Intuition and formal structure in Schoenberg's George - Lieder

KATHERINE M. CYRAN

A manifestation of a highly innovative and artistically volatile period, atonality characterized the musical products of the pre-World War I years whereby increasingly subjective demands gave way to a new musical language and opened the doors to a realm of unexplored possibilities and untapped resources for more immediate and urgent musical expression.

Remarkably, a large number of the first atonal works in which Schoenberg and his pupils were exploiting these newly found resources are Lieder. In fact, this vocal genre was the almost exclusive preoccupation and compositional output of Schoenberg’s efforts in the critical years of his non-tonal activities, 1907-1909. Dispelling functional harmony, Schoenberg’s rejection of a tonal framework removed traditional means of formal organization ultimately based upon harmonic relationships to a fundamental tonal center. It would seem, therefore, that poetry provided the necessary «extra-musical» infrastructure to lend order and cohesion to an atonal «system» which had dissolved conventional concepts of musical logic and solidified no others. Yet, as it will become evident in the songs themselves, «the outward correspondence between music and text, as exhibited in declamation, tempo, and dynamics, has little to do with the inner correspondence». 1

Instead Schoenberg emphasizes the importance of


what the work of art has to give and not its external stimulus. With compositions based on poetry the exactness of rendering the action is as irrelevant to its artistic values as the resemblance to the model is for a portrait. A hundred years later no one will be able to check the likeness, but the artistic effect will always remain. This effect will exist . . . because the artist appeals to us, the person who expressed himself here and who must be recognized . . . in a higher degree of reality.

Certainly, then, the poetic-musical affiliation is more than simply a solution to an initial musical problem. Instead there exists a deeper level of correspondence reflecting the artistic and philosophical ideals of Schoenberg. Consequently, an analysis of some of Schoenberg’s works based on texts lends insight into the deeper issues, the forces cultivating the preoccupations of the artist and stimulating his stylistic innovations.

Vienna at the turn of the century was characterized by a blatant aestheticism through which the ills of a troubled society were hidden under a façade of hedonistic frivolity and an indifference to anything beyond a «light-hearted enjoyment» of all the arts. «Dabbling at art made time pass agreeably without exacting any commitment to larger issues.» Current artistic trends exploited this hedonistic flavor of Viennese society. The rich ornateness of art, saturated with ornament, decoration, and rich and glowing color, became a means of beautifying the daily life and domestic environment of an ailing society and of sublimating man’s discontent and fear in an unstable, modernizing world. Comfortable complacency and ignorant security were fostered through a «cult of beauty» whose «temple of art» became a sanctuary for existence.

Interpreting these developments as manifest symptoms of a static and decadent society, a circle of intellectuals advocated the «noble destruction of Vienna’s culture» through a questioning and re-defining

5Ibid., p. 119.
7SCHORSKE, p. 216.
of acquired values and accepted social standards in an effort to invigorate a dying society and reverse the regressive trend in which direction Viennese life had turned. Social reform was directed to treating these symptoms, and art became the medium to do so. Each artistic genre forged beyond conventional means of representation and cultivated a new language whose communication and comprehension required an active participation by the viewer/listener, stirring his consciousness, shaking him out of his complacency, diminishing his tendency to drift into comfortable fantasy, stimulating him instead to look at, acknowledge, and deal with reality rather than to slip behind a façade of artifice provided by the aesthetic dimension. Art as an escape from an alienating, unfriendly world became art as a therapeutic device for coming to terms with the world. Art’s role as life’s end became life’s means to a greater end, that of reality, not fantasy; truth, not deception; active participation, not indifferent complacency.

Schoenberg’s musical innovations appear to be a direct manifestation of this intellectual philosophy permeating the artistic realm in the first decade of the twentieth century. Schoenberg was aware of the dangers of an apathetic and aversive society which sought rechuse from life’s challenges within a «contemporary superficiality»9 nourished by the prevailing character of all the arts which sacrificed substance for ornament, truth for artifice. He wished to disrupt the complacency which smothered society and contributed to a weakening of life’s vitality:

Our age seeks much. What it has found above all is: Comfort. That penetrates full scale into the realm of ideas and makes it too comfortable for our own good10.

