide leaf economic spectrum? Review and synthesis. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 64: 4053–4080.
- Sack L, Scoffoni C, McKown AD, Frole K, Rawls M, Havran JC, Tran H, Tran T. 2012. Developmentally based scaling of leaf venation architecture explains global ecological patterns. *Nature Communications* 3: 837.
- Sage RF. 2017. A portrait of the C4 photosynthetic family on the 50th anniversary of its discovery: species number, evolutionary lineages, and Hall of Fame. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 68: 11–28.
- Salguero-Gomez R, Jones OR, Jongejans E, Blomberg SP, Hodgson DJ, Mbeau-Ache C, Zuidema PA, de Kroon H, Buckley YM. 2016. Fast-slow continuum and reproductive strategies structure plant life-history variation worldwide. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 113: 230–235.
- van der Sande MT, Bush MB, Akesson CM, Berrio JC, Correia Metrio A, Flantua SGA, Hooghiemstra H, Maezumi SY, McMichael CNH, Montoya E *et al.* 2023.
 Warming, drought, and disturbances lead to shifts in functional composition: a millennial-scale analysis for Amazonian and Andean sites. *Global Change Biology* 29: 4775–4792.
- Sande MT, Gosling W, Correa-Metrio A, Prado-Junior J, Poorter L, Oliveira RS, Mazzei L, Bush MB. 2019. A 7000-year history of changing plant trait composition in an Amazonian landscape; the role of humans and climate. *Ecology Letters* 22: 925–935.
- Santos J, Al-Azzawi M, Aronson J, Flowers TJ. 2016. eHALOPH a database of salt-tolerant plants: helping put halophytes to work. *Plant & Cell Physiology* 57: e10.
- dos Santos Nascimento LB, Leal-Costa MV, Menezes EA, Lopes VR, Muzitano MF, Costa SS, Tavares ES. 2015. Ultraviolet-B radiation effects on phenolic profile and flavonoid content of Kalanchoe pinnata. *Journal of Photochemistry and Photobiology. B* 148: 73–81.

