

**W**

**WORKING  
PAPERS**

**324**

**Analysis of the present (and impact) of Women  
in Business Organizations in Contemporary  
Spanish Democracy.  
The impact of Spanish Law of Equality Reviewed**

**JOAN PERE PLAZA  
CASILDA GÜELL  
IVÁN MEDINA**



*Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials*  
Adscrit a la Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona



**Analysis of the presence (and impact) of Women in Business  
Organizations in Contemporary Spanish Democracy.  
The impact of Spanish Law of Equality Reviewed**

JOAN PERE PLAZA

Universidad Carlos III de Madrid

CASILDA GÜELL

Universitat Internacional de Catalunya

IVÁN MEDINA

Univeresidad Autónoma de Madrid

WP núm. 324

Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials

Barcelona, 2014

The Institute of Political and Social Sciences (ICPS) is a consortium created in 1988 by the Barcelona Provincial Council and the *Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona*, the institution to which the ICPS is officially linked for academic purposes.

“Working Papers” is one of the collections published by the ICPS, with the previous reading committee’s report, specialising in the publication of work currently being undertaken by social researchers –in the author’s original language– with the aim of facilitating their subsequent scientific debate.

Inclusion of work within this collection does not prohibit its future publication by the author, who maintains full rights over the article.

The work in question cannot be reproduced without the permission of the author.



Publication: Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials (ICPS)  
Mallorca, 244, pral. 08008 Barcelona (Espanya)  
<http://www.icps.cat>

© Joan Pere Plaza, Casilda Güell, Iván Medina  
DL: B-10186-2012  
ISSN: 1133-8962

## INTRODUCTION

This paper deals with the presence of women in interest groups, a topic which has received less attention by political scientists than others such as the presence of women in political institutions. While women's presence in political institutions constitutes a well-established field of research, very few studies focus on women's presence in economic interest groups in Spain (Güell, Plaza i Font, and Medina 2011).

More specifically, this paper deals with a very concrete topic of women in the public sphere: feminine leadership in business interest organizations in Spain (and more specifically, on Chambers of Commerce) as means of testing the impact of 'gender equality' reforms on private organisations convening businesspeople. In so doing, we feel that the greater presence of women in Chambers of Commerce, the greater private consciousness about gender inequalities. Conversely, a scant figure of women within Chambers of Commerce would determine we are still away from a real 'social change' if we believe that change should affect both public institutions (political parties, parliaments, governments) and private actors (interest groups, the media, firms).

Nowadays, it is perhaps inadequate to strictly focus such a study on the membership of business associations and respond an inquiry such as 'How many women belong to a Chamber of Commerce and what is the percentage of women in relation to men?'. In terms of power it is not conclusive the figure of women who joined a political party, but how many of them have become Presidents, Prime Ministers and Ministers all around the world. Therefore, in similar terms it is more salient for us now to appraise whether women have assumed leadership roles within business associations and have been able to expand their public visibility.

This paper fits within Political Science as it looks at the relation of power in business interest groups, particularly in Spanish Chambers of Commerce. Our paper analyses the presence of women in Chambers of Commerce's Boards and Councils in the Spanish regions for the period 2010-2012. Two aims are stressed: first, observing if there are inequalities between the presence of women and men and its evolution; second, observing if the feminine profile is present amongst the positions of leadership.

## GENDER STUDIES AND BUSINESS INTEREST ORGANIZATIONS

Although sometimes the mainstream of the discipline tends to ignore them, it must be acknowledged *Gender Studies* is today a thriving and varied sub-field with a significant research agenda within Political Science (Lovenduski 2009). *Gender Studies* has been widely analysed on a global perspective (Vickers and Druhvarajan 2002; Hausman and Sauer 2007; Sawyer and Grey 2008; Hafner-Burtin and Pollack 2009) as well as under the comparative approach, with a special attention to the connections between gendered biased policy outcomes and State architecture (Hausman and Vickers 2010). Aside the analysis of social and political structures at the macro-level, *Gender Studies* have also traditionally assessed the feminine presence within political parties and political institutions (Sawyer, Tremblay, and Trimble 2008).

The empirical analysis concerning the Spanish context is not disconnected to this general trend. We know so far, for instance, how the multi-level decision making structure in Spain has influenced the emergence of gendered biased policy outcomes (Ortbals 2008), or how the presence of women in the State institutions has developed and, particularly, how is their presence in regional institutions (Verge 2009) or in the Spanish Congress of Deputies (Valiente, Ramiro, and Morales 2003). One can also find excellent research about the feminine presence within political parties (Verge 2006), the candidate selection (Verge 2010b) or the role of quotas in such political organisations (Verge 2008 2010a).