The state of the arts was the most evident and pervasive contributor to a «complacency of the spirit»11 and a reinterpretation and transformation within this realm could do much for social reform. As Felix Greissle, a pupil of Schoenberg, admits:

We learned from him, that in the last event, it always comes down to the same thing; the conditions governing the creation of a work are the same in all branches of art... To him, music was simply and truly a pretext for teaching more important fundamental things12.

9MYERS, p. 39.
11SCHORSKE, p. 358.
Typical of Viennese intellectuals after the turn of the century Schoenberg, too, believed that the means of understanding life's laws could come about only by grasping them intuitively through an artistic medium in which the ideas are the essence of truth:

Art is the cry for help of those who experience in themselves the destiny of men... not of those who will accommodate themselves to [that destiny], but of those who will wrestle with it; not of those who blindly serve the «dark powers», but of those who throw themselves into the machinery to grasp its construction; not of those who avert their eyes to protect themselves from emotion, but of those who open them wide to tackle what has to be tackled.13

Of crucial importance was the necessary affirmation of the existence of higher realities within which truth could be found through a deeper exploration of one's inner spiritual realm. Schoenberg opened up a new musical language in order to more effectively and immediately express the depths of his intuition. There exists in Schoenberg a diversion from conventional means of artistic representation directed towards abstracting the essentials, uncovering the inner meaning and discovering truth. In a general sense, Schoenberg's dynamic step out of the conventional system of harmony stemmed from his aversion to and reaction against the present state of art which «composes and thinks» for every man.14 Schoenberg's desire for truth, reliance upon intuition and need for clear, direct communication constitute his stylistic intentions and underlie the determining step out of the tonal system. What specific factors came into play in «breaking the bonds of a bygone aesthetic?»15 The answer may be found in the goal of Schoenberg's philosophical and musical aims: a redefinition of the relationship between intuition and its formal manifestation or «the outward representation of an inner idea»16.

For Schoenberg, tension had always existed between the expression of creative impulses (the musical idea) and its formal means of repre-

16 LESSEEM, Music and Text, p. 28.
sentation. Previous philosophies of art ascertain that the basis of this tension originates from the belief that «immediate experienced reality is not an aesthetic phenomena, to become so (it) must be mediated through a representation...which gives the necessary lie to an intractable truth»\textsuperscript{17}. Theodor Adorno acknowledges that such a lie is the arbitrary distinction often made between the subjective category of essence and the objective category of form with the result that much of the content becomes lost in the process of its formal representation. The nature of Schoenberg’s desired relationship is embodied in the composer’s tribute to Mahler in 1912:

...here, for the first time, a mode of expression is so inseparably bound up with the subject to which it applies that what usually appears merely as a symptom of the outward form is here, simultaneously, material and construction as well\textsuperscript{18}.

Thus, Schoenberg strove to minimalize the role played by familiar representation and formal devices in order to arrive at a direct and immediate statement of the musical idea, unrestricted by the laws of conventional means and uninhibited by systematic methods of aesthetic mediation. According to him, the relationship between content and form cannot be created «by conscious artifice but by the rightness of unconscious intuition»\textsuperscript{19}. Schoenberg had to seek new methods to resolve the tension and restore the balance within the dialectical relationship: «It seemed inadequate to force a movement into the Procrustean bed of a tonality...»\textsuperscript{20} His music had to go beyond «entrenched norms» in order to enhance the freedom of an unhindered «discharge of emotional tension»\textsuperscript{21} «I believe it won’t do: to toy with freedom while one is still bound to the unfree»\textsuperscript{22}. The result was atonality which Adorno considers to be «the process by which form and expression become equivocal»\textsuperscript{23}. For Schoenberg, «Clearly this period really started with the George songs, Opus 15»\textsuperscript{24}, for «with the George Lieder I have

\textsuperscript{17}Ibid., p. 26.
\textsuperscript{18}A. SCHOENBERG, «Gustav Mahler», Style and Idea, p. 454.
\textsuperscript{22}SCHOENBERG, Theory of Harmony, p. 472.
\textsuperscript{23}LESSEM, Music and Text, p. 7.
\textsuperscript{24}A. WEBERN, The Path to the New Music, trans. L. Black (Bryn Mawr, 1963), p. 49.
succeeded for the first time in approaching an expressive and formal ideal which has haunted me for years\textsuperscript{25}.

Thus, atonality is manifested in the fifteen songs based on the poetry of Stefan George. In this artifact the dialectical balance between idea and form is achieved.

