Introduction

Intersecting Histories of Sensibility and Emotion: A Plural Legacy*

Isabel Burdiel, Ester García Moscardó, and Elena Serrano

Je sens, donc je suis.[1] Rousseau's reformulation of the Cartesian maxim is considered the epitome of the cult of sensibility that spread from the mid-eighteenth century across national boundaries and substantially broadened the term "sensibility" beyond the capacity to receive impressions from the external world.[2] This reformulation was the product of a long and rather broken transnational evolution that spanned much of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries with disparate authors—philosophes, scientists, medical doctors, writers of all sorts—and in different parts of the world such as Britain, Italy, Germany, Netherlands, and the Americas. Its development involved nothing less than an epistemological and ontological transformation concerning the moral and emotional dimensions of sensibility, which placed it at the center of the time's debates on human nature.[3] Not only would equality in the capacity to harbor feelings prove the equality of all human beings, but it also implied overcoming dichotomies between feeling and mind, head and heart, reason and passion, knowledge, and emotion. Mathematician Marquis de Condorcet's pamphlet *Sur l'admission des femmes au droit de cité* established a fundamental link between sensibility, moral virtue, and the capacity for reasoning that opened up a far-reaching path of thought and action:

> The rights of men result solely from the fact that they are sensible beings, capable of acquiring moral ideas, and of reasoning about these ideas. Thus, women with these same qualities necessarily have equal rights.[4]

The crucial tension of this approach was always lodged in the double argument regarding the consubstantial human character of sensibility and its dimension as something socially constructed around hierarchies of individual refinement and collective civilization. This tension was always, and simultaneously, intellectual, political, moral, and aesthetic.[5]

Considering the Enlightenment and its legacy thematically, chronologically, and geographically in a broad sense, this book explores the historical and plural character of enlightened "sensibilities." Our emphasis is on how

DOI: 10.4324/9781003342236-1

sensibilities were performed, paying particular attention to the interrelationship between representations and experiences of gender, race, sexuality, class, and nation. Today, we know that the Enlightenment was not a coherent set of ideas and values, nor a coherent and finished reformist program, but a polyphonic and deeply (self-)reflexive movement of ideas and practices, in which tensions and vulnerabilities, ambivalences and contradictions, constituted the intellectual, political, and moral challenges that accompanied the entry of the Western world into modernity.[6] It was, to a large extent, the inaugural intuition of the critical relationship of different societies with themselves whose complexity, debates, and controversies must be analyzed in their historical concreteness and in the multiple crossovers that occur between the Enlightenment's various spheres. The most obvious of these ambivalences and the challenges opened up at the time refers to its controversial universalism: that is, to the Eurocentrism, racism, classism, and sexism explicit or implicit in the formulation of the Enlightenment and, above all, in its concrete practices.[7] Attempts were made to resolve, or at least elucidate, the mutual tensions and crossovers provoked in these spheres, in accord with the idea of civilization, be it individual or collective, and its relations with nature and with a possible unity amid human diversity. Intimate spaces, along with distinctions defined by family and gender, were at the heart of these debates.[8]

In this context, the constitution of what Antoine Lilti has called a "sensitive public space" was fundamental, and equally ambivalent as the Enlightenment itself: that is, a public space not only restricted to the philosophical scene but much more broadly shaped in the social world, above all, by the press and by literature—and especially by novels and the theater.[9] This was a space in which emotions (or as they were called at the time: affections, movements of the soul, passions) were as important as arguments, and which presupposed an implicit popular audience that was not particularly educated, and in which for the first time, women and young people occupied a prominent place. It was an audience that, as became evident in the debates of the time, threatened established social, cultural, and scientific hierarchies.[10]

This "sensitive public space" was, however, not only populated with sentiments and immaterial feelings, it was crowded with material things that challenged and reshaped consumers' senses, tastes, and aesthetic judgments.[11] The eighteenth century witnessed the consolidation of a global consumer society, in which science, commerce, and colonialism mutually reinforced each other.[12] Exciting scientific spectacles were staged to persuade the public of the usefulness of the new empirical sciences: to astonish audiences with the sparks that jumped between the lips of an electrified couple or to terrify them at the quivering of a dead limb excited by electrical currents in anatomical spectacles. Joyful communities of amateurs commented on their natural collections of shells, minerals, and plants, and discussed where to buy elegant scientific instruments or attend fashionable lectures.[13] Delicacies for the mouth and the body–fruits, tobaccos, chocolates, and sweets, quivering jellies, and distilled brandies—were enjoyed in European cafes and salons,

reconfiguring the boundaries between luxury and necessity, nature and culture, the educated and the rest.[14]

The Enlightenment, therefore, was something more sensual and socially broader and more significant than the philosophy of the eighteenth century. It was and is, moreover, a heritage both local and global, essentially plural. For us as historians, this implies working beyond textual rhetoric with the profoundly dialogical character of the Enlightenment, giving voice to the dissonances, ambivalences, and contradictions it entailed. In these dissonances, the historical value of a heritage susceptible to multiple appropriations is at stake, centered on a self-reflective and critical horizon that revolves around the tensions and mutual reinforcement of reason and sentiment, tolerance, and freedom—freedom of expression, as well as freedom from religious obscurantism, unreason, and political repression. This is particularly important today, as a reminder to resist the intellectually lazy temptation to surrender to the ostensible evidence that the Enlightenment is beyond our grasp.

In that sphere of experience and circulation, fiction played an outstanding role and helped to forge a sort of coordination (always plural but effective) of individual sensibilities, allowing one or several generations of readers and spectators—who were also connoisseurs, amateurs, and collectors—to share emotions and feelings, giving them the capacity to understand and recognize each other.[15] This sphere was moreover based on the notion that there is something called sensibility (or a lack of it, or a perverse play with it) that has to do with the ability (or not) to be moved, affected, or interested by the situation of others, even of nonhumans.[16] Hence the importance of sympathy (in the Enlightenment sense of the term) to share and recognize diverse forms of effective otherness.[17] This is a fundamentally social idea, based on experiences that always had more or less explicit political implications insofar as they are halfway between the "natural benevolence" that holds society together—what Samuel Johnson defined as "mutual sensibility"—and a social construction, with its intrinsic power relations prescribing what "natural feelings" are.[18]

It is this sensitive, sensual public space, linking the individual and the collective, that we aim to analyze in this volume, rescuing the possible forms of concretion of what we would today call empathy (and its opposites), though we will not find evidence of such a term because it did not yet exist. We accordingly work with a definition of sensibility that openly and fluidly participated in the rhetoric of emotions prescribed to inform the interpersonal dynamics of a formed individuality and stable society. As an all-embracing concept that involved sensations, emotions, and moral and aesthetic judgment, sensibility also worked as a mechanism for naturalizing normative constructions of behaviors, tastes, morals, and emotions. Several studies have furthermore problematized this hegemonic normativity, pointing in the opposite direction, to transgressions of normative sexual models and an increasing taste for cruelty in literature and society as a whole.[19]

We are fully aware not only of the criticisms of sentimentalism as ridiculous, banal, and/or hypocritical but also of its dark, perverse side. We are even more keenly aware of the effective possibility of its conversion into a disintegrating force or an antisocial drive. Criticism of sentimentalism, with its powerfully gendered connotations, is particularly interesting insofar as both its detractors and its defenders often make use of the same rhetoric while contributing from different perspectives, and with different purposes, to the same public space.[20]

We want to contribute a fresh perspective on the history of sensibilities, integrating ideas, emotions, beliefs, values, and perceptions in ways that the application of other terms such as ideology, *mentalité*, paradigm, and epistemes do not, or have not intended to do.[21] We are guided by the idea that "sensibility" goes beyond the history of emotions, as it incorporates an intellectual dimension; it erases the distinctions between highbrow and lowbrow culture in ways that intellectual history, and a history of *mentalités*, cannot; it transcends the theoretical concerns of these terms; and it is capable of integrating multiple perspectives, most pertinently from sensory studies. If we define sensibility as a "pattern of perception, feeling, thinking, and believing," and thus as a kind of lens, then a history of sensibilities allows us to describe how "people perceived the world" and its hierarchies. Such a history is analytical and descriptive, rather than causal.[22] It reminds us that, if the past is a foreign country, it is so largely because "people felt differently there."[23] It is the difference in the structure of sensibility, emotions, and affections that makes the past strange and familiar at once.