- Schopf JM. 1975. Modes of fossil preservation. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 20: 20–53.
- Schulte PJ, Hacke UG. 2021. Solid mechanics of the torus-margo in conifer intertracheid bordered pits. *New Phytologist* 229: 1431–1439.
- Schulze ED, Kelliher FM, Korner C, Lloyd J, Leuning R. 1994. Relationships among maximum stomatal conductance, ecosystem surface conductance, carbon assimilation rate, and plant nitrogen nutrition: a global ecology scaling exercise. *Annual Review of Ecology and Systematics* 25: 629–660.
- Schwendemann AB, Wang G, Mertz ML, McWilliams RT, Thatcher SL, Osborn JM. 2007. Aerodynamics of saccate pollen and its implications for wind pollination. *American Journal of Botany* 94: 1371–1381.
- Schwilk DW, Ackerly DD. 2001. Flammability and serotiny as strategies: correlated evolution in pines. *Oikos* 94: 326–336.
- Schwilk DW, Caprio AC. 2011. Scaling from leaf traits to fire behaviour: community composition predicts fire severity in a temperate forest. *Journal of Ecology* 99: 970–980.
- Scott AC, Glasspool IJ. 2006. The diversification of Paleozoic fire systems and fluctuations in atmospheric oxygen concentration. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 103: 10861–10865.
- Sheldon ND, Smith SY, Stein R, Ng M. 2020. Carbon isotope ecology of gymnosperms and implications for paleoclimatic and paleoecological studies. *Global and Planetary Change* 184: 103060.
- Sims HJ, Cassara JA. 2009. The taphonomic fidelity of seed size in fossil assemblages: a live-dead case study. *PALAIOS* 24: 387–393.
- Slot M, Nardwattanawong T, Hernández GG, Bueno A, Riederer M, Winter K. 2021. Large differences in leaf cuticle conductance and its temperature response among 24 tropical tree species from across a rainfall gradient. *New Phytologist* 232: 1618–1631.
- Soh WK, Wright IJ, Bacon KL, Lenz TI, Steinthorsdottir M, Parnell AC, McElwain JC. 2017. Palaeo leaf economics reveal a shift in ecosystem function associated with the end-Triassic mass extinction event. *Nature Plants* **3**: 17104.
- Soh WK, Yiotis C, Murray M, Pernell A, Wright IJ, Spicer RA, Lawson T, Caballero R, McElwain JC. 2019. Rising CO₂ drives divergence in water use efficiency of evergreen and deciduous plants. *Science Advances* 5: eaax7906.
- Sperry JS. 2000. Hydraulic constraints on plant gas exchange. Agricultural and Forest Meteorology 104: 13–23.
- Sperry JS, Hacke UG, Oren R, Comstock JP. 2002. Water deficits and hydraulic limits to leaf water supply. *Plant, Cell & Environment* 25: 251–263.
- Sperry JS, Meinzer FC, McCulloh KA. 2008. Safety and efficiency conflicts in hydraulic architecture: scaling from tissues to trees. *Plant, Cell & Environment* 31: 632–645.
- Spicer RA. 1989. The formation and interpretation of plant fossil assemblages. *Advances in Botanical Research* 16: 95–191.
- Spicer RA, Yang J, Spicer TE, Farnsworth A. 2021. Woody dicot leaf traits as a palaeoclimate proxy: 100 years of development and application. *Palaeogeography*, *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 562: 110138.
- Stearns SC. 1992. The evolution of life histories. Oxford, UK: Oxford University Press.
- Stein WE, Mannolini F, Hernick LV, Landing E, Mays C. 2007. A new highpaleolatitude late Permian permineralized peat flora from the Sydney Basin, Australia. *Nature* 446: 904–907.
- Steinthorsdottir M, Woodward FI, Surlyk F, McElwain JC. 2012. Deep-time evidence of a link between elevated CO₂ concentrations and perturbations in the hydrological cycle via drop in plant transpiration. *Geology* 40: 815–818.
- Stroo A. 2000. Pollen morphological evolution in bat pollinated plants. *Plant Systematics and Evolution* 222: 225–242.
- Strullu-Derrien C, Kenrick P, Badel E, Cochard H, Tafforeau P. 2013. An overview of the hydraulic systems in early land plants. *IAWA Journal* 34: 333–351.
- Sun G, Dilcher DL, Zheng S, Zhou Z. 1998. In search of the first flower: a Jurassic angiosperm, Archaefructus, from northeast China. *Science* 27: 1692–1695.
- Swift MJ. 1977. The ecology of wood decomposition. *Science Progress* 64: 175–199.
- Tegelaar EW, Kerp H, Visscher H, Schenck P, de Leeuw JW. 1991. Bias of the paleobotanical record as a consequence of variations in the chemical composition of higher vascular plant cuticles. *Paleobiology* 17: 133–144.
- Thomas BA, Cleal CJ. 1999. Abscission in the fossil record. In: Kurmann MH, Hemsley AR, eds. *The evolution of plant architecture*. Kew, UK: Royal Botanic Gardens, 183–203.

© 2024 The Authors

New Phytologist © 2024 New Phytologist Foundation

led from https://nph.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/nph.19622 by Readcube (Labtiva Inc.), Wiley Online Library on [27/02/2024]. See the Terms and Conditions (https://on

library.wiley

nditions) on Wiley Online Library for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons Licens

Thomas BA, Cleal CJ. 2018. Arborescent lycophyte growth in the late Carboniferous coal swamps. *New Phytologist* 218: 885–890.

Thompson K, Band SR, Hodgson JG. 1993. Seed size and shape predict persistence in soil. *Functional Ecology* 7: 236–241.

Tiffney BH. 1984. Seed size, dispersal syndromes, and the rise of the angiosperms: evidence and hypothesis. *Annals of the Missouri Botanical Garden* 71: 551.

Tiffney BH. 2004. Vertebrate dispersal of seed plants through time. Annual Review of Ecology, Evolution, and Systematics 35: 1–29.