* 

The uniqueness of the \textit{Lied} lies in its intimate association of two distinct art forms: poetry and music. Because the main compositional output of early atonal writing are \textit{Lieder}, it would seem that the text itself served a necessary role in the formal organization of a new musical language in which form is the immediate conveyance of an idea. George’s poetry is organized and constructed in rigid form. The poetic material is «consumed» by form\textsuperscript{26}, «thoroughly turned into form so that formal power becomes apparent even in the least important part of the work»\textsuperscript{27}. Perhaps in view of the newness of an unexplored language in which Schoenberg was grappling for a means to organize his «system» of unconscious logic, he naturally affiliated with someone of similar philosophical ambition who offered the systematic infrastructure, a buttress of support, for his music. Yet in Schoenberg’s own writings contradictions exist concerning the function of the text as a determinant of form. What is the basis of organization in his George-\textit{Lieder}, and is George’s poetry simply a solid architectural skeleton enwrapped musically— a temporary solution to a technical problem?

An essay by Schoenberg entitled «Composition with Twelve Tones» seems to support this contention by suggesting that musical coherence is intimately bound to the poetry:

\begin{quote}
A little later I discovered how to construct larger forms by following a text or poem. The differences in size and shape of its parts and the change in character and mood were mirrored in the shape and size of the composition, in its dynamics and tempo, figuration and accentuation, instrumentation and orchestration. Thus the parts were differentiated as clearly as they had formerly been by the tonal and structural functions of harmony\textsuperscript{28}.
\end{quote}

\textsuperscript{25}Schoenberg’s stated program notes. LEIBOWITZ, p. 80.
\textsuperscript{26}H. REISS, \textit{The Writer’s Task from Nietzsche to Brecht} (New Jersey, [C 1978]), p. 36.
\textsuperscript{27}\textit{Ibid.}, p. 33.
\textsuperscript{28}SCHOENBERG, «Composition with Twelve Tones», \textit{Style and Idea}, p. 218.
It would appear that Schoenberg had turned to texts as a suitable means of formal organization for a musical style which lacked the readily graspable logic of functional harmony.

On the contrary, in his essay of 1912 «The Relationship to the Text», Schoenberg declares that:

"... inspired by the sound of the first words of the text, I had composed many of my songs straight through to the end without troubling myself in the slightest about the continuation of the poetic events, without even grasping them in the ecstasy of composing. ... I had never done greater justice to the poet than when, guided by my first direct contact with the sound of the beginning, I divined everything that obviously had to follow this first sound with inevitability."

Such a statement not only seems to negate the function of the text as a necessary determinant of the formal organization of the song, but contradicts the statements in Schoenberg's «Composition with Twelve Tones». Furthermore, in a radio talk show of 1932, Schoenberg once again alludes to his reliance upon extra-musical devices during his initial years of atonality, although reference to a text and the specific musical relationship remains unclear:

"By not using this device [tonality] in the new direction that my music had taken... it seemed at first impossible to find pertinent substitutes for these through musical means. Unwittingly, and therefore right, I found help where music always finds it when it has reached a crucial point in its development. This, and this alone, is the origin of what is called Expressionism: a piece of music does not create its formal appearance out of the logic of its own material, but guided by the feeling for internal and external processes, and in bringing these to expression, it supports itself on their logic and builds upon that."

Schoenberg's reliance upon extra-musical devices is evident in all three statements, but how can this ambivalence to the function of the text be understood?

It is clear that the ideology of many intellectuals at the beginning of the twentieth century focused upon a belief in the existence of higher realities beyond those which were perceivable in the material world and which were attainable only intuitively through grasping the essence of an artistic artifact.

29SCHOENBERG, «The Relationship to the Text», p. 144.
Accordingly, Schoenberg believed:

a work of art is like every other complete organism. It is so homogeneous in its composition that in every little detail it reveals its truest, inmost essence. When one hears a verse of a poem, a measure of a composition, one is in a position to comprehend the whole.