****

Yet a history of sensibilities is not without its dangers. The problems can be summarized in three groups. First, there are issues of methodology: How should we use a category that is not only conceptually loose and fluid but historically situated so broadly and imprecisely? Moreover, how are we to manage the disparity of sources that historians must interrogate (as we are proposing) in order to address this history of sensibilities? Second, to what extent does a history of sensibilities affect the agency of historical actors? Finally, a history of sensibilities runs the risk of creating an artificial, homogeneous, and diffusionist "spirit of the age" and of forging a mythical past from which a new or different alternative sensibility now appears to diverge, or, on the contrary, such a history runs the risk of heading toward a mythical modernity.[24]

Our response to these challenges is twofold. On the one hand, in contrast to a monolithic, static concept of sensibility, we understand sensibility as a heuristic tool that must be explored as such to test how and when it allows us to observe the variety of perceptions and ways of feeling we find in history. On the other hand, we aim to explore the mutual influence between local

sensibilities and the global context of which these form a part.[25] It is for these reasons that we use the plural form "histories of sensibilities."

Our volume engages in a transnational discussion on some of the issues mentioned above and offers new perspectives on a topic where the central object remains as contested as it is ambiguous. It explores sensibility from the intersection of history and cultural studies, and from a plural perspective including political history, the history of science, the history of literature, the history of emotions, and a history of the senses, to investigate the concrete tensions in its specific definitions. It traces these tensions in a global context in terms of gender, sexuality, race, and political languages, with a particular attention to geographical areas that have not yet been well-charted. With a primary focus on Southern Europe and the Hispanic World, we analyze the varied forms in which notions of sensibilities circulated within Europe and between Europe, the Americas, and the Hispanic-Asian Pacific, questioning normative and diffusionist views.

Considering the localized articulation of discourses and practices and their circulation and transformations across the different contexts of the Global Enlightenment, the histories of sensibilities collected in this volume are organized into two sections.[26] The chapters of the first section, "Making Sense, Making Difference," address the fundamental tensions inscribed in certain spaces and discursive productions of different racial and gendered models. We are interested in where and how the problematic articulation between concrete discourses of experience occurs. The second section, "Crossing Contexts, Unsettling Sensibilities," focuses on circulation and encounters, with particular emphasis on the destabilization of normative models that occurs in cross-cultural "contact zones" and the possible perverse drifts of sensibility that they bring about. An underlying question in both sections is a concern with how sensibility was used for fixing or transgressing masculinities and femininities, conventional desires, national identities, and racial categories.

In doing so, we aim not only to better understand the changing meanings of "Global Enlightenment" and "sensibility" but also to add to contemporary debates that problematize both gender and race as static concepts.[27] We define these as interactive, negotiated, and contested processes, and we are interested not only in what they are but in what they do in clearly situated practices. The central objective is to achieve a historical and locally active approach to the study of sensibilities from a perspective of transnational and global vocation that tries to go beyond a philosophical, abstract, and totalizing approach to sensibility, even going beyond a notion of Enlightened sensibility. We are less interested in the conceptual disquisitions and epistemological pre-emption—around terms that are frequently used in an indistinguishable way, such as sensitivities, emotions, sympathy, affections, or feelings—than in the importance of rescuing the multiple possible variations of what was expressed within, and shaped, that sensitive and sensual public

space we discussed earlier.[28] We are concerned with *when* and *how* sensibility made it possible to think of social coherence in terms of sympathy and benevolence in a world ideally governed by "soft powers," and with when and how sensibility inspired political arguments and citizens' education, while also constituting a kind of standard for "civilized" behavior that justified social hierarchies, abuses, and inequalities.[29]

These questions are addressed by Magally Alegre Henderson in her chapter, "Androginopolis or the Racialization of the Peruvian Strange Society," on the racialization of the *maricones*, where she shows that enlightened colonial elites used the social visibility of the cross-dressed man to allay the social fears provoked by the abundance of the slave population in late eighteenth-century Lima. The racialization of queers in this context represents an elite response to the problematic perception of slaves in relation to the specter of racial violence; this fear was not new, but it did become extraordinarily intense after the slave revolution in Santo Domingo, especially in the Americas and Europe. Responses to this danger were, in any case, varied. The debate about whether Black slaves could embody a modern and "civilized" subjectivity, purified of the brutal connotations that surrounded the imaginary of the "threatening Black," is the central theme of Ester García Moscardó's chapter, titled "Sensibility on Stage: Gender, Race, and the Modulations of Feeling in Hispanic Theatre." García Moscardó deals with the emergence in late eighteenth-century Spain of the literary figure of the sentimental Black within the framework of the humanitarianism Enlightenment sensibility, based on a study of the melodrama *El negro sensible* (The Sensitive Black Man) by Luciano Francisco and Joaquina Comella. The emotional politics contained in the work, firmly anchored in the codes of the culture of eighteenth-century sensibility, propose a Black masculinity worthy of compassion.

The tensions derived from the subversion of these hierarchies are studied by Estela Roselló Soberón in her chapter on Pierre Bailly's judicial experience when he tried to defend his citizenship rights as a free mulatto in late eighteenth-century New Orleans, titled "Embodied Colonial Experiences of Enlightenment: Pierre Bailly's Defense of Equality and Citizenship. A Free Mulatto's Voice in Spanish New Orleans (1791–1794)." Bailly's history exemplifies an experience and a plea that was as political as it was emotional, and that was physically embodied in a history of slavery and subjugation in which the adaptation of Enlightened and revolutionary ideas into a distinct colonial context played a pivotal role. Moving to Europe, Clorinda Donato turns to the circulation of a medical novella about the transgendered story of Catterina Vizzani by the anatomist Giovanni Bianchi in different languages and literary genders in her chapter "Translating Transgender in Eighteenth-Century Europe: The Mediatic Ecosystem of Transmission, Reworking, and Perception of *The Brief History of Catterina Vizzani*." Donato analyzes how the body, sexual practices, and identities constitute the transnational and transmedial landscape of eighteenth-century writings about gender. All these

works point to the importance of gender differences as a nodal object of debate for Enlightenment thinkers.