- Tomas M, Flexas J, Copolovici L, Galmes J, Hallik L, Medrano H, Ribas-Carbo M, Tosens T, Vislap V, Niinemets U. 2013. Importance of leaf anatomy in determining mesophyll diffusion conductance to CO₂ across species: quantitative limitations and scaling up by models. *Journal of Experimental Botany* 64: 2269–2281.
- Trewin NH. 1994. Depositional environment and preservation of the biota in the lower Devonian hot springs of Rhynie, Aberdeenshire, Scotland. Transactions of the Royal Society of Edinburgh: Earth Sciences 84: 433–442.
- Uhl C, Kauffman JB. 1990. Deforestation, fire susceptibility, and potential tree responses to fire in the Eastern Amazon. *Ecology* 71: 437–449.

Uhl D, Mosbrugger V. 1999. Leaf venation density as a climate and environmental proxy: a critical review and new data. *Palaeogeography Palaeoclimatology Palaeoecology* 149: 15–26.

- Vaissière BE, Vinson SB. 1994. Pollen morphology and its effect on pollenl collection by honey bees, *Apis mellifera* L. (Hymenoptera: Apidae), with special Reference to Upland Cotton, *Gossypium Hirsutum* L. (Malvaceae). *Grana* 33: 128–138.
- Vajda V, Linderson H, McLoughlin S. 2016. Disrupted vegetation as a response to Jurassic volcanism in southern Sweden. *Geological Society, London, Special Publications* 434: 127–147.
- Vaknin Y, Gan-Mor S, Bechar A, Ronen B, Eisikowitch D. 2000. The role of electrostatic forces in pollination. *Plant Systematics and Evolution* 222: 133–142.
- Vaknin Y, Hadas R, Schafferman D, Murkhovsky L, Bashan N. 2008. The potential of milk thistle (*Silybum marianum* L.), an Israeli native, as a source of edible sprouts rich in antioxidants. *International Journal of Food Sciences and Nutrition* 59: 339–346.
- Vakrahmeev VA. 1991. Jurassic and Cretaceous floras and climates of the earth. Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.
- Valenta K, Nevo O. 2020. The dispersal syndrome hypothesis: how animals shaped fruit traits, and how they did not. *Functional Ecology* 34: 1158–1169.
- Valenta K, Nevo O. 2022. The illusiveness of seed dispersal syndromes. A commentary on: fleshy fruit traits and seed dispersers: which traits define syndromes? *Annals of Botany* 129: vi–vii.
- Van der Burgh J. 1994. Differences in fossil seed/fruit-, wood-, and leaf-floras, taphonomy and ecological implications. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 83: 119–129.
- Venturas MD, Sperry JS, Hacke UG. 2017. Plant xylem hydraulics: what we understand, current research, and future challenges. *Journal of Integrative Plant Biology* 59: 356–389.
- Veromann-Jurgenson LL, Tosens T, Laanisto L, Niinemets U. 2017. Extremely thick cell walls and low mesophyll conductance: welcome to the world of ancient living! *Journal of Experimental Botany* 68: 1639–1653.

Vincent JFV. 1990. Fracture properties of plants. In: Callow JA, ed. Advances in botanical research incorporating advances in plant pathology, vol. 17. Cambridge, MA, USA: Academic Press, 235–287.

- Violle C, Navas M-L, Vile D, Kazakou E, Fortunel C, Hummel I, Garnier E. 2007. Let the concept of trait be functional! *Oikos* 116: 882–892.
- Vitali R, Belcher CM, Kaplan JO, Watson AJ. 2022. Increased fire activity under high atmospheric oxygen concentrations is compatible with the presence of forests. *Nature Communications* 13: 7285.

Vonhof MJ, Harder LD. 1995. Size-number trade-offs and pollen production by papilionaceous legumes. *American Journal of Botany* 82: 230–238.

Wang J, Pfefferkorn HW, Zhang Y, Feng Z. 2012. Permian vegetational Pompeii from Inner Mongolia and its implications for landscape paleoecology and paleobiogeography of Cathaysia. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, USA 109: 4927–4932.