Meanwhile, literature on *Gender Studies* connected to business associations is very scarce so far, and often focused on the women's career development. Literature concerning business associations is often connected to *Collective Action Theory*, assuming that individuals set up organised groups in order to encourage the government to favour a certain sort of interest, as well as to confront other rival groups' power (*exempli gratia*, Bentley, 1908; Truman 1951). Such groups bring together similar people in terms of values, needs, profession, precedence, and so forth.<sup>1</sup> Apart from discussing various requirements for a group to succeed (Olson 1971), there has been little literature aiming at describing the configuration of internal leadership on the grounds of gender attributes. Actually, gender has been neither a striking issue nor a fundamental determinant for the mainstream of scholars analysing interest groups. Probably, the reason is that there has never been a women's association jeopardising the status of traditional economic groups such as employers' associations and Trade Unions.

Spanish researchers on the field have followed this general trends as well, and their empirical research have paid attention to the territorial differences, the outcome of business associations' lobby, the degree of density (afflation) of Spanish business associations in comparative perspective, and other 'traditional inquiries' (Jerez 1995; Solé 1999; Molins 2008). The research projects attending to *gender issues* concerning business organizations are very rare, and they underline the possible differences among gendered business organizations biased on regional differences (Güell, Plaza i Font, and Medina 2011).

## THE EMPIRICAL CONTEXT: THE SPANISH LAW OF EQUALITY

### *The path towards the Spanish Law of Equality*

About the study of women's presence in Spanish politics throughout the years, the first thing that needs to be mentioned is that the Spanish women had access to voting since 1931. Their real participation as activists and even as potential leaders is very recent. There has not been a Spanish feminine prime Minister. Under the former

---

<sup>1</sup> In that vein, what differentiates a group from a (social and/or political) movement is the existence of various rules permitting internal governance such as the hierarchical imposition of decisions, the stability of the directors, and the usage of resources and benefits.

government of Rodríguez Zapatero, there was for the first time a woman vice-president of the government. A further aspect to be analysed is women's increasing presence in society (education, culture, jobs). The massive access of women to university in Spain only happened after the transition to democracy and their massive access to the labour world as well. These processes had started in the mid twentieth century in the rest of Europe but they were delayed in Spain due to Francoism (Chinchilla and León 2004). During the last thirty years, more than two million women joined the labour market in Spain.

In the recent years, the gender issue has been widely present in the political agenda both at European and national level. The Treaty of the European Union obliged member states to promote equality between women and men. Over the years, the principle of gender equality has been reinforced with legislation. In the 1990s, the policy of gender mainstreaming was introduced. This new strategy strived to include gender equality issues in all activities. The EU institutional framework of gender equality has been based in five year plans which cover equality in economic, social and civil life, equal representation and participation and changing gender roles. A series of actors collaborate in this structural approach such as the European Parliament, the council and the Commission. For example one of the effects of the Amsterdam Treaty (1997) was the equal opportunities for women and men that are now considered one of the fundamental aims of the Union. The EU supplements the treaties with directives that go into more detail. In the 1990s it was realised that a new approach was needed to achieve equality in practice. At the Fourth UN World Conference on Beijing in 1995, gender mainstreaming was included as a principal strategy for promoting gender equality in large parts of the world. One of the objectives to which priority is given in the EU action programmes is an equitable distribution of women and men in the decision-making progress. In a recommendation issued in 1996 (96/694/EC) the Council calls for more initiatives that will result in an even distribution between women and men involved in decision-making.

For example, the EU roadmap outlines priority areas for EU action on gender equality for the period 2006-10 amongst which is equal representation in decision-making, equal share of women in national economic institutions and equal distribution of managers by sex. (EU Communication from the Commission to the Council). Even more so, an EU report concluded that there is a positive correlation between women leadership and business behaviour (European Commission report 2010). However, the business community is still widely dominated by men who do not have sufficient confidence in women. This is the case in 76% of the cases.<sup>2</sup> However, even if the political ambition of equality exists, the results of the implementation of these policies are still very scarce.

In Spain, one turning point concerning gender policies was the approval of the *Law*

---

<sup>2</sup> Special Eurobarometer 326/2009. *Gender and Equality in the EU in 2009*. European Commission. Directorate-General for Communication ("Research and Political Analysis" Unit).

of Equality (LO 03/ 2007<sup>3</sup>) by the Spanish Parliament, which claimed the necessity of promoting the presence of women in all daily life spheres and, particularly, within political and economic contexts.

The Law was meant to provide active policies towards the real equality between men and women. For instance, it introduced the *Principle of Balanced Composition* (First Additional Disposition), fixing that in any electoral list the presence of men or women could neither exceed the 60% nor be lower than 40%. Pursuing its objective to make a big step towards gender equality, this Law also proposed some participatory mechanisms and obliged local administrations to have an internal plan of equality. And it also paved the way to introduce gender biased changes in the governing rules of the Judiciary.