The sensualist epistemology that developed throughout the century reflected on the relationship between body and mind, matter and soul, and on the role played by sexual difference in modes of feeling and perceiving, including, of course, through the senses. Marta Manzanares Mileo, in her chapter "Sweet Affinities: The Gendering of Taste in Eighteenth-Century Spain," analyzes the centrality of taste in the construction of femininity and masculinity in eighteenth-century Spain. More specifically, she examines the multifaceted (and ambiguous) ways in which sweetness, increasingly consumed in the form of sugar, shaped models of womanhood at a time of slavery and growing sugar consumption. The concept of sensibility proves useful here in examining how the gendering of sugar generated various sensory meanings and emotional responses coinciding with, or resulting from, the emergence of a new consumer culture. The senses and the passions are also the focus of Elena Serrano's contribution, "Quivering Hearts: The Intimate Union of Bodies and Souls." Returning to how love and other passions were thought to arise, the chapter highlights eighteenth-century beliefs in a tight-bond between soul and body. Both philosophers and doctors conducted careful "anatomies of the soul" to unveil the links between the five external senses, feelings, and the "internal senses" (imagination, memory, and a basic understanding). For the successful Spanish popularizer B. J. Feijoo (1676–1764), however, this "knowing body" was not gendered, meaning that the physiological mechanism of the passions did not distinguish between the sexes: both men and women could "feel," Feijoo argued, with the same intensity and quality. Serrano's elucidation of Feijoo's perspective adds a layer of complexity to the increasing differentiation of male and female bodies that many scholars have found in the eighteenth century, showing instead that this distinction remained a contested territory.

The different codes and languages of emotions and political sentiments are explored by Mónica Bolufer. In a chapter on the wide-ranging transatlantic and multilingual correspondence of women with the *criollo* Francisco de Miranda (1751–1816), titled "Performing Sensibilities. Women's Voices in a Transnational and Transatlantic Correspondence of the Enlightenment," Bolufer shows how a broadly shared cosmopolitan culture created distinct gendered performances of emotional and epistolary codes expressing feelings and intellectual and political affects with linguistic, social, and geographical variations. Focusing on the later mid-nineteenth century, during the period of Romanticism in Spanish literature, Mónica Burguera explores how women writers in Spain further complicate and problematize the Enlightenment concepts of sexual and emotional difference and complementarity between men and women, conceiving sexual complementarity in terms of intellectual and virtuous equality. Her chapter, "Rewriting Romantic Love: Women, Celebrity, and the Politics of Emotion in Mid-Nineteenth-Century Spain (Avellaneda's Farewell)," shows how these female writers drew on modern

conceptions of (male) subjectivity that balanced reason and passion and how they explored hybrid conceptions of masculinity and femininity. From that perspective, they critically rethought love and marriage at the core of the new liberal society.

As noted previously, we want to further elaborate on the concept of "contact zones," first coined by Mary Louise Pratt to denote the "[conflictive] social space of cultural encounters, often in contexts of highly asymmetrical relations of power, such as colonialism, slavery, or their aftermaths."[30] We are especially interested in the dialectic between oppressive forces of domination and the negotiations these zones facilitated—in the transformations of the identities, complexities, and details of the encounters experienced on both sides. To cite Lissa Roberts, we are interested in how power and hierarchies were "temporarily suspended or modified in favor of more local economies of dependence and interest."[31] This is an approach fundamental to the whole volume, but particularly important in the chapter by Roselló Soberón on the trial of Pierre Bailly in Spanish New Orleans. It is also the central focus of the chapter by Manuel Burón and Juan Pimentel, "Hidden or Forbidden: Taboo, Circumnavigation, and Women in New Cythera (1768)," in relation to one of the most outstanding episodes of contact between cultures, which unfolded during the journey of Louis Antoine de Bougainville to Tahiti. As is well known, the French expedition included a woman named Jeanne Baret, disguised as a man, who was discovered as soon as the crew touched shore. Burón and Pimentel analyze this contact moment and consider the very different antagonistic role that women played, both in Western and Polynesian societies. Opposing taboos, the visibility and invisibility of women in those episodes, and cross-cultural misunderstandings are the main points guiding this study.

Our book is inspired by Roberts' claim that "locally based diversification needs to be recovered" in ways that highlight the creative appropriation of ideas and things and their potential circulation in global contexts. Furthermore, rather than considering the global as a given, we are interested in how it was forged through such "formative interactions" within local exchanges. To put it another way: How and in which concrete forms did these reconfigurations of sexualities, class, politics, gender, and race have impacts that were able to transcend their local effects?

We believe that this approach is essential for understanding the Enlightenment in global, transcultural, and transchronological terms—as a territory to be charted rather than as a given. This is the point of view, for instance, from which our contributor Manzanares analyzes the discursive encounters between the notions of femininity and masculinity in her focus on growing sugar consumption during a time of growing slavery. While sweetness illustrated ideas of feminine sensibility and domesticity and provided metaphors for women's sensuality and indulgence, the realities of colonialism, White supremacy, masculinity, and violence found representation in the visual and textual masculinization of the sugar industry.[32]

The dark side of sensibility, its ambivalences and its impacts, are also questions directly addressed by Enrique Moral de Eusebio in his examination of the role of ethnosexual violence in the patriarchization of the Mariana Islands during the eighteenth century. In his chapter "Vicious Sensibilities: The Role of Ethnosexual Violence in the Patriarchalization of Tåno' Låguas yan Gåni (the Mariana Islands) during the Eighteenth Century," Moral de Eusebio forcefully claims that this violence stemmed from a kind of sensibility that in fact ought to be called "vicious sensibility." Isabel Burdiel explores similar issues in her contribution, "Entangled Sensibilities and the Broken Circulation of Mary W. Shelley's *Frankenstein*: Gender, Race, and Otherness." Her chapter addresses the construction of otherness as monstrous in the context of the entangled nature of Enlightenment and Romantic sensibilities and the broken (and perverse) transtemporal circulation of Mary W. Shelley's—especially, but not only, in Southern Europe and Latin America. Burdiel analyzes the explanatory and contextual force of the various interpretations of Mary Shelley's story—scientific, political, gendered, and racial—within the questioning of strong notions such as "Truth," "the Virtues," and "Identity" that have remained inherent to the tensions of modernity as it was inaugurated when Enlightened and Romantic sensibilities fertilized and contested each other.

****

From Tahiti to New Orleans to the Mariana Islands, Madrid to Lima, Geneva to London, Oviedo to Venice, we ask how sensibility was brandished by different social, political, and cultural groups to define their identities as with or against others; how cross-cultural and cross-chronological encounters served to reconfigure ideas of gendered selves; how heterosexual and nonheterosexual relations served to empower or to subjugate non-European races; and how the circulation of local concepts of the body's physiology reinforced or challenged hegemonic ideas of masculinity and femininity.

Our path starts with the era of the expansion of trade and commodity circulation in early modern times that would lead to the Global Enlightenment and the legacy of the Enlightenment's idea of "sensibility" in the first half of the nineteenth century. The contributions to this volume explore how the lights of the Enlightenment largely determined debates about sensibility, race, and gender during much of the nineteenth century, especially during Romanticism, both in Europe and in Latin America and the Spanish-Asian Pacific. Retracing their circulation, not only geographically but transtemporally, and the variations implied by both, is one of this volume's chief aims. Recovering the local histories of plural sensibilities, our volume thus contributes to a deeper understanding of the current relevance and importance of Global Enlightenment to the history of women, gender, and race.

Notes

* This volume has been developed in the framework of the research project CIRGEN, *Circulating Gender in the Global Enlightenment: Ideas, Networks, Agencies*, funded by the European Research Council under the European Union's Horizon 2020 research and innovation program (ERC-AdG Grant Agreement No 787015).

1 "To exist, for us, is to sense; our sensibility is incontestably anterior to our intelligence, and we had sentiments before ideas." From "Profession of Faith of the Savoyard Vicar," in Jean-Jacques Rousseau, *Emile, or On Education*, trans. Allan Bloom (New York: Basic Books, 1979), 290.