This «truest, inmost essence» conveyed poetically through George’s texts becomes the basis of inspiration for Schoenberg’s musical conception. Schoenberg wishes to emphasize not the purely technical similarities between poem and music such as parallel musical and poetic rhyme schemes, corresponding stanzaic differentiation, or «word painting», but the appropriate «musification» of the integral, latent essence of the poetic content: «You cannot imitate it [the imagery] directly— you have to take the essence and amalgamate your ideas . . . and create something new». The poem holds latent truths which, grasped from the «sound alone», become the inspiration for a musical idea to be conveyed by an «unsolicited and unconscious logic in the harmonic construction». In this light, the discrepancy between the necessity of a text to construct larger forms and a superfluosity of the unfolding poetic events to achieve this construction can be understood. The poem holds latent truths which can be grasped from the «sound alone» and which become the source of inspiration for their musical conveyance through instinctive composition, in which a musical idea is the seed of both its essence and its form. The music may or may not mirror the poetic events but unfolds in an unconsciously applied logic that is both idea and form, meaning and organization in one. In any case it is the musical manifestation of a latent truth contained within the poetry. In the George-Lieder Schoenberg believed he had obtained an ideal relationship between this latent truth and its musical manifestation. In this sense the relationship of the text to his music is understood.

Still, this discrepancy of philosophy concerning the real relationship of music to text is merely a stimulus inviting closer examination of the formal organization within the songs. How are the songs actually organized through the resources of a new musical language, and what role does the text play within this process? In the words of Charles Rosen:

31 «The Relationship to the Text», p. 144.
If an individual work of music may alter and even create language, then the conditions for understanding it must—at least partially—be made evident in the work itself.

As will be evident, like the ambiguities surrounding Schoenberg's writings about the role of the poetry in his Lied compositions, analysis of the George songs reveals that no one method of formal organization exists. Each song is unique in design and in its poetic-musical relationship, illuminating aspects of each of Schoenberg’s statements. The following analyses of two songs from the cycle are exemplary.

Song VIII reveals a close association between textual and musical organization. The poem is a solid infrastructure which provides a base for the music to unfold. A look at the poem will facilitate an examination of its construction:

Wenn ich heut nicht deinen Leib berühre,
wird der Faden meiner Seele reissen
wie zu sehr gespannte Sehne.
Liebe Zeichen seien Trauerblume
mir, der leidet, seit ich dir gehöre.
Richte, ob mir solche Qual gebühre?
Kühling sprengt mir, dem Fieberheissen,
der ich wankend draussen lehne.

The rhyme scheme of George’s poem, abc/dd/abc, suggests a tripartite organization into three verses consisting of three, two, and three lines respectively. Schoenberg, on the other hand, modifies this design to a tripartite arrangement of lines grouped four, two, and two. Evidence lies in this contrasting articulations of each section created as a result of the integration of various distinct musical components. Through the combination of pitch content, tempo indications and motivic direction, Schoenberg musically defines the poetic text into three distinguishable units.

To begin with, the presence or absence of specific pitch class collections\(^{34}\) plays an ostensible role in the musical setting. The opening


\(^{35}\) This system of analysis is based on the theory of Alan Forte in which sonorities are reduced to the absolute intervals comprising them. The numbers indicate the number of half steps from a reference pitch of the sonority. Thus 048 describes a set of 3 pitches spaced 4 half-steps apart: *i.e.*, C-E-G\(^{\flat}\). For further study see A. FORTE, *The Structure of Atonal Music* (New Haven, 1973).
section of poetic lines 1 through 4 (Section A) is saturated by the predominance of pitch class collection 048, the augmented triad, in both the vocal line and piano accompaniment; in the horizontal as well as vertical dimension. Indeed, the initial three pitches in both hands of the piano accompaniment as well as the opening three pitches of the voice line consist of C#-F-A, an augmented triad, occurring linearly in the voice and piano left hand and vertically in the piano right hand.

Example 2 reveals other 048 appearances in literal and transposed forms in virtually every measure through the middle of measure (m.) 8.
Following its presence in the left hand of m. 8, the augmented triad disappears for the next four bars, until its recurrence in the vocal line on the third quarter note of m. 12. From m. 12 on, the augmented triad occurs repeatedly through the end of the song, most conspicuously within the first three pitches of the repeated running eighth-note bass line seen first in m. 14. Example 3 illustrates the abundance of 048 more clearly.
In terms of musical content, then, the poetic text is differentiated into three discrete units articulated through the presence of the 048
pitch collection — in contradiction, however, to the rhyme scheme of the poem, which suggests a division one line earlier. Looking at this corresponding point in the music (between poetic lines 3 and 4) one might at first glance assume musical division after the third text line due to the presence of the quarter rest in m. 5, the first since the song began, along with the absence of any augmented triads within this measure. However, the continuation of the opening vocal phrase in the piano left hand of mm. 4 and 5, which spills into the start of the fourth poetic line, as well as the presence of the augmented triad, 048, in the piano left hand of mm. 6-8 elongate the opening musical stanza to include the entire fourth line.