Nevertheless, some Ibx 35 companies in Spain are still somewhat behind in that sense, such as Endesa, Gas Natural Fenosa, Sacyr Vallehermoso and Técnicas Reunidas, for up to 2012 there have been no women present in their boards of management. According to a study led by IESE Business School and Inforpress, women scarcely represent more than a 12,75% of the positions in company councils<sup>4</sup>. In fact, as noted on the study *Presente y Futuro de las Mujeres en los Consejos de Administración en el Ibx 35* led by Add Talentia in 2010, only ten out of the thirty-five companies have a women presence rate superior to 15% in their board of management, a percentage that, in spite of the aforementioned equality that has been preached, is rather far from the optimal and desirable margin<sup>5</sup>. Internationally wise, however, Spain is par with the European average (11%), and is better-positioned than Canada —where 40% of the companies have no presence of women in that regard—, yet, at the same time, still far behind the United States —where 37% of the companies surpass the 15% threshold—. In this regard, the European Parliament urgently demands to establish feminine quotas in company councils. On the one hand, it has approved a report by liberal Dutch Sophie In t’Veld, who proposes an imposition of the 35% of female directives by 2015, and another 40% by 2020. On the other hand, the Parliament has also supported conservative Finnish Sirpa Pietikainen’s report, which thoroughly reviews the presence of women as EU elected representatives. In national Parliaments, for instance, female representation is of a tight 24%. Infra-representation in political life, stands Pietikainen, must be changed with

---

<sup>3</sup> [http://www.boe.es/aeboe/consultas/bases\\_datos/doc.php?id=BOE A 2007 6115](http://www.boe.es/aeboe/consultas/bases_datos/doc.php?id=BOE A 2007 6115), last checked June 12, 2012.

<sup>4</sup> “Cuatro empresas del Ibx aún no tienen mujeres en sus consejos de administración”. *El Mundo* 3 Mar. 2013, Madrid. <http://www.elmundo.es/elmundo/2013/03/05/economia/1362481862.html>

“Solo el 12% de miembros no ejecutivos de los consejos del Ibx 35 son mujeres”. *Europapress* 5 Mar. 2013, Madrid. <http://www.europapress.es/economia/noticia-economia-empresas-solo-12-miembros-no-ejecutivos-consejos-administracion-ibex-35-son-mujeres-20130305121933.html>

“Tan solo 10 de las 35 empresas del Ibx tiene el 15% de mujeres en el consejo de administración”. *Intereconomía* 2 Nov. 2010, Madrid. <http://www.intereconomia.com/noticias-negocios/analisis/empresas/tan-solo-10-las-35-empresas-del-ibex-tiene-15-mujeres-consejo-ad>

<sup>5</sup> “Análisis de la situación actual de las mujeres consejeras en España”. *Objetivo 15*. Visited on 25 Mar. 2013. <http://www.objetivo15.net/mujeresenconsejos.html>

the backing of CE and The Twenty-seven<sup>6</sup>. On the business side, within the framework of Corporate Social Responsibility, the Law encouraged to draw a plan for equality in the companies that counted on more than 250 people and that would need to be approved by collective agreement (Articles 73 to 75). For the other businesses the equality plan was voluntary. More specifically, the Law also encouraged the boards of businesses to include women gradually throughout the eight following years. The Law did not include a specific mention to business association's equality and thus there is no specific legislation behind the composition of the boards of Spanish Business Associations.

However, the problem was that there was no obligation of enforcement of this plan and therefore the binding was weak. As the first results show, the real revision of politics and a real compromise of all actors from a gender perspective is still far away. (Alonso, Diz, and Lois 2010, 107-136)<sup>7</sup>.

### **Chambers of Commerce in Spain**

Spain is characterised by a strong sense of corporatism as are the rest of Southern countries in Europe such as Portugal, Italy and Greece (Visser 2004). Corporatism has been a key factor in order to share efforts among political and economic actors throughout the democratic period started back in 1977. During the Transition to democracy, there was a necessity to consolidate democratic reforms in view of the seriousness of the economic crisis of late 1970s, whereas in the 1990s it was important to reach the European Union's requirements to join the EMU by avoiding social conflict. It was also important to help create a democratic political structure in accordance with the European standards, so the Spanish Constitution (1978) recognised a distinguished role for both business associations and trade unions to participate in the provision of economic, labour and social policies. In so doing, Spain started, on the one hand, to develop the institutionalisation of social partners by granting them with public status and, on the other hand, to establish advisory corporatist mechanisms to shape the economic policy-making and the industrial relation system (Ofe, 1981; Schmitter 1979).