2 The term "culture of sensibility" was proposed by G. J. Barker-Benfield in his *The Culture of Sensibility: Sex and Society in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992). See also Inger Sigrun Brodey, "Making Sense of Sensibility," *Persuasions: The Jane Austen Journal* 37 (2015): 62–80, and Mónica Bolufer, "Sensibilidad dieciochesca: discursos, prácticas, paradojas," in *Las mujeres y las emociones en Europa y América, siglos XVII–XIX*, ed. María Luisa Candau Chacón (Santander: Universidad de Cantabria, 2016), 29–58.

3 Jessica Riskin, *Science in the Age of Sensibility: The Sentimental Empiricists of the French Enlightenment* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2010); Stephen Gaukroger, *The Collapse of Mechanism and the Rise of Sensibility: Science and the Shaping of Modernity, 1680–1760* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010); Roy Porter, *Flesh in the Age of Reason: The Modern Foundations of Body and Soul* (London: Penguin Books, 2003); Henry Martyn Lloyd, ed., *The Discourse of Sensibility: The Knowing Body in the Enlightenment* (Cham: Springer, 2013).

4 Our translation. The original can be found in Jean-Antoine-Nicolas de Caritat marquis de Condorcet, "Sur l'admission des femmes au droit de cité," *Journal de la Société de 1789* 3 (July 1790): 1–13, on 2: "Les droits des hommes résultent uniquement de ce qu'ils sont des êtres sensibles, susceptibles d'acquérir des idées morales, et de raisonner sur ces idées. Ainsi les femmes ayant ces mêmes qualités ont nécessairement des droits êgaux." https://oll.libertyfund.org/titles/condorcet-sur-l-admission-des-femmes-au-droit-au-cite, accessed 19 February 2024.

5 Robert Muchembled, *L'Invention de l'homme moderne: sensibilités, moeurs et comportements collectifs sous l'Ancien Régime* (Paris: Fayard, 1988); Sarah Knott, *Sensibility and the American Revolution* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009); Lynn Hunt, *Inventing Human Rights* (New York: W.W Norton and Company, 2007); Julio Seoane Pinilla, *Del sentido moral a la moral sentimental: El origen sentimental de la identidad y la ciudadanía democrática* (Madrid: Siglo XXI, 2004); Roberto Romani, *Sensibilities of the Risorgimento: Reason and Passions in Political Thought* (Leiden: Brill, 2018).

6 Antoine Lilti, *L'héritage des Lumières: Ambivalences de la modernité* (Paris: Seuil/Gallimard, 2019).

7 On the limits of Enlightenment universalism, see Sarah Knott and Barbara Taylor, eds., *Women, Gender and Enlightenment* (Houndmills: Palgrave, 2005); Silvia Sebastiani, *The Scottish Enlightenment: Race, Gender, and the Limits of Progress* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013); Andrew Curran, *The Anatomy of Blackness: Science and Slavery in an Age of Enlightenment* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011); Elsa Dorlin, *La matrice de la race: Généalogie sexuelle et coloniale de la Nation française* (Paris: La Découverte, 2009); Juanma Sánchez Arteaga, *Lo bello en la naturaleza. Alejandro Malaspina: eastética, filosofía natural y blancura en el ocaso de la Ilustración (1795–1803)* (Madrid: CSIC, 2022); Laura M. Stevens, *The Poor Indians: British Missionaries, Native Americans, and Colonial Sensibility* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004); Jorge Cañizares Esguerra, *How to Write the History of the New*

World: Historiographies, Epistemologies, and Identities in the Eighteenth-Century Atlantic World (Stanford: Stanford University Press: 2001); Roberto Breña and Gabriel Puga, "Enlightenment and Counter-Enlightenment in Spanish America. Debating Historiographic Categories," *International Journal for History, Culture and Modernity* 7, no. 1 (2019): 344–371; Kris Lane, "Hispanism and the Historiography of Colonial Latin America: North American Trends/El hispanismo y la historiografía de América Latina colonial: tendencias norteamericanas," *Vínculos de Historia* 9 (2020): 92–122; Elizabeth M. Franklin Lewis, Mónica Bolufer Peruga, and Catherine M. Jaffe, eds., *The Routledge Companion to the Hispanic Enlightenment* (London: Routledge, 2019).

8 See, for example, Mónica Bolufer, *Arte y artificio de la vida en común: los modelos de comportamiento y sus tensiones en el Siglo de las Luces* (Madrid: Marcial Pons Historia, 2019), and Norbert Elias' classic study, *The Civilizing Process: The History of Manners* (New York: Urizen Books, 1978).

9 Antoine Lilti, *L'héritage des Lumières: Ambivalences de la modernité* (Paris: Seuil/Gallimard, 2019) 260–270. A wealth of literature examines the sentimental public sphere. Heather Kerr, David Lemmings, and Robert Phiddian, eds., *Passions, Sympathy and Print Culture: Public Opinion and Emotional Authenticity in Eighteenth-Century Britain* (Houndmills: Palgrave, 2016); Markman Ellis, *The Politics of Sensibility: Race, Gender, and Commerce in the Sentimental Novel* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996); Paul Goring, *The Rhetoric of Sensibility in Eighteenth-Century Culture* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005); Barbara Becker-Cantarino, ed., *The German Literature of the Eighteenth Century: The Enlightenment and Sensibility* (Rochester: Camden House, 2005); George S. Rousseau, *Nervous Acts: Essays on Literature, Culture and Sensibility* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004); Anne C. Vila, *Enlightenment and Pathology: Sensibility in the Literature and Medicine of Eighteenth-Century France* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998); Jean I. Marsden, *Theatres of Feeling: Affect, Performance, and the Eighteenth-Century Stage* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019); Anne Vincent-Buffault, *The History of Tears: Sensibility and Sentimentality in France* (Houndmills: Macmillan, 1991); María Jesús García Garrosa, *La retórica de las lágrimas: La comedia sentimental española, 1751–1802* (Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 1990); and Yvonne Fuentes Rotger, *El triángulo sentimental en el drama del Dieciocho (Inglaterra-Francia-España)* (Kassel: Edition Reichenberger, 1999).

10 Brycchan Carey, *British Abolitionism and the Rhetoric of Sensibility: Writing, Sentiment, and Slavery, 1760–1807* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005). On the roles of the new audiences of the empirical sciences, see Michel Lynn, *Popular Science and Public Opinion in Eighteenth-Century France* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2018); Jan Golinsky, *Science as Public Culture: Chemistry and Enlightenment in Britain, 1760–1820* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992); Nuria Valverde, *Actos de precisión: Instrumentos científicos, opinión pública y economía moral en la Ilustración española* (Madrid: CSIC, 2007).

11 Seminal studies here have included Neil McKendrick, John Brewer, and J. H. Plumb, *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982) and Arju Appadurai, *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986). See also Roy Porter and Marie Mulvey Roberts, eds., *Pleasure in the Eighteenth Century* (New York: New York University Press, 1996); John E. Crowley, *The Invention of Comfort: Sensibilities and Design in Early Modern Britain and Early America* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001); Nicholas Thomas, *Entangled Objects: Exchange, Material*

Culture, and Colonialism in the Pacific (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1991); Bethany Aram and Bartolomé Yun-Casalilla, *Global Goods in the Spanish Empire, 1492–1824: Circulation, Resistance, and Diversity* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014); Giorgio Riello and Anne Gerritsen, eds., *The Global Lives of Things: The Material Culture of Connections in the First Global Age* (London: Routledge, 2016); Adriana Craciun and Simon Schaffer, eds., *The Material Cultures of Enlightenment Arts and Sciences* (Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2016); Pamela Smith, *From Lived Experience to the Written Word: Reconstructing Practical Knowledge in the Early Modern World* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2022); Paola Bertucci, *Artisanal Enlightenment: Science and the Mechanical Arts in Old Regime France* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2017).

