The gender pay gap
An analysis of sectorial dynamics

Núria Sánchez Mira
Pilar Carrasquer Oto
Martí López Andreu
Albert Trinidad Sánchez

29th SASE ANNUAL MEETING
What's Next? Disruptive/Collaborative Economy or Business as Usual?

Session G-24 Gender Inequalities in Employment
Lyon, 1st of July 2017
The gender pay gap: an analysis of sectorial dynamics

Nuria Sánchez Mira
Pilar Carrascal Otto
Martí López Andrew
Albert Teixidó Sánchez

The sector of activity: a suitable scenario?

- From the point of view of analysis:
  - Occupational segregation and salaried women’s employment
  - Productive processes and working conditions
  - Regulation of employment and equality
- From the point of view of intervention:
  - Sector-based collective bargaining

Main research questions

- Is it possible to identify productive and organisational dynamics in order to fight the Gender Pay Gap (GPG)?
- Do these variables differ in the performance of factors, such as remuneration, in different economic branches of the GPC?

Definition and measurement issues

Findings

A gender typing of sectors

Final remarks

A focus on activity sectors, a valid approach?

- Drawn attention to working conditions, work organisation, labour force management, but...
- Limitations of a quantitative approach
- ... definition of activity sector as unit of analysis
The sector of activity: a suitable scenario?

From the point of view of analysis:
- Occupational segregation and value of women's employment
- Productive processes and working conditions
- Regulation of employment and wages

From the point of view of intervention:
- Sector-based collective bargaining

Definition and measurement issues

Main research questions
- Is it possible to identify productive and organizational contexts more or less prone to the Gender Pay Gap (GPG)?
- To what extent different constellations of factors may be interacting in shaping diverse expressions of the GPG in various contexts?
Definition and measurement issues

- Individual characteristics vs Institutional, productive, organizational factors
- Decomposition vs complexity
- Data source and measures

- Sector of activity: productive structures, employment relations, working conditions
- Mixed methods approach: Cluster analysis and case studies of selected sectors
- Average gross monthly earnings and wage components
Main research questions

- Is it possible to identify productive and organizational contexts more or less prone to the Gender Pay Gap (GPG)?

- To what extent different constellations of factors may be interacting in shaping diverse expressions of the GPG in various contexts?
The sector of activity: a suitable scenario?

**From the point of view of analysis:**
- Occupational segregation and value of women's employment
- Productive processes and working conditions
- Regulation of employment and wages

**From the point of view of intervention:**
- Sector-based collective bargaining

---

**Definition and measurement issues**
- Individual characteristics vs Institutional, productive, organizational factors
- Decomposition vs complexity
- Data source and measures

**Main research questions**
- Is it possible to identify productive and organizational contexts more or less prone to the Gender Pay Gap (GPG)?
- To what extent different constellations of factors may be interacting in shaping diverse expressions of the GPG in various contexts?
Findings

Cluster analysis

Key sector case studies

A successful? typology of sectors

DATA:
• Structure of Earnings Survey (SES), 2010
• EU Activity Sectors (NACE 2008)

TWO-STEP PROCEDURE:
• STEP 1: Principal component analysis: 6 variables, resulting in 3 components
  • 1) Wage composition (weight of base salary and special payments)
  • 2) Gender Pay Gap Structure (SPG over base salary and special payments)
  • 3) Feminization and value of employment (percentage of women and average monthly earnings in activity sector)
• STEP 2: Hierarchical clustering analysis
  • RESULT: 9 groups

Preliminary findings of in-depth sectorial studies

Selected sectors and fieldwork

Main preliminary findings

Synthesis ideas:
• Sectoral diversity
• Gender pay gap
• Change in educational and occupational structures
• Change in skill mix and in employment patterns

Results: data available to provide regional maps.
A successful? typology of sectors

DATA:
- Structure of Earnings Survey (ES), 2010
- 82 Activity Sectors (NACE2009).