In result, the state recognises the *Confederación Española de Organizaciones Empresariales* (CEOE) as the voice of employers at the Spain-wide level, whereas the socialist *Unión General de Trabajadores* (UGT) and the communist *Comisiones Obreras* (CCOO) share the representation of workers. However, the Spanish map of business

---

<sup>6</sup> "El Parlamento Europeo urge a establecer cuotas femeninas en las empresas". *Público.es* 13 Mar. 2012, Strasbourg. <http://www.publico.es/espana/425746/el-parlamento-europeo-urge-a-establecer-cuotas-femeninas-en-las-empresas>

<sup>7</sup> Even at regional level, gender equality has been a focus. For example, the revised Catalan statute of 2006 made a mentioning to the right of women to its participation in all the areas of society. "Public powers have to guarantee the accomplishment of the principle of equality of opportunities among men and women in their access to occupation, formation and professional formation, in their conditions of work, including the salary and in all other situations and it also includes that women should not be discriminated due to pregnancy or maternity." "Public powers have to guarantee the transversality in the incorporation of the gender perspective and of women in all the public policies in order to obtain a real and effective equality between men and women." (Article 41, Estatut d'Autonomia de Catalunya, 2006).

associations is a bit more complex than this. Those business associations are involved in the four main functions reserved to them: a) social concertation which is the formal dialogue with trade unions and the government on various policy issues; b) industrial relations corresponds to collective agreements on labour conditions; c) advisory tasks mainly focused on concrete consultations on legal issues and sectorial policies; and d) 'business services to members' specifies the delivering and provision of services such as training, legal assistance, business certification, etc. At first glance, three statements can be highlighted: first, the scope of business associations' functions is distributed throughout the territory. Second, even though CEOE is the main peak employers' associations, it is not directly involved in various tasks such as in industrial relations (or collective bargaining), which is chiefly carried out at the provincial level. And third, there are other business associations competing with CEOE in advising local governments and in delivering services to companies.

According to Molins (2008), any research on business associations in Spain needs to go beyond a simplistic approach centred on the Spain-wide level in order to capture the actual complexity of business associations' functions on the grounds of sector, territory and type of organisation. Moreover, Nonell and Molins (2007) pointed out that the regional level was increasingly reinforcing the attachment and involvement of business associations as regional institutions were endorsed with greater areas of policies. Spanish map of business associations is a bit more complex than this. It is clear that Chambers of Commerce don't take part of the employers' function in both the social concertation and the collective bargaining. However, Chambers have a long history in advising the government and in helping the business community with specific services. According to Windmuller and Gladstone (1984) business associations' typology, Chambers of Commerce are trade associations and not employers' associations because they don't participate in the collective bargaining, but they are aimed at promoting trade and guarantying a good economic environment. Overall, there are three factors determining the relevance of Chambers of Commerce in Spain. First, Spanish Chambers of Commerce belong to the so-called 'Public Model' of Chambers of Commerce, so to speak, they are not merely voluntary business associations, but they are public corporations in charge of advising the government on several topics in relation to trade and economy, as well as managing public services affecting business such as, for instance, exportation's certificates. Second, voluntary business associability in Spain has not been a frequent aspect of the political system due to long periods of dictatorship (Linz 1988). This has long generated a business associations' map comprised of very weak and sporadic employers' associations and dispersed Chambers of Commerce throughout the country in which the political elite attempted to control the business community. Third, the advent of democracy started with an ambiguous position between the 'new' CEOE and the 'old' Chambers: they were directly competing for the same type of members as well as overlapping functions. This situation led to a permanent struggle between them in order to differentiate formal responsibilities and to exert control on each other (Molins 1989).

In fairness, we must state that CEOE has gathered more powers than the Chambers because CEOE has tried, on the one hand, to 'colonise' Chambers by situating its candidates in the directive positions, and, on the other hand, to impoverish the 'economic functions' of Chambers by shaping them as mere services suppliers (Jerez 1995). The 1993 *Law of Chambers of Commerce* aimed to diminish the confrontation between employers' associations and Chambers of Commerce by assuring a certain percentage of employers' associations' representatives under direct designation.

Briefly, the key features of the Public Model, that public model that fully justifies our case selection to test the impact of the Spanish *Law of Equality* to non-partisan organizations, are: public law status, mandatory membership, protection of Chambers' names, regulation of the activity in a given territory, delegated public functions, advisory status with the government; guaranteed financing, hierarchy of Chambers, and government supervision (Fedotov 2007). Guaranteed financing is achieved through government regulation of membership fees or through an additional tax levied on entrepreneurs to the benefit of Chambers, (i) Mandatory membership in the Public Model grants a voter status and the right to be elected as Chamber member and (ii) Elections to the Chambers' governing bodies, namely the Council, the Board and the Presidency are held every four years. Members are classified by groups and categories (according to their sector of activity and whether they belong to business or to industry) because elections are held within each group. Afterwards, the Council elects the President and the members of the Board by individual, secret ballot. No significant majority is required. The hierarchical organisation within Chambers supposes that the President and the members of the Board are the ones holding more power (Molins 1989). Despite the definition given above, a major change is now under way within the Chambers of Commerce in Spain since the approval of the recent Decree-Law (3rd December, 2010) that erased the mandatory membership and the obligatory payment of the Chambers' fee. We do not have still a clear evidence of the modifications it might have provoked. Nevertheless, one might speculate that Chambers will progressively lose their independence both in relation to the government and in relation to CEOE. Now Chambers will have to go through a process of restructuring in order to adjust their expenditures to their new budget and being more efficient in providing their services.