12 For a general introduction on the topic, see Roy Macleod, "Introduction," in "Nature and Empire: Science and the Colonial Enterprise," ed. Roy Macleod, special issue, *Osiris* 15 (2000): 1–13. Other excellent books on specific topics are Londa Schiebinger and Claudia Swan, eds., *Colonial Botany: Science, Commerce, and Politics in the Early Modern World* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007); Pamela Smith and Paula Findlen, eds., *Merchants and Marvels: Commerce, Science, and Art in Early Modern Europe* (New York: Routledge, 2002); Kapil Raj, *Relocating Modern Science: Circulation and the Construction of Scientific Knowledge in South Asia and Europe* (Delhi: Permanent Black, 2006).

13 A sample of the historiography on science and its publics includes Bernadette Bensaude-Vincent and Christine Blondel, eds., *Science and Spectacle in the European Enlightenment* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008); Amit Prasad, "Scientific Culture in the 'Other' Theater of 'Modern Science': An Analysis of the Culture of Magnetic Resonance Research in India," *Soc. Stud. Sci* 35 (2005): 463–489; Antonio Lafuente and Nuria Valverde, *Los mundos de la ciencia en la Ilustración española* (Madrid: Artegraf, 2003); Carlos Sanhueza Cerda, ed., *La movilidad del saber en América Latina: Objetos, Prácticas e Instituciones (siglos XVIII al XX)* (Santiago de Chile: Editorial Universitaria, 2018). On the gendered audiences of science, see Mary Terrall, "Emilie du Châtelet and the Gendering of Science," *History of Science* 33 (1995): 283–310; Mary Terrall, *The Man Who Flattened the Earth: Maupertuis and the Sciences in the Enlightenment* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2020); De Geoffrey V. Sutton, *Science for a Polite Society: Gender, Culture, and the Demonstration of Enlightenment* (New York: Routledge, 1995). On the role of gender in shaping empirical sciences, see, for instance, Francesca Antonelli, Antonella Romano, and Paolo Savoia, eds., *Gendered Touch: Women, Men, and Knowledge-Making in Early Modern Europe* (Leiden: Brill, 2023); Anna Maercker, Elena Serrano, and Simon Werrett, eds., "Enlightened Female Networks: Gendered Practices of Making Science 1720–1830," special issue, *Notes and Records* 77, no. 2 (2023).

14 Maxime Berg and Elizabeth Eger, eds., *Luxury in the Eighteenth Century: Debates, Desires and Delectable Goods* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002); Emma Spary, *Eating the Enlightenment: Food and the Sciences in Paris (1670–1760)* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012). On the senses, see Anne C. Vila, "Introduction: Powers, Pleasures and Perils of the Senses in the Enlightenment Era," in *A Cultural History of the Senses in the Age of the Enlightenment,* ed. Anne C. Vila (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2014), 1–20; David Howes and Marc Lalonde, "The History of Sensibilities: Of the Standard of Taste in Mid-Eighteenth Century England and the Circulation of Smells in Post-Revolutionary France," *Dialectical Anthropology* 16, no. 2 (1991): 125–135; Constance Classen, "Engendering Perception: Gender Ideologies and Sensory Hierarchies in Western History," *Body & Society* 3, no. 2 (1997): 1–19; Mark M. Smith, *How Race is Made: Slavery, Segregation, and the Senses* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006).

15 In addition to the works on Enlightenment and literature and arts (see note 9), we would like to mention the historiography on the history of emotions, whose theoretical sophistication in the last decades is notable. See, for instance, the works of William M. Reddy, *The Navigation of Feeling* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001); Barbara Rosenwein, *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2006); Sarah Ahmed, *The Cultural Politics of Emotions* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004); and Jo Labanyi, "Doing Things: Emotions, Affect, and Materiality," *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 11, no. 3–4 (2010): 223–233, https://doi.org/10.1080/14636204.2010.538244.

16 Rod Preece, *Awe for the Tiger, Love for the Lamb: A Chronicle of Sensibility to Animals* (New York: Routledge, 2002); Nathaniel Wolloch, *The Enlightenment's Animals: Changing Conceptions of Animals in the Long Eighteenth Century* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2019); Anita Gerrini, *Experimenting with Humans and Animals: From Galen to Animal Rights* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003); James A. Steintrager, *Cruel Delight: Enlightenment Culture and the Inhuman* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004).

17 Ildiko Csengei, *Sympathy, Sensibility and the Literature of Feeling in the Eighteenth Century* (Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012); Ryan Patrick Hanley, "The Eighteenth-Century Context of Sympathy from Spinoza to Kant," in *Sympathy: A History, Oxford Philosophical Concepts*, ed. Eric Schliesser (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015); online ed. Oxford Academic, https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199928873.003.0010, accessed 19 February 2024; Johnathan Lamb, *The Evolution of Sympathy in the Long Eighteenth Century* (London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009).

18 In Samuel Johnson's *Dictionary* (1755), sympathy is defined as "fellow-feeling; mutual sensibility; the quality of being affected by the affections [feelings] of another." Editions of 1755 and 1778, https://johnsonsdictionaryonline.com/views/search.php?term=sympathy, accessed 21 February 2024. On the moral authority of nature, see Lorraine Daston and Fernando Vidal, eds., *The Moral Authority of Nature* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003); Lorraine Daston, "The Naturalised Female Intellect," *Science in Context* 5, no. 2 (1992): 209–235.

19 Arlette Farge, *Effusion et tourment: Le récit des corps. Histoire du peuple au XVIIIè siècle* (Paris: Odile Jacob, 2007); Thomas A. Abercrombie, *Passing to América: Antonio (Née María) Yta's Transgressive, Transatlantic Life in the Twilight of the Spanish Empire* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2018); Clorinda Donato, *The Life and Legend of Catterina Vizzani: Sexual Identity, Science and Sensationalism in Eighteenth-Century Italy and England* (Liverpool: Liverpool University Press-Voltaire Foundation, 2020); Nicholas R. Jones and Chad Leahy, eds., *Pornographic Sensibilities: Imagining Sex and the Visceral in Premodern and Early Modern Spanish Cultural Production* (New York: Routledge, 2020); Marta V. Vicente, *Debating Sex and Gender in Eighteenth-Century Spain* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017); Simon Dickie, *Cruelty and Laughter: Forgotten Comic Literature and the Unsentimental Eighteenth Century* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2011); Karen Harvey, "The Century of Sex? Gender, Bodies, and Sexuality in the Long Eighteenth Century," *The Historical Journal* 45, no. 4 (2002): 899–916, http://www.jstor.org/stable/3133533; Karen Harvey, *Reading Sex in the Eighteenth Century: Bodies and Gender in English Erotic Culture* (Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 2004); Lynn Hunt, *The Invention of Pornography: Obscenity and the Origins of Modernity, 1500–1800* (New York: Zone Books, 1993); Zeb Tortorici, ed., *Sexuality and the Unnatural in Colonial Latin America* (Oakland:

University of California Press, 2016); Zeb Tortorici, *Sins Against Nature: Sex and Archives in Colonial New Spain* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2018).

20 Carolyn D. Williams: "'The Luxury of Doing Good': Benevolence, Sensibility, and the Royal Humane Society," in *Pleasure in the Eighteenth Century*, ed. Roy Porter and Marie Mulvey Roberts (London: Macmillan Press, 1996), 77–107; Karen Halttunen, "Humanitarianism and the Pornography of Pain in Anglo-American Culture," *The American Historical Review* 100, no. 2 (1995): 303–334.