Weaver L, McLoughlin S, Drinnan A. 1997. Fossil woods from the Upper Permian Bainmedart Coal Measures, northern Prince Charles Mountains, East Antarctica. AGSO Journal of Australian Geology and Geophysics 16: 655–676. Weyers JD, Lawson T. 1997. Heterogeneity in stomatal characteristics. Advances in Botanical Research 26: 317–352.

- White JD, Montañez IP, Wilson JP, Poulsen CJ, McElwain JC, DiMichele WA, Hren MT, Macarewich S, Richey JD, Matthaeus WJ. 2020. A process-based ecosystem model (Paleo-BGC) to simulate the dynamic response of Late Carboniferous plants to elevated O₂ and aridification. *American Journal of Science* **320**: 547–598.
- Williams MR, Abbott I. 1991. Quantifying average defoliation using leaf-level measurements. *Ecology* 72: 1510–1511.
- Williams VL, Witkowski ETF, Balkwill K. 2007. Relationship between bark thickness and diameter at breast height for six tree species used medicinally in South Africa. *South African Journal of Botany* 73: 449–465.

Wilson JP. 2013. Modeling 400 million years of plant hydraulics. *The Paleontological Society Papers* 19: 175–194.

- Wilson JP. 2016. Hydraulics of Psilophyton and evolutionary trends in plant water transport after terrestrialization. *Review of Palaeobotany and Palynology* 227: 65–76.
- Wilson JP, Fischer WW. 2011. Hydraulics of *Asteroxylon mackei*, an early Devonian vascular plant, and the early evolution of water transport tissue in terrestrial plants. *Geobiology* 9: 121–130.
- Wilson JP, Knoll AH. 2010. A physiologically explicit morphospace for tracheid-based water transport in modern and extinct seed plants. *Paleobiology* 36: 335–355.
- Wilson JP, Knoll AH, Holbrook M, Marshall CR. 2008. Modeling fluid flow in Medullosa, an anatomically unusual carboniferous seed plant. *Paleobiology* 34: 472–493.
- Wilson JP, Montañez IP, White JD, DiMichele WA, McElwain JC, Poulsen CJ, Hren MT. 2017. Dynamic Carboniferous tropical forests: new views of plant function and potential for physiological forcing of climate. *New Phytologist* 215: 1333–1353.
- Wilson JP, Oppler G, Reikowski E, Smart J, Marquardt C, Keller B. 2023. Physiological selectivity and plant–environment feedbacks during middle and Late Pennsylvanian plant community transitions. *Geological Society, London, Special Publications* 535: 361–382.
- Wilson JP, White JD, Dimichele WA, Hren MT, Poulsen CJ, McElwain JC, Montañez IP. 2015. Reconstructing extinct plant water use for understanding vegetation–climate feedbacks: methods, synthesis, and a case study using the Paleozoic-era medullosan seed ferns. *The Paleontological Society Papers* 21: 167–196.
- Wilson JP, White JD, Montanez IP, DiMichele WA, McElwain JC, Poulsen CJ, Hren MT. 2020. Carboniferous plant physiology breaks the mold. *New Phytologist* 227: 667–679.
- Wing SL, Boucher LD. 1998. Ecological aspects of the Cretaceous flowering plant radiation. *Annual Review of Earth and Planetary Sciences* 26: 379–421.
- Winter K, Holtum JA, Smith JAC. 2015. Crassulacean acid metabolism: a continuous or discrete trait? *New Phytologist* 208: 73–78.
- Wojewódzka A, Baczyński J, Banasiak Ł, Downie SR, Czarnocka-Cieciura A, Frankiewicz K, Spalik K. 2019. Evolutionary shifts in fruit dispersal syndromes in Apiaceae tribe Scandiceae. *Plant Systematics and Evolution* 305: 401–414.
- Wright IJ, Dong N, Maire V, Prentice IC, Westoby M, Díaz S, Gallagher RV, Jacobs BF, Kooyman R. 2017. Global climatic drivers of leaf size. *Science* 357: 917–921.
- Wright IJ, Reich PB, Westoby M, Ackerly DD, Baruch Z, Bongers F, Cavender-Baress J, Chapin T, Cornelissen JHC, Diemer M et al. 2004. The worldwide leaf economics spectrum. *Nature* 428: 821–827.
- Wu J, Serbin SP, Ely KS, Wolfe BT, Dickman LT, Grossiord C, Michaletz ST, Collins AD, Detto M, McDowell NG *et al.* 2020. The response of stomatal conductance to seasonal drought in tropical forests. *Global Change Biology* 26: 823–839.
- Yang B, Qin C, Wang J, He M, Melvin TM, Osborn TJ, Briffa KR. 2014. A 3,500year tree-ring record of annual precipitation on the northeastern Tibetan Plateau. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, USA* 111: 2903–2908.
- Yang J, Spicer RA, Spicer TEV, Li CS. 2011. 'CLAMP Online': a new web-based palaeoclimate tool and its application to the terrestrial Paleogene and Neogene of North America. *Palaeobiodiversity and Palaeoenvironments* 91: 163–183.
- Yao L, Ogle K, Lichstein JW, Jackson ST. 2022. Estimation of pollen productivity and dispersal: how pollen assemblages in small lakes represent vegetation. *Ecological Monographs* 92: e1513.
- Yiotis C, McElwain JC. 2019. A novel hypothesis for the role of photosynthetic physiology in shaping macroevolutionary patterns. *Plant Physiology* 181: 1148–1162.