The second musical articulation differentiates the fifth through eight lines of text into two musical stanzas of two lines each: poetic lines 5, 6 and 7, 8 respectively, although once again this division is not without complications. Grammatically, the recurrence of the «a» rhyme ending line 6 suggests the start of a third poetic stanza which is rhythmically and rhyme-schematically equivalent to the opening section. This reveals an overall symmetry of textual content:

lines— 123 45 678
rhyme— abc dd abc
symmetry— A B A

Musically, Schoenberg articulates the relationship between lines 1 and 6 («berühre» and «gebühre») through the literal reinstatement of the opening vocal line of mm. 1-2 at mm. 12-14, thus equating line 1 with 6. Furthermore, the slight punctuation between «Richte» and the remainder of the line through the eighth-note rest in m. 12 (the first to occur within a poetic/musical line) and the delay of the opening vocal phrase to the word following «Richte» coordinate the corresponding lines (1 and 6) grammatically36 as a result of the musical articulation: both musically related phrases reveal dependent clauses made up of similar grammatical components:

Compare— Wenn ich heut nicht deinen Leib berühre,
and— ob mir solche Qual gebühre.

Such an association between the two lines leads one initially to perceive a musical division of text after line 5 corresponding to the poetic division; however, the continuous ritardando at m. 9, combined with the gradual diminuendo, the unfailing sequence of the thirds in the bass line and the alternating 014 chords, C-G*-B and F-C*-E, in the piano right hand all the way through to m. 14 persuade the listener to hear the entirety of this phrase as a discrete unit, inseparable from and continuous with its opening line 5 of the text in m. 8. Furthermore, the three beats of rest in the vocal line in mm. 14-15 (the longest vocal pause so far), a return to the opening tempo, and a bass line which initiates a chain of repeated declarations of the 048 opening gesture (C*-F-A) clearly demarcate the beginning of a section which spans mm. 14-22. Of interest is the musically symmetrical poetic organization, despite Schoenberg’s asymmetrical division of the text.

How might these slight organizational complexities, which inhibit a clear musical differentiation of text at lines 4 and 7, be explained? Most simply, the overlap of 048 with the start of line 5 in m. 8 and the appearance of 048 with the end of line 6 in mm. 12-14 smooth the boundaries of demarcation between musical stanzas, enhancing the overall musical continuity of the song. However, reference to the most striking poetic image of the text also lends insight. Analogous to the «overstretched bowstring» envisaged by the speaker («sehr gespannte Sehne»), the 048 groups attached to the opening and closing measures of the middle section «pull» at both sides of the text, recoiling back toward the beginning at m. 8, and tugging in the opposite direction toward the end of the piece at m. 12.

Furthermore, this image of a string or cord being stretched to its outermost limit and relaxing as it begins its recoil can be applied to the remaining means of articulation of musical differentiation. In this light the musical elements utilized for large-scale organization become intimately associated with the text, revealing its function as an integral and necessary component for musical development.

In accordance with musical divisions of the text through pitch-class collections, changes in tempo add weight to these contentions. Throughout the entire first section, the song moves rapidly and energetically, as if wound up to the point of erupting until mm. 8-9 where the mood becomes more supple and relaxed. Once again at m. 14, however, the anxious, tight intensity returns and continues to the end of the piece.

Additional illustration of a stretched cord, pulled, released, and drawn in the opposite direction is demonstrated through the direction
of half-step (or stepwise) figures infiltrating the song, which changes synchronously with the change in cord flexion, and reinforces Schoenberg's tripartite design. The opening section contains numerous instances of a tone moving down a half or whole step to a point of rest, similar to an appogiatura in tonal music. For instance, the C in the vocal line of m. 2 moving to B; the B of m. 3 moving to A# support this observation. Example 4 reveals various other occurrences of this figure in both vocal line and piano accompaniment. In each case within mm. 1-8, section A of the song, the «resolution» is downward.
Within the last section, A', the half (or whole) step resolution is upward, contrary to A. The vocal line noticeably exhibits this musical idea: in mm. 15 and 16 D moves to E three times; each instance is briefly separated by a rest, clearly outlining each two-note figure which resolves upward including mm. 20-22 in which the piano accompaniment repeats a rising E, E motion in the top voice of the left hand. Example 5 demonstrates the abundance of this musical idea.