21 Daniel Wickberg, "What Is the History of Sensibilities? On Cultural Histories, Old and New," *The American Historical Review* 112, no. 3 (2007): 670. The seminal work on the history of sensibilities is Lucien Febvre, "La sensibilité et l'histoire: Comment reconstituer la vie affective d'autrefois?," *Annales d'Histoire Sociale* 3 (1941): 5–20. See also Quentin Deluermoz and Hervé Mazurel, "L'Histoire des Sensibilités: un Territoire-limite?" *Critical Hermeneutics* 3, no. 1 (2019): 125–170; Salvador Bernabéu and Frédérique Langue, eds., *Fronteras y Sensibilidades en las Américas* (Madrid: Doce Calles, 2011); Alain Corbin and Hervé Mazurel, *Histoire des sensibilités* (París: Presses Universitaires de France, 2022); Hervé Mazurel, "De la psychologie des profondeurs à l'histoire des sensibilités: Une généalogie intellectuelle," *Vingtième Siècle. Revue d'histoire* 123 (2014): 22–38.

22 This definition is from Daniel Wickberg, "What Is the History of Sensibilities? On Cultural Histories, Old and New," *The American Historical Review* 112, no. 3 (2007): 675.

23 "The past is a foreign country" is the opening phrase of L. P. Hartley's *The Go-Between* (London: Hamilton, 1953).

24 Daniel Wickberg, "What Is the History of Sensibilities? On Cultural Histories, Old and New," *The American Historical Review* 112, no. 3 (2007): 661–684.

25 Sebastian Conrad, "A Cultural History of Global Transformation," in *An Emerging Global World 1750–1870,* ed. Sebastian Conrad and Jürgen Osterhammel (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2018), 413–649; Sebastian Conrad, "Enlightenment in Global History: A Historiographical Critique," *The American Historical Review* 117, no. 4 (2012): 999–1027; Sebastian Conrad, *What Is Global History?* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2016); Juan Pimentel and José Pardo-Tomás, "And Yet, We Were Modern: The Paradoxes of Iberian Science after the Grand Narratives," *History of Science* 55, no. 2 (June 2017): 133–147; Jeremy Adelman, "What Is Global History Now?," *AEON*, 2 March 2017; Lynn Hunt, *Writing History in the Global Era* (New York, London: W.W. Norton & Company, 2014); Gabriela de Lima Grecco and Sven Schuster, "Decolonizing Global History? A Latin American Perspective," *Journal of World History* 31, no. 2 (2020): 425–446, https://www.jstor.org/stable/27106154.

26 On how to apply the concept of circulation in the history of science, see Kapil Raj, "Beyond Postcolonialism … and Postpositivism: Circulation and the Global History of Science," *Isis* 104, no. 2 (2013): 337–347; Fa-ti Fan, "The Global Turn in the History of Science," *East Asian Science, Technology, and Society* 6 (2012): 249–258.

27 María Elena Martínez, *Genealogical Fictions: Limpieza de Sangre, Religion, and Gender in Colonial Mexico* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2008); Antonio Feros, *Speaking of Spain. The Evolution of Race and Nation in the Hispanic World* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2017); Staffan Müller-Wille and Hans-Jörg Rheinberger, eds., *Heredity Produced: At the Crossroads of Biology, Politics, and Culture, 1500–1870* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2007).

28 Thomas Dixon, *From Passions to Emotions: The Creation of a Secular Psychological Category* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003); Ute Frevert et al., *Emotional Lexicons: Continuity and Change in the Vocabulary of Feeling 1700–2000* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014).

29 On soft power, see Lynn Hunt, *Inventing Human Rights* (New York, W.W. Norton and Company, 2007); Mónica Bolufer, "Reasonable Sentiments: Sensibility and Balance in Eighteenth-Century Spain," in *Engaging the Emotions in Spanish Culture and History*, ed. Luisa Elena Delgado, Pura Fernández, and Jo Labanyi (Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 2016), 21–38.
30 Mary Louise Pratt, "Arts of the Contact Zone," *Profession* (1991): 33–40. See also Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (London: Routledge, 2003).
31 Lissa Roberts, "Situating Science in Global History: Local Exchanges and Networks of Circulation," *Itinerario* 33, no. 1 (2009): 9–30, on 21.
32 Editors' note: In this volume, we will capitalize "White" to indicate that it is a culturally constructed category, like Black or Indigenous, although we recognize that these identities reflect very different processes of racialization, where White functions as the hegemonic norm against which minority identities are oppressed and asserted.

References

Abercrombie, Thomas A. *Passing to América: Antonio (Née María) Yta's Transgressive, Transatlantic Life in the Twilight of the Spanish Empire*. Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2018.
Adelman, Jeremy. "What Is Global History Now?" *AEON*, March 2, 2017.
Ahmed, Sarah. *The Cultural Politics of Emotions*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004.
Antonelli, Francesca, Antonella Romano, and Paolo Savoia, eds. *Gendered Touch: Women, Men, and Knowledge-Making in Early Modern Europe*. Leiden: Brill, 2023.
Appadurai, Arju. *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986.
Aram, Bethany, and Bartolomé Yun-Casalilla. *Global Goods in the Spanish Empire, 1492–1824: Circulation, Resistance, and Diversity*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.
Barker-Benfield, G. J. *The Culture of Sensibility: Sex and Society in Eighteenth-Century Britain*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992.
Becker-Cantarino, Barbara, ed. *The German Literature of the Eighteenth Century: The Enlightenment and Sensibility*. Rochester: Camden House, 2005.
Bensaude-Vincent, Bernadette, and Christine Blondel, eds. *Science and Spectacle in the European Enlightenment*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008.
Berg, Maxime, and Elizabeth Eger, eds. *Luxury in the Eighteenth Century: Debates, Desires and Delectable Goods*. London: Palgrave McMillan, 2002.
Bernabéu, Salvador, and Frédérique Langue, eds. *Fronteras y Sensibilidades en las Américas*: Madrid: Doce Calles/MASCIPO, 2011.
Bertucci, Paola. *Artisanal Enlightenment Science and the Mechanical Arts in Old Regime France*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2017.
Bolufer, Mónica. *Arte y artificio de la vida en común: los modelos de comportamiento y sus tensiones en el Siglo de las Luces*. Madrid: Marcial Pons Historia, 2019.
Bolufer, Mónica. "Sensibilidad dieciochesca: discursos, prácticas, paradojas." In *Las mujeres y las emociones en Europa y América, siglos XVII–XIX*, edited by María Luisa Candau Chacón, 29–58. Santander: Universidad de Cantabria, 2016.
Bolufer, Mónica, Carolina Blutrach, and Juan Gomis, eds. *Educar los sentimientos y las costumbres: Una Mirada desde la historia*. Zaragoza: IFC, 2014.
Breña, Roberto, and Gabriel Puga. "Enlightenment and Counter-Enlightenment in Spanish America. Debating Historiographic Categories." *International Journal for History, Culture and Modernity* 7, no. 1 (2019): 344–371