## **THE RESEARCH**

### ***Research inquiries, Data and Methods***

Due to the social and institutional changes derived from the approval of the Spanish *Law of Equality*, studies focusing on the outcomes of the implementation of the legal mandate mushroomed in recent years. Those studies have mainly focused so far the institutionalization of certain gender biased policies Diz and Lois, 2011, the capacity of *Gender Reports* to the influence of gender biased policies, and its impact in the composition of the Congress of Deputies (Roig 2010) have been published.

This contribution aims to join this growing literature, and complement it by directing

our attention to the impact of the Spanish *Law of Equality* on the composition of the Representative Bodies of Spanish Chambers of Commerce.

The paper has an exploratory character and no hypotheses can be drawn. Nevertheless, we expect to contrast certain preliminary ideas that we can structure as follows:

§ 1. Even if both the European and Spanish context have adopted more policies towards gender equality in all areas including the business arena, the percentage of representation of women in the Council, Board and Presidential positions among Spanish chambers of Commerce is still very scarce.

§ 2. The number of women present in the Council of the Spanish Chambers of Commerce analysed is small but the number of women present in the Board or holding Presidential positions (positions with the real executive power) is even smaller.

The methodology used will be based on Quantitative Exploration of the Executive Committees of the Chambers of Commerce in the Spanish provinces. Two periods are analysed: those immediately before (2006-2010) and immediately after (2010-2014) the coming into force of the Spanish *Law of Equality* in 2007. In so doing we expect to provide the first insights to capt the impact of the new legislation. Unfortunately, despite the public nature of Spanish Chambers of Commerce, data concerning the composition of the Councils of the Chambers of Commerce for the period 2010-2014 is not available. This gap directly affects a part of our analysis, since at the moment we are unable to compare this aspect.

We analyse firstly the total number of women in the Council of the Chambers of Commerce. Secondly, we turn to the feminine presence at key positions in this body. Finally we study the processes of continuity in these posts.

### **Findings**

#### **Analysis of the feminine presence at the Executive Committees of Spanish Chambers of Commerce and in the key positions**

As one may observe in Figure 1, Figure 2 and Figure 3, female presence in the executive bodies of Spanish Chambers of Commerce is very weak. While in the period 2006-2010 the total percentage of feminine presence was 6,9%, the percentage after the Chamber elections in 2010 slightly raised up to 10,7%. These data conflict for instance with feminine presence at Political Chambers, such as the *Congreso de los Diputados* (Spanish lower house), where this presence raised the 36.28%, 36.28% and 38.00% on the General Elections of 2004, 2008 and 2012.<sup>8</sup>

The analysis of descriptive representation must be completed turning the attention to the different positions held by those women membering the executive committees. We have distinguished between those positions common to the set of Chambers of

<sup>8</sup> Data available at [Congreso de los Diputados institutional webpage](#), last checked, June 15th, 2012.

Commerce (Presidency, 1st Vice-presidency, 2nd Vice-presidency and Treasure) and those who are not (the rest).

In correspondence to the general trend, it is remarkable that only 4 women during 2006-2010 and 2 during 2010-2014 presided a Chamber. For the first period, those chambers were: Córdoba, Menorca, Melilla, and Tàrraga; while for the second period Menorca and Melilla repeated. We explicitly mention the geographical reference since none of this Chambers represents important territories. A minor capital of province: Córdoba. A small island: Menorca. An autonomous city in North Africa: Melilla, and tiny town in Catalonia: Tàrraga.

The most important aspect to be mentioned now is the relative presence of women holding the Treasurer position (6.4% and 11.4% for 2006-2010 and 2010-2014, respectively). It reveals a kind of "standard composition" of the Executive Committee of Spanish Chambers of Commerce where all members being men only the Treasurer (and quite seldom a second member) is a woman. This particularity should be analysed in depth, but it offers somehow an insight of the attitude towards feminine representation. In the same vein, the period 2010-2014 (after the approval of the Spanish *Law of Equality*) witnessed relative raise on the percentage of women holding a 2nd Vice-presidency (from 3.7% to 9.2%).

Under our point of view those are probably the most significant impacts (in the case that we could eventually stipulate the causal logic behind) of the Spanish *Law of Equality* on the composition of Executive Committees of Spanish Chambers of Commerce. In a general context of relatively higher percentages of feminine representation, the new incomers could have occupied neither the residency nor the 1st Vice-presidency rather "second row" positions in those Executive Committees. Somehow candidatures to 2010 Elections could have interiorized the need to enlarge the effective number of women within their teams, but it could have turned into a "symbolic" presence.