TWO-STEP PROCEDURE:
- STEP 1. Principal component analysis: 6 variables, resulting in 3 components
  - 1) Wage composition (weight of base salary and special payments)
  - 2) Gender Pay Gap Structure (GPG over base salary and special payments)
  - 3) Feminization and value of employment (percentage of women and average monthly earnings in activity sector)
- STEP 2: Hierarchical clustering analysis
- RESULT: 9 groups

Resulting groups
- 1: GPG limited by the reduced presence of women, mainly in industrial contexts.
- 2: GPG above average in feminized sectors with the lowest wages after group 7. Diverse activities, both industrial and services. Retail, accommodation and food and beverage services.
- 3: GPG below average in most masculinized contexts (after group 1). Skilled employment, relatively high wages. Industrial contexts.
- 4: Highest GPG, in notably feminized contexts, with wages below average. Services activities, mainly auxiliary services.
- 5: Average GPG, basically on the base salary, in relatively masculinized context and wages above average. Diverse sectors. ICT (media, programming).
- 6: High GPG in masculinized, skilled sectors, with the highest wages. Diverse sectors. Financial services.
- 7: High GPG despite low wages. Most feminized context and with lowest wages, including administrative and care activities.
- 8: High GPG, despite the public regulation of wages, in feminized context with the highest average wage after group 6. Healthcare.
- 9: Smallest GPG, attributable to the public regulation of wages. Public Administration and Education.

Synthesis ideas
- Intrasectorial diversity
- Causal complexity
- Strange bedfellows and unexpectedly estranged partners
Resulting groups

1: GPG limited by the reduced presence of women, mainly in industrial contexts.
2: GPG above average, in feminized sectors, with the lowest wages after group 7. Diverse activities, both industrial and services. Retail, accommodation and food and beverage services.
3: GPG below average in most masculinized contexts (after group 1). Skilled employment, relatively high wages, industrial contexts.
4: Highest GPG, in notably feminized contexts, with wages below average. Services activities, mainly auxiliary services.
5: Average GPG, basically on the base salary, in relatively masculinized context and wages above average. Diverse sectors. ICT (media, programming).
6: High GPG in masculinized, skilled sectors, with the highest wages. Diverse sectors. Financial services.
7: High GPG despite low wages. Most feminized context and with lowest wages, including administrative and care activites.
8: High GPG, despite the public regulation of wages, in feminized context with the highest average wage after group 6. Healthcare.
9: Smallest GPG, attributable to the public regulation of wages. Public Administration and Education.

Synthesis ideas

- Intrasectorial diversity
- Causal complexity
- Strange bedfellows and unexpectedly estranged partners
Findings

Cluster analysis

A successful? typology of sectors

DATA:
- Structure of Earnings Survey (SES), 2010
- E3 Activity Sectors (NACE 2008)

TWO-STEP PROCEDURE:
- STEP 1: Principal component analysis; 6 variables, resulting in 3 components
  - 1) Wage composition (weight of base salary and special payments)
  - 2) Gender Pay Gap Structure (GPG over base salary and special payments)
  - 3) Femization and value of employment (percentage of women and average monthly earnings in activity sector)
- STEP 2: Hierarchical clustering analysis
- RESULT: 9 groups

Preliminary findings of in-depth sectorial studies

Selected sectors and fieldwork

Synthesis ideas:
- Technical diversity
- Institutional context
- Contextual factors
- Integrating differences and similarities across sectors

Main preliminary findings
Preliminary findings of in-depth sectorial studies

Selected sectors and fieldwork

1) Chemical Industry
   1.1) Manufacture of chemicals
   1.2) Manufacture of pharmaceuticals
   1.3) Manufacture of rubber and plastic products

2) Financial and Insurance Activities
   2.1) Financial Services
   2.2) Auxiliary activities

3) Core Services
   3.1) Retail trade
   3.2) Health care

Main preliminary findings

1) Chemical Industry
   Key Ideas
   - National and sectoral standardization
   - Existing framework for risk prevention

2) Financial Services
   Key Ideas
   - National framework organized to protect consumers
   - Lending practices and provisions

3) Core Services
   Key Ideas
   - Centralization of institutions for risk prevention
   - Existing framework for risk prevention

Regional level

Company level

Interviews with key informants

Interviews with worker's representative and human resources managers

Interviews with workers, representatives, and human resources managers

Analysis of gender equality policies

Payment structures

Working time

Non-factorial effects, non-linear and hierarchical relationships

Analysis of costs and benefits of risk prevention and mitigation

Analysis of gender equality policies

Analysis of costs and benefits of risk prevention and mitigation

Analysis of gender equality policies
Selected sectors and fieldwork

1) Chemical industry
   1.1.) Manufacture of chemicals
   1.2.) Manufacture of pharmaceutical
   1.3.) Manufacture of rubber and plastic