Brodey, Inger Sigrun. "Making Sense of Sensibility." *Persuasions: The Jane Austen Journal* 37 (2015): 62–80.
Cañizares Esguerra, Jorge. *How to Write the History of the New World: Historiographies, Epistemologies, and Identities in the Eighteenth-Century Atlantic World*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2001.
Carey, Brycchan. *British Abolitionism and the Rhetoric of Sensibility: Writing, Sentiment, and Slavery, 1760–1807*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2005.
Classen, Constance. "Engendering Perception: Gender Ideologies and Sensory Hierarchies in Western History." *Body & Society* 3, no. 2 (1997): 1–19.
Conrad, Sebastian. "A Cultural History of Global Transformation." In *An Emerging Global World 1750–1870*, edited by Sebastian Conrad and Jürgen Osterhammel, 413–649. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2018.
Conrad, Sebastian. "Enlightenment in Global History: A Historiographical Critique." *The American Historical Review* 117, no. 4 (2012): 999–1027.
Conrad, Sebastian. *What is Global History?* Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2016.
Corbin, Alain, and Hervé Mazurel. *Histoire des sensibilités*. Paris: Presses Universitaires de France, 2022.
Craciun, Adriana, and Simon Schaffer, eds. *The Material Cultures of Enlightenment Arts and Sciences*. Basingstoke: Palgrave, 2016.
Crowley, John E. *The Invention of Comfort: Sensibilities and Design in Early Modern Britain and Early America*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2001.
Csengei, Ildiko. *Sympathy, Sensibility and the Literature of Feeling in the Eighteenth Century*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012.
Curran, Andrew. *The Anatomy of Blackness: Science and Slavery in an Age of Enlightenment*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2011.
Daston, Lorraine. "The Naturalised Female Intellect." *Science in Context* 5, no. 2 (1992): 209–235.
Daston, Lorraine, and Fernando Vidal, eds. *The Moral Authority of Nature*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2003.
Delgado, Luisa Elena, Pura Fernández, and Jo Labanyi, eds. *Engaging the Emotions in Spanish Culture and History*. Nashville: Vanderbilt University Press, 2016.
Deluermoz, Quentin, and Hervé Mazurel. "L'Histoire des Sensibilités: un Territoire-limite?" *Critical Hermeneutics* 3, no. 1 (2019): 125–170. https://doi.org/10.13125/CH/3878.
Dickie, Simon. *Cruelty and Laughter: Forgotten Comic Literature and the Unsentimental Eighteenth Century*. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 2011.
Dixon, Thomas. *From Passions to Emotions: The Creation of a Secular Psychological Category*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
Donato, Clorinda. *The Life and Legend of Catterina Vizzani: Sexual Identity, Science and Sensationalism in Eighteenth-Century Italy and England*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press-Voltaire Foundation, 2020.
Dorlin, Elsa. *La matrice de la race: Généalogie sexuelle et coloniale de la Nation française*. Paris: La Découverte, 2009.
Dror, Otniel E. et al. "An Introduction to History of Science and the Emotions." *Osiris* 31, no. 1 (2016): 1–18. https://doi.org/10.1086/687590.
Elias, Norbert. *The Civilizing Process: The History of Manners*. New York: Urizen Books, 1978.
Ellis, Markman. *The Politics of Sensibility: Race, Gender, and Commerce in the Sentimental Novel*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
Fan, Fa-ti. "The Global Turn in the History of Science." *East Asian Science, Technology, and Society* 6 (2012): 249–258

Farge, Arlette. *Effusion et tournament: Le récit des corps. Histoire du peuple au XVIIIè siècle*. Paris: Odile Jacob, 2007.
Febvre, Lucien. "La sensibilité et l'histoire: Comment reconstituer la vie affective d'autrefois?" *Annales d'Histoire Sociale* 3 (1941): 5–20.
Feros, Antonio. *Speaking of Spain. The Evolution of Race and Nation in the Hispanic World*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2017.
Frevert, Ute et al. *Emotional Lexicons: Continuity and Change in the Vocabulary of Feeling 1700–2000*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.
Fuentes Rotger, Yvonne. *El triángulo sentimental en el drama del Dieciocho (Inglaterra-Francia-España)*. Kassel: Edition Reichenberger, 1999.
García Garrosa, María Jesús. *La retórica de las lágrimas: La comedia sentimental española, 1751–1802*. Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 1990.
Gaukroger, Stephen. *The Collapse of Mechanism and the Rise of Sensibility: Science and the Shaping of Modernity, 1680–1760*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010.
Gerrini, Anita. *Experimenting with Humans and Animals: From Galen to Animal Rights*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2003.
Golinsky, Jan. *Science as Public Culture: Chemistry and Enlightenment in Britain, 1760–1820*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.
Goring, Paul. *The Rhetoric of Sensibility in Eighteenth-Century Culture*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
Halttunen, Karen. "Humanitarianism and the Pornography of Pain in Anglo-American Culture." *The American Historical Review* 100, no. 2 (1995): 303–334.
Harvey, Karen. "The Century of Sex? Gender, Bodies, and Sexuality in the Long Eighteenth Century." *The Historical Journal* 45, no. 4 (2002): 899–916. www.jstor.org/stable/3133533.
Harvey, Karen. *Reading Sex in the Eighteenth Century: Bodies and Gender in English Erotic Culture*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
Howes, David, and Marc Lalonde. "The History of Sensibilities: Of the Standard of Taste in Mid-Eighteenth Century England and the Circulation of Smells in Post-Revolutionary France." *Dialectical Anthropology* 16, no. 2 (1991): 125–135
Hunt, Lynn. *Inventing Human Rights*. New York: W.W Norton and Company, 2007.
Hunt, Lynn. *The Invention of Pornography: Obscenity and the Origins of Modernity, 1500–1800*. New York: Zone Books, 1993.
Hunt, Lynn. *Writing History in the Global Era*. New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2014.
Jones, Nicholas R., and Chad Leahy, eds. *Pornographic Sensibilities: Imagining Sex and the Visceral in Premodern and Early Modern Spanish Cultural Production*. New York: Routledge, 2020.
Kerr, Heather, David Lemmings, and Robert Phiddian, eds. *Passions, Sympathy and Print Culture: Public Opinion and Emotional Authenticity in Eighteenth-Century Britain*. Houndmills: Palgrave, 2016.
Knott, Sarah. *Sensibility and the American Revolution*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2009.
Knott, Sarah and Barbara Taylor, eds. *Women, Gender and Enlightenment*. Houndmills: Palgrave, 2005.
La Vopa, J. Anthony. *The Labor of the Mind: Intellect and Gender in Enlightenment Cultures*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2017.
Labanyi, Jo. "Doing Things: Emotions, Affect, and Materiality." *Journal of Spanish Cultural Studies* 11, no. 3–4 (2010). https://doi.org/10.1080/14636204.2010.538244.
Lafuente Antonio, and Nuria Valverde. *Los mundos de la ciencia en la Ilustración española*. Madrid: Artegraf, 2003.