#### **Dynamics of continuity and change**

A second element that could shed some light on the impact of the Spanish *Law of Equality* on the composition of the governing bodies of the Spanish Chambers of Commerce is the *Continuity Rate* among the Women holding those positions. Following Roig (2010) we define the *Continuity Rate* as follows:

$$\text{Continuity Rate} = \frac{\text{Women reelected}}{\text{Total number of members elected}} \times 100$$

Only 26 out of the 57 women holding elected positions along the period 2010-2014 were already elected in the previous period (we have already mentioned the two presidents that repeated in their position). As a result, it provides a feminine *Continuity Rate* of 3.01%. Compared to the masculine *Continuity Rate* this figure seems risible. For the same period, 42.97% men repeated their mandate as an elected member of the

Executive Committee of the Spanish Chambers of Commerce. Additionally, compared to the feminine *Continuity Rate* in the *Congreso de los Diputados* for the National Elections in 2008, this figure is also really lower. At the lower house this rate reached 59% Roig (2010). This figure talks about the difficulties that women may (still) face to hold certain representative positions.

Those elements provide not only insights to evaluate the descriptive representation but also to advance towards a more in depth analysis of the personal trajectories of these women. Contrary to the political elite, those figures do not permit to talk at all about a consolidation of any elite, nor to hypothesize about a professionalization of any kind (which could be the case for certain men).

## **CONCLUSIONS**

Accordingly to the existing literature, feminists wanting to theorize about organizations face a difficult task because of the deeply embedded gendering of both organizational processes and theory (Acker 1990). Gender is constructed within institutional and cultural contexts that produce multiple forms of masculinity. For example, schools are active players in the formation of masculinities. Masculinizing practices are concentrated: curriculum divisions, discipline systems and sports (*exempli gratia*, (Connell 1996). From this paper's quantitative research we cannot conclude whether Chambers of Commerce boards are gendered embedded or not, since would need to further research their activities. Nevertheless, the lower presence of women and the role attributed to those that do member any Executive Committee could suggest a certain gender bias concerning certain positions, such as the Treasury.

Despite the symbolic inrush of the Spanish *Law of Equality* and the (feeble) impacts that it may have caused, one might consider that there are other factors still blocking further transformations such as, for instance, related with the political culture (acceptance of a woman as a political leader). Even if the gender policies aim at gender equality both at the European and Spanish context, the studies show that we are still far away from equality.

As for the context of this paper, one thing that would need further analysis is the profile of the women recruited and how it is developing over time, across institutions and across sectors. Furthermore, we would need to research the context of gender issue developments in other sectors of society. For example, many studies show that the percentage of women sitting in business boards in Spain is very low. We would also need to research in the Spanish context if the unions and the political parties are doing better. Finally, we would need to research if other countries are doing better.

## Acronyms

**CEOE** *Confederación Española de Organizaciones Empresariales, Spanish Confederation of Employers' Associations*

**CCOO** *Comisiones Obreras, Workers' Commissions*

**UGT** *Unión General de Trabajadores, Workers' General Union*

## References

- ACKER, J.: 1990, "Hierarchies, Jobs and Bodies: A Theory of Gendered Organisations", *Gender and Society* 4 (2), pp. 139-158.
- ALONSO, A., I. DIZ, and M. LOIS: 2010, "La influencia de las políticas públicas de igualdad en la toma de decisiones: Un análisis de los informes de impacto de género", *Revista Española de Ciencia Política* 24, pp. 107-136.
- BENTLEY, A.: 1908, *The Process of Government*, Chicago (IL), University of Chicago Press.
- CHINCHILLA, N. and C. LEÓN: 2004, *La Ambición Femenina*, Buenos Aires, Aguilar.
- CONNELI, R. W.: 1996, "Teaching the boys: New research on masculinity, and gender strategies for schools", *Teachers College Record* 98 (2), pp. 206-235.
- CONSEJO SUPERIOR DE CÁMARAS: 2008, *Directorio de Cámaras (2008-2010)*. Madrid, Garan Comunicaciones.
- CONSEJO SUPERIOR DE CÁMARAS: 2010, *Directorio de Cámaras (2010-2012)*, Madrid, Garan Comunicaciones.
- DIZ, I. and M. LOIS: 2011, "La institucionalización de la igualdad de género en Galicia: un camino abierto", *Revista de Gestión y Análisis de Políticas Públicas* 5, (en prensa).
- FEDOTOV, V.: 2007, *Organization and Legal models of Chambers*, Washington, D.C., Center for International Private Enterprise.
- GÜELL, C., J.P. PLAZA i FONT, and I. MEDINA: 2011, "Does regionalism prove to be an advantage for woman's equality? The presence of women in business associations in Spain", in *ECPR 2011 Joint Sessions*, Saint Gallen (Switzerland).
- HAFNER-BURTIN, E. and M. POLLACK: 2009, "Mainstreaming gender in the European Union: getting in incentives right", *Comparative European Politics* 7 (1), pp. 114-138.
- HAUSSMAN, M. and B. SAUER (eds.): 2007, *Gendering the State in the Age of Globalization: Women's Movements and State Feminism in Post-Industrial Democracies*, Boulder (CO), Rowman and Litdefield.
- HAUSSMAN, M., SAWER, M. and J. VICKERS (eds.): 2010, *Federalism, Feminism and Multilevel Governance*, Surrey (UK), Ashgate.
- JEREZ, M.: 1995, *Corporaciones e Intereses en la España Actual*, Granada, Universidad de Granada.
- LINZ, J.J.: 1988, "Política e intereses a lo largo de un siglo en España 1880-1980", in PÉREZ YRUELA, M. and S. GINER (eds.): *El Corporatismo en España*. Barcelona, Ariel.
- LOVENDUSKI, J.: 2009, "State feminism and women's movements", in GOETZ, K.H., P. MAIR, and G. SMITH (eds.), *European Politics. Pasts, presents, futures*. London and Now York, Routledge.
- MOLINS, J.M.: 1989, *Chambers of Commerce as Interest Groups*, Barcelona, Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials.
- MOLINS, J.M.: 2008, "Las organizaciones empresariales en la España Democrática del sindicalismo vertical a