Clearly the motion has been upward, in sharp contrast to that of the opening A section. What happens inbetween?

Several instances of half-step (or stepwise) «resolutions» both upward and downward occur, supporting the transitional nature of the
passage as the «cord» begins to flex in the opposite direction. The vocal line opens at m. 8 with an upward step, D⁹-E⁹, whereas the piano left hand of m. 9 moves down G⁸-G. The movement in the voice line of B-A in m. 11 is counterbalanced by the C-B of m. 14. However, as the passage continues, the motion is increasingly characterized by the direction toward which it is moving; that is, in anticipation of the upwardly resolving figures of the final section, the elements of the B section begin to predominate in this direction toward the end of the passage, as illustrated by the A-B and B-C motion of m. 13 (Example 6).
In terms of pitch content, tempo indications and motivic direction, the text of the eighth song is articulated into three distinct musical units which modify, as a process of personal interpretation, the poetic organization by displacing the stanzaic division by one line. As a result, Schoenberg's subjective treatment of the poetic content is made evident.

By musically dividing the text after line 4 instead of line 3, the emotional level of "mir, der leidet" is intensified as it is separated from its preceding phrase: musically, through the absence of the 048 pitch group, temporally through a preceding eighth-note rest, and registrally through a leap into the higher register on D# which moves to A, the highest point of the song. Noteworthy is the clearly defined frame of G# on both sides of the poetic phrase, audibly removing it from its musical environs. Similarly, with the change of tempo the soft, yearning «ob mir soiche Qual gebühre» becomes a question, not a directive mandated by «Richte». The punctuation of the brief rest after «Richte» heightens this effect.

The energized, overstretched anxiousness of the text softened by this plea and stimulated once more by the imperative «Kühlung spreng mir» finds musical articulation in terms of stanzaic differentiation which would be lacking if organized by the rhyme scheme of the text alone.

* 

Jedem Werke bin ich fürder tot.
Dich mir naazurufen mit den Sinnen,
neue Reden mit dir auszuspannen,
Dienst und Lohn, Gewährung und Verbot,
von allen Dingen ist nur dieses not,
und Weinen, dass die Bilder immer fliehen,
die in schöner Finsornis gedielen,
wann der kalte, klare Morgen droht.

Song VI is one in which an overt musical relationship to the text is difficult to recognize. Nonetheless, because Schoenberg was relatively uninterested in a mimetic musical setting of superficial poetic elements and intent instead of unleashing an intuitive response to the first words of the text, through which «one may comprehend the whole», the inherent musical logic may be the «inevitable» course of a musical idea inspired by a feeling for the «truest inmost essence» of the poetry, thus relating music and text on a deeper level of meaning.
Song VI is constructed out of the relationship of two short motives (Examples 7a and 7b) whose integration (Example 8) is gradually approached through various formulations of the unraveling vocal line, and eventually realized in the last measures of the song. Example 8 reveals the desired relationship to be an integration of Motives 1 and 2, in which pitches of Motive 1 alternate with those of Motive 2, analogous to the teeth of a zipper, as well as a linear union of Motives 1 and 2, the point of conjunction being the E common to both motives, forming a chromatic descent from F# to D. The D of the two Motive 2s are linked by a C# lower neighbor:

The opening vocal phrase of the song presents virtually all the elements which will comprise the desired musical goal and which will throughout the course of the song be arranged and modified to attain their final form in the closing vocal phrase. Example 9 reveals that motive 2 begins the phrase in an octave transposition and with a displaced D#, followed by the D-C#-D lower neighbor and Motive 1, minus the initial F#.
Thus, each of the musical units: Motive 1, Motive 2, and the D-C₉-D lower neighbor figure (and only these units) are present in the first vocal phrase but are incorrectly arranged with parts in an incorrect register with respect to the closing vocal phrase and desired musical formulation. The subsequent and intermediary vocal phrases execute a gradual process of formulation of the ultimate goal, each phrase one step closer than the previous.