Lamb, Johnathan. *The Evolution of Sympathy in the Long Eighteenth Century*. London: Pickering & Chatto, 2009.
Lane, Kris. "Hispanism and the Historiography of Colonial Latin America: North American Trends/El hispanismo y la historiografía de América Latina colonial: tendencias norteamericanas." *Vínculos de Historia* 9 (2020): 92–122.
Lettow, Susanne, ed. *Reproduction, Race and Gender in Philosophy and the Early Life Sciences*. Albany: State University of New York, 2014.
Lewis, Elizabeth M. Franklin, Mónica Bolufer Peruga, and Catherine M. Jaffe, eds. *The Routledge Companion to the Hispanic Enlightenment*. London: Routledge, 2019.
Lilti, Antoine. *L'héritage des Lumières. Ambivalences de la modernité*. Paris: Seuil/Gallimard, 2019.
Lima Grecco, Gabriela de, and Sven Schuster. "Decolonizing Global History? A Latin American Perspective." *Journal of World History* 31, no. 2 (2020): 425–446. https://www.jstor.org/stable/27106154.
Lloyd, Henry Martyn, ed. *The Discourse of Sensibility: The Knowing Body in the Enlightenment*. Heidelberg, New York and Dordrecht: Springer, 2013.
Lynn, Michel. *Popular Science and Public Opinion in Eighteenth-Century France*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2018.
Macleod, Roy. "Introduction." In Roy Macleod, ed. "Nature and Empire: Science and the Colonial Enterprise." Special issue, *Osiris* 15 (2000): 1–13.
Maercker, Anna, Elena Serrano, and Simon Werrett, eds. "Enlightened Female Networks: Gendered Practices of Making Science 1720–1830." Special issue, *Notes and Records* 77, no. 2 (2023).
Marsden, Jean I. *Theatres of Feeling: Affect, Performance, and the Eighteenth-Century Stage*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019.
Martínez, María Elena. *Genealogical Fictions: Limpieza de Sangre, Religion, and Gender in Colonial Mexico*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2008.
Mazurel, Hervé. "De la psychologie des profondeurs à l'histoire des sensibilités: Une généalogie intellectuelle." *Vingtième Siècle. Revue d'histoire* 123 (2014): 22–38.
McKendrick, Neil, John Brewer, and J. H. Plumb. *The Birth of a Consumer Society: The Commercialization of Eighteenth-Century England*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1982.
Muchembled, Robert. *L'Invention de l'homme moderne: sensibilités, moeurs et comportements collectifs sous l'Ancien Régime*. Paris: Fayard, 1988.
Müller-Wille, Staffan, and Hans-Jörg Rheinberger, eds. *Heredity Produced: At the Crossroads of Biology, Politics, and Culture, 1500–1870*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2007.
Pimentel, Juan, and José Pardo-Tomás. "And Yet, We Were Modern: The Paradoxes of Iberian Science after the Grand Narratives." *History of Science* 55, no. 2 (2017): 133–147.
Porter, Roy. *Flesh in the Age of Reason: The Modern Foundations of Body and Soul*. London: Penguin Books, 2003.
Porter, Roy, and Marie Mulvey Roberts, eds. *Pleasure in the Eighteenth Century*. New York: New York University Press, 1996.
Prasad, Amit. "Scientific Culture in the 'Other' Theater of 'Modern Science': An Analysis of the Culture of Magnetic Resonance Research in India." *Social Studies of Science* 35 (2005): 463–489.
Pratt, Mary Louise. "Arts of the Contact Zone." *Profession* (1991): 33–40.
Pratt, Mary Louise. *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*. London and New York: Routledge, 2003.
Preece, Rod. *Awe for the Tiger, Love for the Lamb: A Chronicle of Sensibility to Animals*. New York: Routledge, 2002.

Raj, Kapil. "Beyond Postcolonialism … and Postpositivism: Circulation and the Global History of Science." *Isis* 104, no. 2 (2013): 337–347
Raj, Kapil. *Relocating Modern Science: Circulation and the Construction of Scientific Knowledge in South Asia and Europe*. New Delhi: Permanent Black, 2006.
Reddy, William M. *The Navigation of Feeling*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
Riello, Giorgio, and Anne Gerritsen, eds. *The Global Lives of Things: The Material Culture of Connections in the First Global Age*. London: Routledge, 2016.
Riskin, Jessica. *Science in the Age of Sensibility: The Sentimental Empiricists of the French Enlightenment*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2010.
Roberts, Lissa. "Situating Science in Global History: Local Exchanges and Networks of Circulation." *Itinerario* 33, no. 1 (2009): 9–30.
Romani, Roberto. *Sensibilities of the Risorgimento: Reason and Passions in Political Thought*. Leiden: Brill, 2018.
Rosenwein, Barbara. *Emotional Communities in the Early Middle Ages*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2006.
Rousseau, George S. *Nervous Acts: Essays on Literature, Culture and Sensibility*. Houndmills: Palgrave Macmillan, 2004.
Sánchez Arteaga, Juanma. *Lo bello en la naturaleza: Alejandro Malaspina: estética, filosofía natural y blancura en el ocaso de la Ilustración (1795–1803)*. Madrid: CSIC, 2022.
Sanhueza Cerda, Carlos, ed. *La movilidad del saber en América Latina: Objetos, Prácticas e Instituciones (siglos XVIII al XX)*. Santiago de Chile: Editorial Universitaria, 2018.
Schiebinger, Londa, and Claudia Swan, eds. *Colonial Botany: Science, Commerce, and Politics in the Early Modern World*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2007.
Sebastiani, Silvia. *The Scottish Enlightenment: Race, Gender, and the Limits of Progress*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
Seoane Pinilla, Julio. *Del sentido moral a la moral sentimental: El origen sentimental de la identidad y la ciudadanía democrática*. Madrid: Siglo XXI, 2004.
Smith, Mark M. *How Race is Made: Slavery, Segregation, and the Senses*. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2006.
Smith, Pamela. *From Lived Experience to the Written Word: Reconstructing Practical Knowledge in the Early Modern World*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2022.
Smith, Pamela, and Paula Findlen, eds. *Merchants and Marvels: Commerce, Science, and Art in Early Modern Europe*. New York: Routledge, 2002.
Spary, Emma. *Eating the Enlightenment: Food and the Sciences in Paris (1670–1760)*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2012.
Steintrager, James A. *Cruel Delight: Enlightenment Culture and the Inhuman*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 2004.
Stevens, Laura M. *The Poor Indians: British Missionaries, Native Americans, and Colonial Sensibility*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2004.
Sutton, De Geoffrey V. *Science for a Polite Society: Gender, Culture, and the Demonstration of Enlightenment*. New York: Routledge, 1995.
Terrall, Mary. "Emilie du Châtelet and the Gendering of Science." *History of Science* 33 (1995): 283–310.
Terrall, Mary. *The Man Who Flattened the Earth: Maupertuis and the Sciences in the Enlightenment*. Chicago: Chicago University of Chicago Press, 2020.
Thomas, Nicholas. *Entangled Objects: Exchange, Material Culture, and Colonialism in The Pacific*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1991.

Tortorici, Zeb, ed. *Sexuality and the Unnatural in Colonial Latin America*. Oakland: University of California Press, 2016.
Tortorici, Zeb. *Sins Against Nature: Sex and Archives in Colonial New Spain*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2018.
Valverde, Nuria. *Actos de precisión: Instrumentos científicos, opinión pública y economía moral en la Ilustración española*. Madrid: CSIC, 2007.
Vicente, Marta V. *Debating Sex and Gender in Eighteenth-Century Spain*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2017.
Vila, Anne C. *Enlightenment and Pathology: Sensibility in the Literature and Medicine of Eighteenth-Century France*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1998.
Vila, Anne C. "Introduction: Powers, Pleasures and Perils of the Senses in the Enlightenment Era." In *A Cultural History of the Senses in the Age of the Enlightenment,* edited by Anne C. Vila, 1–20. London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2014.
Vincent-Buffault, Anne. *The History of Tears: Sensibility and Sentimentality in France*. Houndmills: Macmillan, 1991.
Wickberg, Daniel. "What Is the History of Sensibilities? On Cultural Histories, Old and New." *The American Historical Review* 112, no. 3 (2007): 661–684.
Williams, Carolyn D. "'The Luxury of Doing Good': Benevolence, Sensibility, and the Royal Humane Society." In *Pleasure in the Eighteenth Century*, edited by Roy Porter and Marie Mulvey Roberts, 77–107. London: Macmillan Press, 1996.
Wolloch, Nathaniel. *The Enlightenment's Animals: Changing Conceptions of Animals in the Long Eighteenth Century*. Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2019.