- la pluralidad organizativa", in: VV.AA. (ed.): *Estudios sobre la Constitución Española. Homenaje al Profesor Jordi Solé Tura*, volume 2, Madrid, Cortes Generales, CEPC, Universitat de Barcelona, Ajuntament de Mollet del Vallès.
- NONELL, R. and J.M. MOLINS: 2007: "Spain", in TRAXLER, F. and G. HUEMER (eds.), *Handbook of Business Interest Associations, Firm Size and Governance. A comparative analytical approach*, London, Routledge.
- OFE, K.: 1981, "The attribution of public status to interest groups: observations on the West German case", in BERGER, S. (ed.): *Organizing Interests in Western Europe*, New York (NY), Cambridge University Press.
- OLSON, M.: 1971, *The Logic of Collective Action: Public Goods and the Theory of Groups*, Cambridge (MA), Harvard University Press.
- ORTBALS, C.D.: 2008, "Subnational politics in Spain: New avenues for feminist policymaking and activism", *Politics and Gender* 4, pp. 93-119.
- ROIG, R.M.: 2010, *La Ley de Igualdad 3/2007 y las Elecciones al Congreso de los Diputados de 2004 y 2008*, Working Paper n. 283, Barcelona, Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials.
- SAWER, M. and S. GREY (eds.): 2008, *Women's Movements: Flourishing or in Abeyance?*, New York and London, Routledge.
- SAWER, M., M. TREMBLAY, and L. TRIMBLE (eds.): 2008, *Representing Women in Parliament: A Comparative Study*, New York and London, Routledge.
- SCHMITTER, P.: 1979, "Still the century of corporatism?", in SCHMITTER, P. and P. LEHMBRUCH (eds.): *Trends towards Corporatist Intermediation*, London, Sage Publications.
- SOL, C. (ed.): 1999, *Las Organizaciones Empresariales en España (Análisis de los Sectores Industriales en los Años 1990)*, Barcelona, Ediciones Universitarias de Barcelona.
- TRUMAN, D.B.: 1951, *The Governmental Process: Political Interests and Public Opinion*, New York (NY), Alfred A. Knopf.
- VALIENTE, C., L. RAMIRO, and L. MORALES: 2003, "Mujeres en el Parlamento: Un análisis de las desigualdades de género en el Congreso de los Diputados", *Revista de Estudios Políticos (nueva época)* 121, pp. 179-208.
- VERGE, T.: 2006, "Mujer y partidos políticos en España las estrategias de los partidos y su impacto institucional 1978-2004", *Revista Española de Investigaciones Sociológicas* 115, pp. 165-196.
- VERGE, T.: 2008, "Cuotas voluntarias y legales en España la paridad a examen". *Revista Española de Investigaciones Sociológicas* 123, pp. 123-150.
- VERGE, T.: 2009, *Dones a les Institucions Polítiques Catalanes: El Llarg Camí cap a la Igualtat (1977-2008)*, Barcelona, Institut de Ciències Polítiques i Socials.
- VERGE, T.: 2010a, "Gendering representation in Spain: Opportunities and limits of gender quotas". *Journal of Women Politics and Policy* 31 (2), pp. 166-190.
- VERGE, T.: 2010b, "Women and local politics in Spain: Exploring gender regimes and biased party candidate selection processes", In PINI, B. and P. MCDONALD (eds.): *Women Voice and Representation in Local Government*, New York and London, Routledge.
- VICKERS, J. and V. DRUHVARAJAN: 2002, *Gender, Race and Nation: A Global Approach*, Toronto, University of Toronto Press.
- VISSER, J.: 2004, "Patterns and Variations in European Industrial Relations", in *Industrial Relations in Europe*, pp. 11-57. Luxembourg: Office for Official Publications of the European Communities.
- WINDMULLER, J. P. and A. GLADSTONE (eds.): 1984, *Employers' Associations; Case Studies*, Oxford and New York (NY), Clarendon Press.