As Example 10 illustrates, the end of the second vocal line (mm. 5 and 6) closes F-E-D, an abstraction of elements from both motives: the F-E of Motive 1 and the E-D of Motive 2 are joined at the common E, which introduces the union of the two motives (having occurred unconnected in the opening phrase) through the common E, in the correct descent, but lacking, the chromatic tones F₉ of Motive 1 and D₉ of Motive 2. Also absent is the D-C₉-D lower neighbor figure as well as an attempt at the zippered integration of the two motives. The register remains an octave too high:

The end of the third vocal line blends, into the beginning of the fourth, by way of a common E, the last note of m. 8 and the first of m. 9, creating a melodic phrase F-E-D₉-D. As evident in Example 11, one more space in the descending line begun in the previous vocal phrase has been filled with the addition of the D₉ in m. 9 on «und», bringing the phrase one step closer to its completion. Still missing is
the F. of Motive 1, the C. lower neighbor, and the zippered integration. Again the register remains high:

Example 12 demonstrates how the fifth vocal line supplies the missing F, and initiates the zippered integration of Motives 1 and 2, as evidenced by the occurrence of a D, in m. 2 between the F and E Motive 1 (m. 12) and a D (Motive 2) after the E. Inserting an E between the F, and F of «allen» (m. 11) would complete the zipper effect of the motivic integration. For each introduction of this phrase in the formulating process, namely the attempt at vertical integration, the register remains high. However, the D-C.-D lower neighbor figure makes its appearance and initiates a move into the correct, lower register:

As will be seen, the final two versions of the phrase remain entirely in the lower register. Although Example 11 initiates vertical integration, the complete chromatic descent of Motive 1 followed by Motive 2 is thwarted by a missing D, in measure 12 between the high the E (on «Dingen») and low D (on «ist») and unemphasized by the registral differen-
ce between these same pitches (high E of «Dingen», low D of «dieses»).

The seventh line of text is articulated by a correct chromatic descent of Motives 1 and 2, in the desired register. The F\(_4\) of Motive 1 is absent, however, and the C\(_4\) in the lower neighbor figure is displaced and eighth beat, falling after two Ds in m. 16 instead of in between. Example 13 illustrates this clearly.

\[\text{Example 13}\]

Up to this point, chromatic descent and the C\(_4\) lower neighbor figure have appeared in the correct register, and vertical integration has been introduced, although still displaced up one register.

The final vocal phrase brings this vertical integration into the lower register in conjunction with the linear union of the two motives and the C\(_4\) lower neighbor figure to achieve the musical goal of the song, the final arrangement of the opening musical components. Thus, in each of the eight lines of poetry with the exception of line 6, a musical goal is gradually approached, each vocal line revealing closer correspondence to the final version.

A supposition could be made to relate the musical logic to the poetic content by correlating the arrival at the desired musical goal with the breaking of the cold, clear light of day («wann der kalte, klare Morgen droht»). The proceeding fragmentation of the completed musical form takes place while the text «thrives in beautiful darkness» («die in schöner Finsternis gediehen»), alluding to the fragmented nature of the dreaming process. A dialectic set up between the irrational, incomprehensible, disjointed workings of our minds in a dream state, and the conscious and conspicuous logic of our awakened intellects is reflected in the continuous transformation of a musical idea into its
ultimate form. This superficial correspondence is unimportant, however, as long as the musical idea is a manifestation of the poetic at some level of inter-relatedness, and both contain the essence of live's true meaning.

* 

To be sure, an examination and analysis of the George-Lieder have yielded no single conclusion with respect to form. Each song is unique in design, revealing varying manners of poetic-musical relationship. The ambiguities as to the real role of the text still stand. In Schoenberg's own words, perhaps «a hundred years later no one will be able to check the likeness» of the music to the text, «but the artistic effect will always remain».

The George-Lieder are an artistic artifact, a musical landmark, and their significance lies in the effect they have created: they have invited a closer examination of their construction, provoked inquiry into the philosophy behind their realization, and stimulated an exploration of the nourishing milieu at the time of their conception. Certainly, these songs are «... to be a source of discovery and suggestion for, at least, another half century».

It is precisely this process of discovery, awakening our intellects, which Schoenberg sought to provoke, for when men «throw themselves into the machinery to grasp its construction... to tackle what has to tackled» he gains a better understanding of his surrounding world. As a result, with the George-Lieder Schoenberg has expressed not only his musical ideals but achieved his philosophical ones as well.