   National level:
   - Revision of collective agreements
   - Interviews with key informants and collective agreement negotiators

   Regional level:
   - Interviews with key informants

   Company level:
   - Interviews with worker’s representatives and human resources managers

2) Financial and insuring activities
   2.1.) Financial Services
   2.2.) Auxiliary activities

   National level:
   - Revision of collective agreements
   - Interviews with key informants and collective agreement negotiators

   Regional level:
   - Interviews with key informants
   - Focus groups with employees

   Company level:
   - Interviews with worker’s representatives (and human resources managers)
   - Analysis of gender equality plans

3) Care Services
   3.1.) Residential care
   3.2.) Domiciliary care

   National level:
   - Revision of collective agreements
   - Interviews with key informants and collective agreement negotiators

   Regional level:
   - Interviews with key informants
   - Focus groups with employees

   Company level:
   - Interviews with worker’s representatives (and human resources managers)
Main preliminary findings

1) Chemical industry
- Horizontal and vertical segregation
- Discretionality in bonuses and special payments
- National framework agreement & pacts at company level
- Strong negotiating social agents
- Distance agreement - reality
- Detailed definition of professional groups... but gendered access and promotion
- Lack of transparency - Discretionality in promotions - Positions of trust
- Complexity
- Aggregation of bonuses but...
- Personal bonuses
- Part-time residual
- Flexible working-time arrangements in non-productive units

2) Financial services
- Vertical segregation
- Working time (presentational)
- Performance-based pay systems
- National framework agreement
- But... room for discretionality
- Strong negotiating social agents
- Pacts at company level
- One professional group with different pay levels
- Lack of transparency - Discretionality in promotions - Positions of trust
- Weight of variable retribution
- Performance-based pay systems
- Prolongation of working time, deregulation, presentationalism

3) Care Services
- Low wages rather than GPG
- Few men, among managerial and technical personnel
- Value of professions
- Fragmentation of collective bargaining and social agents involved
- Undervaluing of women's work embedded in professional categories
- Indefinition functions, polivalence
- Lack of promotion scales
- Base salary + Payments related to working time and availability
- Part-time in domiciliary care
- Travel time between services
- Workload in residential care
A successful? typology of sectors

DATA:
- Structure of Earnings Survey (SES) 2010
- 52 Activity Sectors (NACE 2009)

TWO-STEP PROCEDURE:
- STEP 1: Principal component analysis: 6 variables, resulting in 3 components
  - 1) Wage composition (weight of base salary and special payments)
  - 2) Gender Pay Gap (Structure (SPG over base salary and special payments)
  - 3) Feminization and value of employment (percentage of women and average monthly earnings in activity sector)
- STEP 2: Hierarchical clustering analysis
  - RESULT: 9 groups

Synthesis ideas:
- Employment diversity
- Gender gap
- Trends in female employment and a temporary employment pattern

Preliminary findings of in-depth sectorial studies

Selected sectors and fieldwork

Main preliminary findings
Final remarks

A focus on activity sectors, a valid approach?

- Draws attention to working conditions, work organization, labour force management, but...
- ...limitations of a quantitative approach
- ...definition of activity sector as unit of analysis
The gender pay gap
An analysis of sectorial dynamics

Nuria Sánchez-Mira
Pilar Carrasco-Oto
Marí Llopis-Andreu
Albert Trinidad-Sánchez

The sector of activity: a suitable scenario?

- From the point of view of analysis:
  - Occupational segregation and salaried women's employment
  - Productive processes and working conditions
  - Regulation of employment and wages
- From the point of view of interventions:
  - Sector-based collective bargaining

Definition and measurement issues

Main research questions

- Is it possible to identify productive and organizational conditions that facilitate or hinder the Gender Pay Gap (GPG)?
- Is there some difference in the dynamics of factors for measuring, in different gender compositions of the GPG analysis?

Findings

- Quick analysis
- Key sector and groups

Final remarks

- A focus on activity sectors, a valid approach?
  - Draw attention to working conditions, work organization, labour force management, but...
  - Limitations of a qualitative approach
  - Definition of activity sector as unit of analysis