- Zanne AE, Tank DC, Cornwell WK, Eastman JM, Smith SA, FitzJohn RG, McGlinn DJ, O'Meara BC, Moles AT, Reich PB *et al.* 2014. Three keys to the radiation of angiosperms into freezing environments. *Nature* 506: 89–92.
- Zanne AE, Westoby M, Falster DS, Ackerly DD, Loarie SR, Arnold SE, Coomes DA. 2010. Angiosperm wood structure: global patterns in vessel anatomy and their relation to wood density and potential conductivity. *American Journal of Botany* 97: 207–215.
- Zeisler V, Schreiber L. 2016. Epicuticular wax on cherry laurel (*Prunus laurocerasus*) leaves does not constitute the cuticular transpiration barrier. *Planta* 243: 65–81.
- Zhang J, Li H, Zhang H, Zhang H, Tang Z. 2021. Responses of litter decomposition and nutrient dynamics to nitrogen addition in temperate shrublands of North China. *Frontiers in Plant Science* 11: 618675.
- Zhang X, Gelin U, Spicer RA, Wu F, Farnsworth A, Chen P, Del Rio C, Li S, Liu J, Huang J *et al.* 2022. Rapid Eocene diversification of spiny plants in subtropical woodlands of central Tibet. *Nature Communications* 13: 3787.
- Ziemińska K, Butler DW, Gleason SM, Wright IJ, Westoby M. 2013. Fibre wall and lumen fractions drive wood density variation across 24 Australian angiosperms. *AoB Plants* 5: plt046.
- Zieminska K, Westoby M, Wright IJ. 2015. Broad anatomical variation within a narrow wood density range – a study of twig wood across 69 Australian angiosperms. *PLoS ONE* 10: e0124892.

Supporting Information

Additional Supporting Information may be found online in the Supporting Information section at the end of the article.

Notes S1 Area of a leaf.

- Notes S2 Leaf water potential.
- Notes S3 Leaf dry matter content.
- Notes S4 Leaf and leaf litter PH.
- Notes S5 Seedling functional morphology trait.
- Notes S6 Spinescence.
- Notes S7 Shoot branching architecture.
- **Table S1** Assessment of contemporary plant traits for potentialutilization as paleo-traits.
- Please note: Wiley is not responsible for the content or functionality of any Supporting Information supplied by the authors. Any queries (other than missing material) should be directed to the *New Phytologist* Central Office.

-and-conditions) on Wiley Online Library for rules of use; OA articles are governed by the applicable Creative Commons Licens

and Conditions (https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/term

4698137, 0, Downloaded from https://nph.onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/nph.19622 by Readcube (Labtiva Inc.), Wiley Online Library on [27/02/2024]. See the Terms