**Figure 1. Composition Executive Committees of Spanish Chambers of Commerce 2006-2010**

	Wo men	Me n	Total
President	4 4,5%	84 95,5%	88 100,0%
1 <sup>st</sup> Vice-president	2 2,3%	85 97,7%	87 100,0%
2 <sup>nd</sup> Vice-president	3 3,7%	79 96,3%	82 100,0%
3 <sup>rd</sup> Vice-president	3 15,0%	17 85,0%	20 100,0%
4 <sup>th</sup> Vice-president	1 25,0%	3 75,0%	4 100,0%
5 <sup>th</sup> Vice-president	0 0,0%	1 100,0%	1 100,0%
6 <sup>th</sup> Vice-president	0 0,0%	1 100,0%	1 100,0%
Treasurer	6 6,8%	82 93,2%	88 100,0%
Substitute treasurer	1 16,7%	5 83,3%	6 100,0%
Cooperative Member**	1 11,1%	8 88,9%	9 100,0%
Representative of the Public Administration**	1 20,0%	4 80,0%	5 100,0%
Accounter	0 0,0%	4 100,0%	4 100,0%
Elected Member of the Executive Committee	36 8,0%	414 92,0%	450 100,0%
Secretary	0 0,0%	1 100,0%	1 100,0%
Ex officio Member**	1 50,5%	1 50,0%	2 100,0%
General Secretary**	0 0,0%	1 100,0%	1 100,0%
Director Manage**	0 0,0%	3 100,0%	3 100,0%
Total	59 6,9%	794 93,1%	853 100,0%

Source: Own research

\* In grey, those posts common to (almost) all Chambers of Commerce

\*\* Although being attached to the Executive Committees, those positions are not elected

**Figure 2: Composition Executive Committees of Spanish Chambers of Commerce 2010-2011**

	Wo men	Me n	Total
President	2 2,3%	86 97,7%	88 100,0%
1 <sup>st</sup> Vice-president	2 2,3%	86 97,7%	88 100,0%
2 <sup>nd</sup> Vice-president	8 9,2%	79 90,8%	87 100,0%
3 <sup>rd</sup> Vice-president	2 10,0%	18 90,0%	20 100,0%
4 <sup>th</sup> Vice-president	0 0,0%	4 100,0%	4 100,0%
5 <sup>th</sup> Vice-president	0 0,0%	1 100,0%	1 100,0%
6 <sup>th</sup> Vice-president	0 0,0%	1 100,0%	1 100,0%
Treasurer	10 11,4%	78 88,6%	88 100,0%
Substitute treasurer	0 0,0%	2 100,0%	2 100,0%
Cooperative Member**	1 11,1%	8 88,9%	9 100,0%
Representative of the Public Administration**	0 0,0%	4 100,0%	4 100,0%
Accounter	1 20,0%	4 80,0%	5 100,0%
Elected Member of the Executive Committee	65 13,7%	411 86,3%	476 100,0%
Secretary	0 0,0%	1 100,0%	1 100,0%
Ex officio Member**	1 100,0%	0 0,0%	1 100,0%
General Secretary**	1 25,5%	3 75,0%	4 100,0%
Director Manage**	0 0,0%	1 100,0%	1 100,0%
Total	93 10,7%	778 89,3%	871 100,0%

Source: Own research.

\* In grey, those posts common to (almost) all Chambers of Commerce

\*\* Although being attached to the Executive Committees, those positions are not elected

**Figure 3. Women in Boards of Management in Companies Belonging to IBEX 35 (%) 2007-2010**

	2010	2009	2008	2007
<b>Council Total</b>	<b>10,1</b>	<b>10,3</b>	<b>8,5</b>	<b>6,4</b>
Presidents (F)	0,0	2,9	2,9	2,9
Vice-presidents (F)	8,0	7,8	7,3	3,8
Counselors (F)	11,4	11,1	9,3	7,5
Secretary counselors (F)	0,0	14,3	0,0	0,0

Source: Data collected from the National Share Market Commission.

Note: Up to 2007, corporate entities have not been tallied as charges.

Extracted

from:

[http://www.ine.es/ss/Satellite?L=es\\_ES&c=INESeccion\\_C&cid=1259925595694&p=1254735110672&pagename=ProductosYServicios%2FPYSLayout&param3=1259924822888](http://www.ine.es/ss/Satellite?L=es_ES&c=INESeccion_C&cid=1259925595694&p=1254735110672&pagename=ProductosYServicios%2FPYSLayout&param3=1259924822888)



[www.icps.cat](http://www.icps.cat)